# Table of contents

3 Editorial

Raymond Aron

5 *Etapes de la pensée sociologique, Auguste Comte*

Aida Alla

31 Contrastive analysis of the dependent subject clause in Albanian and English

Avni Islami

43 *A brief overview of locative prepositions and their role of marker*

Ibrahim Berisha

51 Personal Identity and Mass Culture

Mimoza Doko, Gazmend Abrashi

63 *Television and Screening of Literary Work for the Television*

Ervin Goci

75 *The audience measurement in Albania – Efforts to institutionalize the process*

Gëzim Shabani

95 Consumer behavior towards loan interest rates in Kosovo

Malva Govori

105 *Analysis Paper on Treatment of Trade in Services under the Kosovo-Turkey Free Trade Agreement of Services*
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Page</th>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>125</td>
<td>Bullying Among the 5th Grade Students in Primary School and Preventive Measures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>139</td>
<td>Architecture as Political Expression/ the Expression of national identity in embassy buildings; Berlin experience</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>161</td>
<td>Technical Instructions for authors</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>163</td>
<td>The Style of University of Chicago</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Editorial

The article which opens the newest edition of the Journal Thesis, published by the University Educational Institution AAB, is a translation into English from the original French work of the famous French scholar of the twentieth century, Raymond Aron. It is an interesting study of the voluminous book titled "Stages of sociological thought" on the contribution and the role of well-known 20th century sociologist and positivist, Auguste Comte. Because of the length of this study, it is published in separate editions and will end in the next issue of our Journal.

The Journal consists of two articles in the field of linguistics, "Comparative Analysis of the subject clauses in Albanian and English" by Aida Alla, and "A Brief Overview of prepositions of place and the role of the sign" by Avni Islami.

Three papers in the field of communications follow: Ibrahim Berisha’s paper "Personal Identity and mass culture" addresses the multiplicity of identities at the time of mass culture and media; "Television and the screening of a literary work" is a paper written by Mimoza Doko and Gazmend Abrashi, where the literary work converting into a product for the stage and scene is treated. And again in the field of communications, the author Ervin Goci with his paper "Measuring Audience in Albania - Efforts to institutionalize the process" treats a highly controversial problematics of the field, i.e. audience measurement of the media operators.

The journal continues with the publication of two papers from the field of economics, "Consumer behavior towards loans interest rate in Kosovo" by Gezim Shabani, while the author Malva Govori addresses the situation of Kosovo-Turkey trade exchanges, in a paper entitled "Treatment of Trade in Services under the Free Trade Agreement between Kosovo and Turkey".

In the field of psychology the paper titled "Bullying among fifth grade pupils and the preventive measures", is treated by two authors, Armend Mustafa and Gazmend Tahiraj.

Prof. Dr. Masar Stavileci,
Editor-in-Chief
AUGUSTE COMTE.

La saine politique ne saurait avoir pour objet de faire marcher l'espèce humaine qui se meut par une impulsion propre, suivant une loi aussi nécessaire, quoique plus modifiable, que celle de la gravitation, mais elle a pour but de faciliter sa marche en l'éclai-
rant.

Système de politique positive, Appendix III, Plan des travaux scientifiques nécessaires pour réor-
ganiser la société, 1828, p. 95.
Montesquieu sociologue est d'abord et avant tout conscient de la diversité humaine et sociale. Le but de la science est pour lui de mettre de l'ordre dans un chaos apparent et il y parvient en concevant des types de gouvernement ou de société, en énumérant des déterminants qui influent sur toutes les collectivités et peut-être, en dernière analyse, en dégageant quelques principes rationnels, de validité universelle, bien qu'éventuellement violés dans tel ou tel cas. Montesquieu part de la diversité et arrive, non sans peine, à l'unité humaine.

Auguste Comte au contraire est d'abord et avant tout le sociologue de l'unité humaine et sociale, de l'unité de l'histoire humaine. Il pousse cette conception de l'unité jusqu'au point où, finalement, la difficulté est inverse : il a peine à retrouver et à fonder la diversité. Puisqu'il n'y a qu'un seul type de société absolument valable, toute l'humanité devra, selon sa philosophie, aboutir à ce type de société.

Les trois étapes de la pensée de Comte.

Dès lors, il me semble que l'on peut présenter les étapes de l'évolution philosophique d'Auguste Comte comme représentant les trois manières dont est affirmée, expliquée et justifiée la thèse de l'unité humaine. Ces trois étapes sont marquées par les trois œuvres principales d'Auguste Comte.

La première, entre 1820 et 1826, est celle des Opuscules de philosophie sociale : Sommaire appréciation sur l'ensemble du passé moderne (avril 1820), Prospectus des travaux scientifiques nécessaires pour réorganiser la société (avril 1822), Considérations philosophiques sur les sciences et les savants (novembre-décembre 1825), Considérations sur le pouvoir spirituel (1825-1826). La deuxième étape est constituée par les leçons du Cours de philosophie positive (parues de 1830 à 1842), et la troisième par le Système de politique.
positive ou Traité de sociologie instituant la religion de l’humanité (paru de 1851 à 1854).

A la première étape, dans les Opuscules (républiés à la fin du tome IV du Système de politique positive par Auguste Comte qui voulait ainsi marquer l’unité de sa pensée), le jeune polytechnicien réfléchit sur la société de son temps. La plupart des sociologues ont pour point de départ une interprétation de l’époque à laquelle ils appartiennent. Auguste Comte est à cet égard exemplaire. Les Opuscules sont la description et l’interprétation du moment historique que traverse la société européenne au début du xixe siècle.

Selon Auguste Comte, un certain type de société, caractérisé par les deux adjectifs théologique et militaire, est en train de mourir. La société médiévale avait pour ciment la foi transcendante interprétée par l’Église catholique. Le mode de penser théologique était contemporain de la prédominance de l’activité militaire qui s’exprimait par le premier rang accordé aux hommes de guerre. Un autre type de société, scientifique et industrielle, est en train de naître. La société qui naît est scientifique au sens où la société qui meurt était théologique : la façon de penser, caractéristique de l’âge moderne, est celle des savants, de même que la façon de penser caractéristique des temps passés était celle des théologiens ou des prêtres. Les savants remplacent les prêtres ou les théologiens en tant que catégorie sociale qui fournit la base intellectuelle et morale de l’ordre social. Ils sont en train de recevoir en héritage des prêtres le pouvoir spirituel qui, dans les premiers Opuscules de Comte, est incarné nécessairement, à chaque époque, par ceux qui offrent le modèle de la façon de penser prédominante et les idées qui servent de principes à l’ordre social. De même que les savants sont en train de se substituer aux prêtres, les industriels au sens large du terme — c’est-à-dire les entrepreneurs, directeurs de fabriques et les banquiers — sont en train de prendre la place des hommes de guerre. À partir du moment où les hommes pensent scientifiquement, l’activité majeure des collectivités cesse d’être la guerre des hommes les uns contre les autres, mais devient la lutte des hommes avec la nature, ou encore l’exploitation rationnelle des ressources naturelles.

Dès cette époque, Auguste Comte tire de cette analyse de la société dans laquelle il vit la conclusion que la réforme sociale a pour condition fondamentale une réforme intellectuelle. Les hasards d’une révolution ou la violence ne permettent pas la réorganisation de la société en crise. Il faut pour cela une synthèse des sciences et la création d’une politique positive.

Auguste Comte, comme beaucoup de ses contemporains, tient que la société moderne est en crise, et il trouve l’explication des
troubles sociaux dans la contradiction entre un ordre social théologique et militaire en train de disparaître et un ordre social scientifique et industriel en train de naître.

Cette interprétation de la crise contemporaine a pour conséquence qu'Auguste Comte, réformateur, n'est pas un doctrinaire de la révolution à la façon de Marx et n'est pas non plus un doctrinaire des institutions libres, à la manière de Montesquieu ou de Tocqueville. Il est un doctrinaire de la science positive et de la science sociale.

L'orientation générale de la pensée et surtout des plans de transformation de Comte découle de cette interprétation de la société contemporaine. De même que Montesquieu observait la crise de la monarchie française et que cette observation était l'une des origines de sa conception d'ensemble, Auguste Comte observe la contradiction de deux types sociaux qui, pense-t-il, ne peut être résolue que par le triomphe du type social qu'il appelle scientifique et industriel. Cette victoire est inévitable, mais elle peut être plus ou moins retardée ou accélérée. La sociologie a en effet pour fonction de comprendre le devenir nécessaire, c'est-à-dire tout à la fois indispensable et inévitable, de l'histoire, de manière à aider à l'accomplissement de l'ordre fondamental.

Dans la deuxième étape, celle du Cours de philosophie positive, les idées directrices n'ont pas changé, mais la perspective est élargie. Dans les Opuscules, Auguste Comte considère essentiellement les sociétés contemporaines et leur passé, c'est-à-dire l'histoire de l'Europe. Il serait facile pour un non-Européen de faire observer que, dans ses premiers Opuscules, Auguste Comte a la naïveté de penser l'histoire de l'Europe comme absorbant en elle l'histoire du genre humain, ou encore, présuppose le caractère exemplaire de l'histoire européenne, admettant que l'ordre social vers lequel tend la société européenne sera l'ordre social de l'espèce humaine tout entière. Au cours de la deuxième étape, c'est-à-dire dans le Cours de philosophie positive, Auguste Comte ne renouvelle pas ces thèmes mais il les approfondit, et il exécute le programme dont il avait fixé les grandes lignes dans ses ouvrages de jeunesse.

Il passe en revue les diverses sciences, et il développe et confirme les deux lois essentielles, qu'il avait d'ailleurs déjà exposées dans les Opuscules : la loi des trois états et la classification des sciences. Selon la loi des trois états, l'esprit humain serait passé par trois phases successives. Dans la première, l'esprit humain explique les phénomènes en les attribuant à des êtres ou à des forces comparables à l'homme lui-même. Dans la deuxième, il invoque des entités abstraites, comme la nature. Dans la troisième, l'homme se borne à observer les phénomènes et à fixer les liaisons régulières.
qui peuvent exister entre eux, soit à un moment donné, soit dans le temps. Il renonce à découvrir les causes des faits et se contente d'établir les lois qui les commandent.

Le passage de l'âge théologique à l'âge métaphysique, puis à l'âge positif ne s'opère pas simultanément pour les diverses disciplines intellectuelles. La loi des trois états, dans la pensée d'Auguste Comte, n'a de sens rigoureux que combinée avec la classification des sciences. L'ordre dans lequel sont rangées les diverses sciences nous révèle l'ordre dans lequel l'intelligence devient positive dans les divers domaines.

Aucunement dit, la façon de penser positive s'est imposée plus tôt en mathématiques, en physique, en chimie qu'en biologie. Il est d'ailleurs normal que le positivisme apparaisse plus tardivement dans les disciplines s'appliquant aux matières les plus complexes. Plus la matière est simple, plus il est facile de penser positivement. Il y a même certains phénomènes où l'observation s'impose d'elle-même, de telle sorte que, dans ces cas, l'intelligence a été immédiatement positive.

La combinaison de la loi des trois états et de la classification des sciences a pour fin de prouver que la façon de penser qui a triomphé en mathématiques, en astronomie, en physique, en chimie et en biologie doit s'imposer finalement en matière de politique et aboutir à la constitution d'une science positive de la société, la sociologie.

Mais elle n'a pas seulement pour objet de démontrer la nécessité de créer la sociologie. À partir d'une certaine science, la biologie, intervient un renversement décisif en fait de méthodologie : les sciences ne sont plus des sciences analytiques mais nécessairement, essentiellement, des sciences synthétiques. Ce renversement va donner un fondement à la conception sociologique de l'unité historique.

Ces deux termes, analytique et synthétique, ont, dans le langage d'Auguste Comte, des significations multiples. Dans cet exemple précis, les sciences de la nature inorganique, physique et chimie, sont analytiques en ce sens qu'elles établissent des lois entre des phénomènes isolés, et isolés nécessairement et légitimement. En revanche, en biologie, il est impossible d'expliquer un organe ou une fonction si l'on ne considère pas l'être vivant tout entier. C'est par rapport à l'organisme entier qu'un fait biologique particulier prend sa signification et trouve son explication. Si l'on voulait découper arbitrairement et artificiellement un élément d'un être vivant, on n'aurait plus en face de soi que de la matière morte. La matière vivante est, en tant que telle, globale ou totale.

Cette idée du primat du tout sur l'élément doit être transposée
en sociologie. Il est impossible de comprendre l’état d’un phénomène social particulier si on ne le replace pas dans le tout social. On ne comprend pas la situation de la religion, ou la forme précise que revêt l’État dans une société particulière, si l’on ne considère pas le tout de cette société. Mais cette priorité du tout sur l’élément ne vaut pas seulement pour un moment artificiellement découpé du devenir historique. On ne comprend l’état de la société française du début du XIXe siècle que si l’on replace ce moment historique dans la continuité du devenir français. La Restauration ne se comprend que par la Révolution, et la Révolution par les siècles de régime monarchique. Le déclin de l’esprit théologique et militaire ne s’explique que si l’on en retrouve l’origine dans les siècles écoulés. De même qu’on ne comprend un élément du tout social qu’en considérant ce tout lui-même, de même on ne comprend un moment de l’évolution historique que si l’on considère le tout de l’évolution historique.

Mais en continuant à penser dans cette ligne, on se heurte à une difficulté évidente. C’est que, pour comprendre un moment de l’évolution de la nation française, il faudra se référer à la totalité de l’histoire de l’espèce humaine. La logique du principe de la priorité du tout sur l’élément aboutit à poser l’idée que ce qui est premier, ce qui est l’objet véritable de la sociologie, c’est l’histoire de l’espèce humaine.

Auguste Comte était un homme logique, formé aux disciplines de l’École polytechnique. Puisqu’il avait posé la priorité de la synthèse sur l’analyse, il devait conclure que la science sociale qu’il voulait fonder avait pour objet l’histoire de l’espèce humaine; cette histoire étant considérée comme une, ce qui était indispensable pour comprendre soit des fonctions particulières du tout social, soit un moment particulier du devenir.

Dans le Cours de philosophie positive se trouve fondée la science nouvelle, la sociologie qui, admettant la priorité du tout sur l’élément et de la synthèse sur l’analyse, a pour objet l’histoire de l’espèce humaine.

On voit ici l’infériorité ou la supériorité — à mon sens l’infériorité — d’Auguste Comte sur Montesquieu. Alors que Montesquieu part du fait, qui est la diversité, Auguste Comte, avec cette intemperance dans la logique qui est caractéristique des grands hommes et de quelques moins grands, part de l’unité de l’espèce humaine et donne à la sociologie pour objet d’étude l’histoire de l’espèce humaine.

Il convient d’ajouter qu’Auguste Comte, considérant que la sociologie est une science à la manière des sciences précédentes, n’hésite pas à reprendre la formule qu’il avait déjà employée dans les Opuscules : de même qu’il n’y a pas de liberté de conscience
en mathématiques ou en astronomie, il ne peut pas y en avoir davantage en matière de sociologie. Puisque les savants imposent leur verdict aux ignorants et aux amateurs en fait de mathématiques et d’astronomie, ils doivent logiquement imposer leur verdict de même façon en matière de sociologie et de politique. Ce qui, évidemment, présuppose que la sociologie puisse déterminer tout à la fois ce qui est, ce qui sera et ce qui doit être. La sociologie synthétique d’Auguste Comte suggère d’ailleurs une compétence de cet ordre. Science du tout historique, elle détermine en effet non pas seulement ce qui a été et ce qui est, mais ce qui sera, au sens de la nécessité du déterminisme. Ce qui sera se trouve justifié comme étant conforme à ce que les philosophes du passé auraient appelé la nature humaine, conforme à ce qu’Auguste Comte appelle simplement la réalisation de l’ordre humain et social. À la troisième étape de sa pensée, il en vient à justifier par une théorie tout à la fois de la nature humaine et de la nature sociale cette unité de l’histoire humaine.

Le Système de politique positive est postérieur à l’aventure de son auteur avec Clotilde de Vaux. Le style et le langage se sont quelque peu transformés par rapport au Cours de philosophie positive. Mais il n’en reste pas moins que le Système de politique positive correspond à une tendance de la pensée comtiste visible déjà dans la première et surtout dans la deuxième étape.

En effet si, comme je le pense, on peut expliquer l’itinéraire d’Auguste Comte par la volonté de justifier l’idée de l’unité de l’histoire humaine, il est normal que, dans son dernier livre, il ait donné un fondement philosophique à cette notion. Pour que l’histoire humaine soit une, il faut que l’homme ait, à travers toutes les sociétés, à travers toutes les époques, une certaine nature reconnaissable et définissable. Il faut, en deuxième lieu, que toute société comporte un ordre essentiel que l’on puisse reconnaître à travers la diversité des organisations sociales. Il faut enfin que cette nature humaine et cette nature sociale soient telles que les caractéristiques majeures du devenir historique puissent s’en déduire. Or, à mon sens, on peut expliquer l’essentiel du Système de politique positive par ces trois idées.

La théorie de la nature humaine se trouve incluse dans ce qu’Auguste Comte appelle le tableau cérébral, ensemble de conceptions relatives aux localisations cérébrales. Mais, abstraction faite de telle ou telle bizarrerie, ce tableau cérébral équivaut à préciser les différentes activités caractéristiques de l’homme en tant qu’homme. L’ordre social fondamental que l’on peut reconnaître à travers la diversité des institutions est décrit et analysé dans le tome II, qui a pour objet La Statique sociale. Enfin le
tableau cérébral et la statique sociale servent de fondement au tome III du *Système de politique positive* consacré à la dynamique. L’histoire tout entière tend à la réalisation de l’ordre fondateur de toute société, analysé dans le tome II, et à l’accomplissement de ce qu’il y a de meilleur dans la nature humaine, décrite dans le tableau cérébral du tome I.

Le point de départ de la pensée d’Auguste Comte est donc une réflexion sur la contradiction interne à la société de son temps, entre le type théologique et militaire et le type scientifique et industriel. Comme ce moment historique est caractérisé par la généralisation de la pensée scientifique et de l’activité industrielle, le seul moyen de mettre fin à la crise est d’accélérer le devenir en créant le système d'idées scientifiques qui présidera à l'ordre social, comme le système d'idées théologiques a présidé à l'ordre social du passé.

De là Comte passe au *Cours de philosophie positive*, c'est-à-dire à la synthèse de l'ensemble de l'œuvre scientifique de l'humanité, afin de dégager les méthodes qui ont été appliquées dans les diverses disciplines et les résultats essentiels obtenus dans chacune d'elles. Cette synthèse des méthodes et des résultats doit servir de base à la création de la science qui fait encore défaut, la sociologie.

Mais la sociologie que Comte veut créer n'est pas la sociologie prudente, modeste, analytique, de Montesquieu, qui s'efforce de multiplier les explications pour rendre compte de l'extrême diversité des institutions humaines. Elle a pour fonction de résoudre la crise du monde moderne, c'est-à-dire de fournir le système d'idées scientifiques qui présidera à la réorganisation sociale.

Or, pour qu'une science puisse remplir un tel rôle, il faut qu'elle donne des résultats soustrait au doute et apporte des vérités aussi incontestables que les mathématiques et l'astronomie. Il faut aussi que la nature de ces vérités soit d'un certain type. La sociologie analytique de Montesquieu suggère, ici ou là, telle et telle réforme; elle donne des conseils au législateur. Mais, partant de l'idée que les institutions de n'importe quelle société sont conditionnées par une multiplicité de facteurs, elle ne permet pas d'imaginer une réalité institutionnelle foncièrement différente de celle qui existe. Auguste Comte, lui, veut être à la fois un savant et un réformateur. Quelle est donc la science qui puisse être à la fois certaine dans ses affirmations et impérative pour un réformateur? Incontestablement, ce serait une science synthétique telle que la conçoit Auguste Comte, science qui partirait des lois les plus générales, des lois fondamentales de l'évolution humaine, et découvriraient un déterminisme global que les hommes pour-
naitre. Mais en quoi consiste cette originalité de l’industrie moderne?

Il mesemble que les traits caractéristiques de l’industrie, tels que les observent les hommes du début du xixe siècle, sont au nombre de six :

1° L’industrie est fondée sur l’organisation scientifique du travail. Au lieu d’être organisée selon la coutume, la production est agencée en vue du rendement maximum.

2° Grâce à l’application de la science à l’organisation du travail, l’humanité développe prodigieusement ses ressources.

3° La production industrielle implique des concentrations d’ouvriers dans les fabriques et dans les faubourgs; un phénomène social nouveau apparaît : l’existence de masses ouvrières.

4° Ces concentrations ouvrières sur le lieu du travail déterminent une opposition, latente ou bien ouverte, entre les employés et les employeurs, entre les prolétaires et les entrepreneurs ou capitalistes.

5° Alors que la richesse, grâce au caractère scientifique du travail, ne cesse d’augmenter, des crises de surproduction se multiplient, qui ont pour conséquence de créer la pauvreté au milieu de l’abondance. Au scandale de l’esprit, alors que tant de millions d’hommes souffrent de la pauvreté, des marchandises ne parviennent pas à être vendues.

6° Le système économique lié à l’organisation industrielle et scientifique du travail est caractérisé par la liberté des échanges et par la recherche du profit de la part des entrepreneurs et des commerçants. Certains théoriciens en concluent que la condition essentielle du développement des richesses est précisément la recherche du profit et la concurrence, et que moins l’État se mêlera des affaires économiques, plus la production et les richesses augmenteront rapidement.

Les interprétations diffèrent selon la part faite à chacun de ces caractères. Auguste Comte, lui, retient comme décisifs les trois premiers. L’industrie est définie par l’organisation scientifique du travail, d’où résulte l’augmentation constante des richesses et la concentration des ouvriers dans les fabriques; cette dernière est d’ailleurs la contrepartie de la concentration des capitaux ou des moyens de production entre un petit nombre de mains.

Le quatrième caractère, l’opposition entre les ouvriers et les entrepreneurs, est pour lui secondaire 4. Il résulte d’une mauvaise organisation de la société industrielle et peut être corrigé par des réformes. De même, les crises sont, à ses yeux, des phénomènes épisodiques et superficiels. Quant au libéralisme, il y voit non pas l’essence de la société nouvelle, mais un élément patho-
logique, un moment de crise dans le développement d'une organisation qui sera autrement stable que celle fondée sur le libre jeu de la concurrence.

Naturellement, selon les socialistes, les deux caractères décisifs sont le quatrième et le cinquième. La pensée socialiste, comme celle des économistes pessimistes de la première moitié du xixe siècle, se développe à partir de la constatation du conflit prolétaires-entrepreneurs, et de la fréquence des crises considérées comme suite inévitable de l'anarchie capitaliste. C'est à partir de ces deux caractères que Marx édifie sa théorie du capitalisme et son interprétation historique.

Quant au sixième caractère, la liberté des échanges, c'est celui que les théoriciens libéraux mettent en relief et qu'ils tiennent pour la cause décisive du progrès économique.

Au début du xixe siècle, tout le monde constatait simultanément l'accroissement des richesses, l'application de la science à l'industrie et un régime libéral des échanges. Les interprétations variaient selon la responsabilité attribuée à chacun de ces deux derniers phénomènes dans le développement du premier.

Auguste Comte définit sa propre théorie de la société industrielle par les critiques qu'il oppose, soit aux économistes libéraux, soit aux socialistes. Il donne de la société industrielle une version qui n'est ni libérale, ni socialiste, mais qui pourrait être définie comme la théorie de l'organisation, si ce mot n'avait été utilisé pour la traduction française du livre de Burnham, The Managerial Revolution, car les organisateurs d'Auguste Comte sont assez différents des organisateurs ou « managers » de Burnham.

Auguste Comte reproche aux économistes libéraux qui s'interrogent sur la valeur et s'efforcent de déterminer dans l'abstrait le fonctionnement du système, d'être des métagraphiens. La pensée métaphysique, selon lui, est une pensée abstraite, une pensée par concepts, et telle est, à ses yeux, la pensée des économistes de son temps.

Ces métaphysiciens commettent d'autre part l'erreur de considérer les phénomènes économiques en les séparant du tout social. L'économie politique commence par un isolement illégitime d'un secteur du tout, qui ne peut être compris rigoureusement qu'à l'intérieur de ce tout.

Ces deux critiques ont été reprises par la plupart des sociologues français de l'école durkhiemienne et ont déterminé l'attitude de semi-hostilité de ceux que l'on appelle sociologues à l'égard de ceux que l'on appelle économistes, au moins dans les universités françaises.

Enfin, Auguste Comte reproche aux libéraux de surestimer l'efficacité des mécanismes d'échange ou de compétition dans le développement des richesses.
Les économistes ont cependant le mérite d’affirmer qu’à la longue les intérêts privés s’accordent. Si l’opposition essentielle entre les libéraux et les socialistes tient à ce que les premiers croient à l’accord final des intérêts et que les seconds croient au caractère fondamental de la lutte des classes, Auguste Comte, sur ce point essentiel, est du côté des libéraux. Il ne croit pas qu’il y ait une opposition essentielle d’intérêts entre prolétaires et entrepreneurs. Il peut y avoir, temporairement et secondairement, des rivalités pour la répartition des richesses. Mais, comme les économistes libéraux, Auguste Comte pense que le développement de la production est, par définition, conforme aux intérêts de tous. La loi de la société industrielle est le développement des richesses, qui postule ou implique l’accord final des intérêts.

Par rapport aux économistes, qui tiennent la liberté et la concurrence pour les causes essentielles de la croissance, le fondateur du positivisme appartient à l’école de ceux que j’appellerais les polytechniciens organisateurs.


Ce polytechnicien organisateur est hostile au socialisme, ou plus exactement à ceux qu’il appelle les communistes, c’est-à-dire les doctrinaires ou théoriciens de son temps, hostiles à la propriété privée. Il est un organisateur qui croit aux vertus, non pas tant de la concurrence, que de la propriété privée, et même, plus curieusement, qui croit aux vertus de la propriété privée des richesses concentrées.

Auguste Comte justifie en effet la concentration des capitaux et des moyens de production qui ne lui paraît pas contradictoire avec la propriété privée. Elle est tout d’abord inévitable, affirme-t-il, c’est-à-dire qu’elle est, selon cet optimisme providentiel si caractéristique de sa philosophie de l’histoire, également bienfaisante. Elle est conforme à la tendance fondamentale que l’on observe dans le cours de l’histoire humaine. La civilisation matérielle ne peut croître que si chaque génération produit plus que ce qui lui est nécessaire à elle-même pour vivre et par suite transmet à la génération suivante un stock de richesses plus élevé que celui qu’elle a reçu. La capitalisation des moyens de
production est caractéristique du développement de la civilisation matérielle et entraîne la concentration.

Auguste Comte n’est pas sensible à l’argument selon lequel l’importance des capitaux concentrés devrait entraîner le caractère public de la propriété. Il ne conclut pas de la concentration des moyens de production à une nationalisation nécessaire. Bien au contraire, il est assez indifférent à l’opposition entre propriété privée et propriété publique, parce qu’il considère que l’autorité, qu’elle soit économique ou politique, est toujours personnelle. Dans toute société, ce sont des hommes, en petit nombre, qui commandent. Un des motifs, conscient ou inconscient, de la revendication d’une propriété publique, c’est la croyance, bien ou mal fondée, que la substitution d’un régime de propriété à un autre modifierait la structure du commandement social. Auguste Comte est sceptique sur ce point. Ce sont toujours les riches qui détiennent la part de puissance qui ne peut pas ne pas accompagner la fortune et qui est inévitable dans tout ordre social. Partout, il y a des hommes qui commandent; et il est bon que ce soient les hommes qui détiennent ces capitaux concentrés, qui exercent l’autorité économique et sociale indispensable.

Mais cette propriété personnelle doit être vidée de son caractère arbitrairement personnel, puisque ceux qu’il appelle les patri- ciens, les chefs temporels, les industriels, les banquiers, doivent concevoir leur rôle comme une fonction sociale. La propriété privée est nécessaire, inévitable et indispensable; mais elle n’est tolérable que lorsqu’elle est conçue, non plus comme le droit d’user et d’abuser, mais comme l’exercice d’une fonction collective, par les quelques-uns que le sort ou le mérite a désignés 8.

Auguste Comte prend donc une position intermédiaire entre le libéralisme et le socialisme. Il n’est pas un doctrinaire de la propriété privée, conçue à la manière du droit romain. Il n’est pas un réformateur tendant à la socialisation des moyens de production. Il est un organisateur qui veut tout à la fois maintenir la propriété privée et en transformer la signification en la ramenant à l’exercice par quelques individus d’une fonction sociale. Cette conception n’est pas loin de certaines doctrines du catholicisme social.

Au-delà de cette théorie de la propriété privée, Auguste Comte ajoute une autre idée qui prend de l’importance surtout dans ses derniers livres, le *Système de politique positive*, l’idée du caractère secondaire de la hiérarchie temporelle.

Le doctrinaire du positivisme est d’autant plus enclin à accepter la concentration des richesses et l’autorité des industriels que l’existence des hommes n’est pas définie exclusivement par la place qu’ils
occupent dans la hiérarchie économique et sociale. En dehors de l'ordre temporel que commande la loi de puissance, il y a un ordre spirituel, qui est celui des mérites moraux. L'ouvrier qui se trouve au bas de la hiérarchie temporelle peut être dans la hiérarchie spirituelle à un rang supérieur, si ses mérites et son dévouement à la collectivité l'emportent sur ceux de ses chefs hiérarchiques.

Cet ordre spirituel n'est pas un ordre transcendant tel que la religion chrétienne a pu le concevoir. Ce n'est pas l'ordre de la vie éternelle. C'est un ordre d'ici-bas, mais qui substitue à la hiérarchie temporelle de la puissance et de la richesse un ordre spirituel des mérites moraux. Chacun doit avoir pour objectif suprême d'être le premier non pas dans l'ordre du pouvoir, mais dans l'ordre des mérites.

Auguste Comte limite ses ambitions de réforme économique parce que la société industrielle ne peut exister de manière stable qu'à la condition d'être réglée, modérée et transfigurée par un pouvoir spirituel. Et c'est dans la mesure où son intention réformatrice est centrée sur la création du pouvoir spirituel qu'il paraît modéré en tant que réformateur de l'économie.

Cette interprétation de la société industrielle a joué un rôle à peu près nul dans le développement des doctrines économiques et sociales, tout au moins en Europe. La conception comtiste de la société industrielle est restée une sorte de curiosité, en marge de la rivalité des doctrines. Aucun des partis politiques, ni à droite ni à gauche, ne s'y est vraiment reconnu, mises à part quelques individualités, dont les unes, d'ailleurs, venaient de l'extrême-droite et les autres de la gauche.

Parmi les auteurs français de ce siècle, deux se sont pourtant réclamés d'Auguste Comte. L'un était Charles Maurras, le théoricien de la monarchie, et l'autre était Alain, le théoricien du radicalisme. L'un et l'autre se déclaraient positivistes, pour des raisons différentes. Maurras était positiviste parce qu'il voyait en Auguste Comte le doctrinaire de l'organisation, de l'autorité et d'un pouvoir spirituel renouvelé. Alain était positiviste parce qu'il interprétait Auguste Comte à la lumière de Kant et que selon lui l'idée essentielle du positivisme était de dévaloriser la hiérarchie temporelle. « Qu'on nomme roi le meilleur marmitou, mais qu'il n'essaie pas de nous faire baisser la casserole. »

Et il y a chez Auguste Comte ces deux aspects : l'acceptation d'un ordre temporel, autoritaire et hiérarchique, et la superposition à la hiérarchie temporelle d'un ordre spirituel. Auguste Comte n'acceptait la philosophie de Hobbes dans l'ordre temporel, c'est-à-dire la philosophie de la puissance, que pour y ajouter la philosophie de Kant. Seul est respectable l'esprit, seule est res-
pectable la valeur morale. Comme écrivait Alain : « L’ordre n’est jamais vénérable. »

Pourquoi la conception d’Auguste Comte est-elle restée en dehors du grand courant de la philosophie de la société moderne? La question mérite d’être posée. En un certain sens, la doctrine d’Auguste Comte est aujourd’hui plus proche des doctrines à la mode que beaucoup d’autres doctrines du xixe siècle. Toutes les théories qui actuellement mettent l’accent sur la similitude d’un grand nombre d’institutions, d’un côté et de l’autre du rideau de fer, dévalorisent l’importance des mécanismes de la concurrence et tendent à dégager les traits fondamentaux de la civilisation industrielle, pourraient en effet se réclamer d’Auguste Comte. Il est le théoricien de la société industrielle, en déçà ou en marge des querelles entre libéraux et socialistes, entre doctrinaires du marché et apologistes du plan.

Les thèmes comtistes fondamentaux du travail libre, de l’application de la science à l’industrie et de la prédominance de l’organisation, sont assez caractéristiques de la conception actuelle de la société industrielle. Pourquoi Auguste Comte est-il oublié ou méconnu?

Une première raison est que si les idées majeures du positivisme sont profondes, la description détaillée qu’il donne de la société industrielle, notamment dans le Système de politique positive prête souvent à l’ironie facile. Comte a voulu expliquer en détail comment serait organisée la hiérarchie temporelle, quelle serait la place exacte des chefs temporels, industriels et banquiers. Il a voulu montrer pourquoi ceux qui exercent les fonctions les plus générales auraient le plus d’autorité et seraient situés le plus haut dans la hiérarchie. Il a voulu préciser le nombre d’hommes de chaque cité, le nombre de patriciens. Il a voulu expliquer comment seraient transmises les richesses. En un mot, il a fait un plan précis de ses rêves, ou des rêves auxquels chacun de nous peut s’abandonner dans les moments où il se prend pour Dieu.


Selon Auguste Comte, la minorité occidentale, qui, par bonne
chance, était en tête du mouvement de l'humanité, ne devait pas conquérir les peuples d'autres races pour leur imposer sa civilisation. Il avait expliqué, avec d'excellents arguments, je veux dire avec des arguments qui lui paraissaient excellents, et qui nous paraissent excellents grâce à la sagesse que nous avons donnée les événements, que les Occidentaux ne devaient pas conquérir l'Afrique et l'Asie, et que s'ils commettaient l'erreur de répandre leur civilisation à la pointe des bâtonnettes, des malheurs en résulterait à la fois pour eux et pour les autres. S'il a eu raison, c'est à force d'avoir tort. Les événements, pendant un siècle, n'ont pas été conformes à ce qu'ilannonçait.

Auguste Comte s'était fait le prophète de la paix parce qu'il jugeait que la guerre n'avait plus de fonction dans la société industrielle. La guerre avait été nécessaire pour contraindre au travail régulier des hommes naturellement paresseux et anarchiques, pour créer des États étendus, pour que surgisse l'unité de l'Empire romain, dans laquelle se répandrait le christianisme et dont sortirait finalement le positivisme. La guerre avait rempli une double fonction historique : l'apprentissage du travail et la formation de grands États. Mais, au xixe siècle, elle n'avait plus de rôle à jouer. Les sociétés étaient désormais définies par le primat du travail et des valeurs du travail. Il n'y avait plus de classe militaire, plus de motif de combattre.

Les conquêtes avaient pu être dans le passé un moyen légitime ou tout au moins rationnel pour ceux qui en bénéficiaient, d'accroître leurs ressources. Au siècle où la richesse dépend de l'organisation scientifique du travail, le butin est dénué de signification et anachronique. La transmission des biens se fait désormais par le don et l'échange, et, selon Auguste Comte, le don doit jouer un rôle de plus en plus grand, réduire même dans une certaine mesure celui de l'échange.

Enfin la philosophie d'Auguste Comte n'était pas centrée sur l'interprétation de la société industrielle. Elle tendait surtout à la réforme de l'organisation temporelle par le pouvoir spirituel qui doit être le fait des savants et des philosophes, remplaçant les prêtres. Le pouvoir spirituel doit régler les sentiments des hommes, les unir en vue d'un travail commun, consacrer les droits de ceux qui gouvernent, modérer l'arbitraire ou l'égoïsme des puissants. La société rêvée par le positivisme n'est pas tant définie par le double refus du libéralisme et du socialisme que par la création d'un pouvoir spirituel qui serait, à l'âge positif, ce qu'étaient les prêtres et les églises aux âges théologiques du passé.

Or, c'est là que probablement l'histoire a le plus déçu les disciples d'Auguste Comte. Même si l'organisation temporelle de la
société industrielle ressemble à ce qu’imaginait Auguste Comte, le pouvoir spirituel des philosophes et des savants n’est pas encore né. Ce qu’il y a de pouvoir spirituel est exercé, soit par les Églises du passé, soit par des idéologues que lui-même n’aurait pas reconnus comme des vrais savants ou des vrais philosophes.

Dans la mesure où des hommes qui prétendent être des interprètes scientifiques de l’ordre social exercent un pouvoir spirituel, par exemple en Union soviétique, ils mettent l’accent, non pas sur les traits communs à toutes les sociétés industrielles, mais sur une doctrine particulière de l’organisation des sociétés industrielles. Ni d’un côté ni de l’autre, on ne prend pour patron celui qui a dévalorisé les conflits idéologiques dont ont vécu les sociétés européennes et dont tant de millions de gens sont morts.

Auguste Comte aurait voulu un pouvoir spirituel exercé par des interprètes de l’organisation sociale, qui auraient en même temps rabaisssé l’importance morale de la hiérarchie temporelle. Ce genre de pouvoir spirituel n’a pas existé et n’existe pas. Probablement les hommes préfèrent-ils toujours ce qui les divise à ce qui les unit. Probablement chaque société est-elle obligée d’insister sur ce qu’elle a de particulier, et non pas sur les traits qu’elle partage avec toutes les sociétés. Probablement aussi les sociétés ne sont-elles pas encore assez convaincues des vertus qu’Auguste Comte reconnaissait à la société industrielle.

Il pensait en effet que l’organisation scientifique de la société industrielle aboutirait à donner à chacun une place proportionnée à ses capacités et réaliserait ainsi la justice sociale. Il y avait beaucoup d’optimisme dans cette vue. Dans le passé, l’âge ou la naissance avaient donné aux hommes la première place, dorénavant, dans la société du travail, c’était l’aptitude qui de plus en plus déterminerait la place de chacun.

Un sociologue anglais, Michael Young, a consacré un livre satirique à un régime appelé méritocratie, c’est-à-dire en fait à l’idée qu’Auguste Comte se faisait, avec un enthousiasme anticipé, de ce que serait l’ordre de la société industrielle 17. Cet auteur ne cite pas Auguste Comte, et celui-ci n’aurait pas retrouvé ses espoirs dans la description d’un tel ordre. Michael Young montre en effet avec humour que si chacun a une place proportionnée à ses capacités, ceux qui occupent les places inférieures sont acculés au désespoir, car ils ne peuvent plus accuser le sort ou l’injustice. Si tous les hommes sont convaincus que l’ordre social est juste, celui-ci est d’une certaine façon et pour certains insupportable; à moins que les hommes ne soient convaincus simultanément par l’enseignement d’Auguste Comte, que la hiérarchie des qualités intellectuelles n’est rien à côté de la seule hiérarchie qui compte, celle des mérites et
du cœur. Mais il n’est pas facile de convaincre l’humanité que l’ordre temporel est secondaire.

La sociologie, science de l’humanité.

Auguste Comte a exposé sa conception de la science nouvelle appelée sociologie dans les trois derniers volumes du Cours de philosophie positive et plus particulièrement au tome IV.

Il se réclame de trois auteurs qu’il présente lui-même comme ses inspirateurs ou ses prédécesseurs, Montesquieu, Condorcet et Bossuet, sans compter Aristote dont je parlerai plus loin. Ces trois noms introduisent à quelques-uns des thèmes fondamentaux de sa pensée sociologique.


En revanche, il manquerait à Montesquieu, pour avoir été le fondateur de la sociologie, l’idée du progrès. Auguste Comte découvre celle-ci chez Condorcet, dans la célèbre Ésquisse d’un tableau historique des progrès de l’esprit humain qui prétend découvrir dans le passé un certain nombre de phases par lesquelles a passé l’esprit humain. Ces phases sont en nombre défini et leur ordre de succession est nécessaire. Auguste Comte reprend à Condorcet l’idée que le progrès de l’esprit humain est le fondement du devenir des sociétés humaines.

En combinant le thème de Montesquieu, du déterminisme, et le thème de Condorcet, des étapes nécessaires, selon un ordre inélectable, des progrès de l’esprit humain, on obtient la conception centrale d’Auguste Comte : les phénomènes sociaux sont soumis à un déterminisme rigoureux, qui se présente sous la forme d’un devenir inévitable des sociétés humaines, commandé par les progrès de l’esprit humain.

Cette façon de penser le devenir historique aboutit à une vision de l’histoire, tout entière unifiée, en marche vers un état dernier de l’esprit humain et des sociétés humaines très comparable en définitive au providentialisme de Bossuet qu’Auguste Comte salue comme la tentative la plus éminente qui a précédé la sienne.
«C’est certainement à notre grand Bossuet qu’il faudra toujours rapporter la première tentative importante de l’esprit humain pour contempler, d’un point de vue suffisamment élevé, l’ensemble du passé social. Sans doute, les ressources, faciles mais illusoires, qui appartiennent à toute philosophie théologique, pour établir, entre les événements humains, une certaine liaison appa- rente, ne permettent nullement d’utiliser aujourd’hui, dans la construction directe de la véritable science du développement social, des explications inévitablement caractérisées par la pré- pondérance, alors trop irrésistible en ce genre, d’une telle philo- sophie. Mais cette admirable composition, où l’esprit d’universalité, indispensable à toute conception semblable, est si vigoureusement apprécié et même maintenu autant que le permettait la nature de la méthode employée, n’en demeurera pas moins, à jamais, un imposant modèle, toujours éminemment propre à marquer nettement le but général que doit se proposer sans cesse notre intelligence, en résultat final de toutes nos analyses histo- riques, c’est-à-dire la coordination rationnelle de la série fonda- mentale des divers événements humains, d’après un dessein unique, à la fois plus réel et plus étendu que celui conçu par Bos- suet. » (Cours de philosophie positive, t. IV, p. 147.)


On voit ainsi comment celui que l’on donne comme le fondateur de la science positive peut être aussi présenté comme le dernier disciple du providentialisme chrétien; comment peut s’opérer le passage entre l’interprétation de l’histoire par la providence et l’interprétation par les lois générales. Qu’il s’agisse des intentions de la providence ou des lois nécessaires du devenir humain, l’his- toire est conçue comme nécessaire et une. Le dessein est unique puisqu’il a été fixé soit par Dieu, soit par la nature de l’homme; l’évolution est nécessaire, puisque, ou la providence en a fixé les étapes et la fin, ou la nature même de l’homme et des sociétés en a déterminé les lois.

Ainsi la pensée d’Auguste Comte, même dans le Cours de philo- sophie positive, où elle se présente sous la forme la plus scienti- fique, passe aisément d’une certaine conception de la science à une version nouvelle de la providence.

Le dessein unique de l’histoire pensée par Auguste Comte est le
progrès de l’esprit humain. Si celui-ci donne de l’unité à l’ensemble du passé social, c’est que la même façon de penser doit s’imposer dans tous les domaines.

Auguste Comte, on le sait, constate que la méthode positive est aujourd’hui de rigueur dans les sciences, et il en conclut que cette méthode fondée sur l’observation, l’expérimentation et l’établissement de lois, doit s’étendre aux domaines qui sont aujourd’hui encore livrés à la théologie ou à la métaphysique, c’est-à-dire à l’explication soit par des êtres transcendants soit par des entités ou des causes dernières des phénomènes. Il existe une façon de penser, dite positive, qui a une validité universelle, aussi bien en politique qu’en astronomie 19.

À suivre...
1. Auguste Comte a conçu la loi des trois états en février ou mars 1822 et l’a exposé pour la première fois dans le Prospectus des travaux scientifiques nécessaires pour réorganiser la Société, publié en avril 1822 dans un volume de Saint-Simon ayant pour titre Suite des travaux ayant pour objet de fonder le système industriel. Cet ouvrage, que Comte appellerà, dans la préface du Système de politique positive, l’Opuscule fondamental et qui est parfois cité sous le titre de Premier système de politique positive, du nom de l’édition de 1824, sera réédité dans le tome IV du Système de politique positive sous le titre Plan des travaux scientifiques nécessaires pour réorganiser la Société.

La loi des trois états est l’objet de la première leçon du Cours de philosophie positive (5e édition, t. I, p. 2-8), la classification des sciences celui de la deuxième leçon du même Cours (t. I, p. 32-63).


2. « En étudiant le développement total de l’intelligence humaine dans ses diverses sphères d’activité, depuis son premier essor le plus simple jusqu’à nos jours, je crois avoir découvert une grande loi fondamentale, à laquelle il est assujetti par une nécessité invariable, et qui me semble pouvoir être solidement établie, soit sur les preuves rationnelles fournies par la connaissance de notre organisation, soit sur les vérifications historiques résultant d’un examen attentif du passé. Cette loi consiste en ce que chacune de nos conceptions principales, chaque branche de nos connaissances, passe successivement par trois états théoriques différents : l’état théologique, ou fictif ; l’état métaphysique, ou abstrait ; l’état scientifique, ou positif. En d’autres termes, l’esprit humain, par sa nature, emprunte successivement dans chacune de ses recherches trois méthodes de philosopher dont le caractère est essentiellement différent et même radicalement opposé : d’abord la méthode théologique, ensuite la méthode métaphysique et enfin la méthode positive. De là, trois sortes de philosophie, ou de systèmes généraux de conceptions sur l’ensemble des phénomènes, qui s’excluent mutuellement : la première est le point de départ nécessaire de l’intelligence humaine ; la troisième, son état fixe et définitif ; la seconde est uniquement destinée à servir de transition... »

Dans l’état positif, l’esprit humain, reconnaissant l’inutilité d’obtenir des notions absolues, renonce à chercher l’origine et la destination de l’univers, et à connaître les causes intimes des phénomènes, pour s’attacher à découvrir, par l’usage bien combiné du raisonnement et de l’observation, leurs lois effectives, c’est-à-dire leurs relations de succession et de similitude. L’explication des faits, réduite alors à ses termes réels, n’est plus désormais que la liaison établie entre les divers phénomènes particuliers et quelques faits généraux dont les progrès de la science tendent de plus en plus à diriger le nombre.» (Cours de philosophie positive, t. I, p. 2-3.)

3. Comte écrit : « Les idées gouverment et bouleversent le monde, ou, en d’autres termes, tout le mécanisme social repose finalement sur des opinions... La grande crise politique et morale des sociétés actuelles tient, en dernière analyse, à l’anarchie intellectuelle. Notre mal le plus grave consiste,
en effet, dans cette profonde divergence qui existe maintenant entre tous les esprits relativement à toutes les maximes fondamentales dont la fissure est la première condition d’un véritable ordre social. Tant que les intelligences individuelles n’auront pas adhéré par un assentiment unanime à un certain nombre d’idées générales capables de former une doctrine sociale commune, on ne peut se dissimuler que l’état des nations restera, de toute nécessité, essentiellement révolutionnaire, malgré tous les paliatiifs politiques qui pourront être adoptés, et ne pourra réellement que des institutions provisoires. » (Courses de philosophie positive, t. I, p. 26.)

4. Auguste Comte ne s’en dissimule cependant pas l’importance. « La vie industrielle ne suscite que de classes imparfairement liées entre elles, faute d’une impulsion assez générale pour tout coordonner sans rien troubler; ce qui constitue le principal problème de la civilisation moderne. La vraie solution ne deviendra possible qu’en se fondant sur la cohésion civique. » (Système de politique positive, t. III, p. 364.) « Depuis l’éboulement de la servitude personnelle, les masses profitables ne sont point encore, abstraction faite de toute déclamation anarchique, véritablement incorporées au système social; la puissance du capital, d’abord moyen naturel d’émancipation et ensuite d’indépendance, est maintenant devenue exorbitante dans les transactions journalières; quelque juste prépondérance qu’elle doive nécessairement exercer, à raison d’une généralité et d’une responsabilité supérieure, suivant la saine théorie hébraïque. » (Courses de philosophie positive, t. VI, p. 512.) « Le principal désordre affecte aujourd’hui l’existence matérielle, où les deux éléments nécessaires de la force dirigeante, c’est-à-dire le nombre et la richesse, vivent dans un état croissant d’hostilité mutuelle, qui doit leur être également reproché. » (Système de politique positive, t. II, p. 391.)


6. L’examen de la nature et de l’objet de l’économie politique par Auguste Comte se trouve à la quarantaineième ligne du Cours de phi-

losophie positive (t. IV, p. 138 sq.). Auguste Comte avait connu et étudié l’économie politique de son temps, c’est-à-dire l’économie classique et libérale, lorsqu’il était secrétaire de Saint-Simon et dans ses critiques il écrivit « le cas éminemment exceptionnel de l’illustre et judicieux philosophe Adam Smith ». Sa polémique porte surtout contre les successeurs de Smith : « Si nos économistes sont, en réalité, les successeurs scientifiques d’Adam Smith, qu’ils nous montrent donc en quoi ils ont effectivement perfectionné et complété la doctrine de ce maître immortel, quelles découvertes vraiment nouvelles ils ont ajoutées à ses heureux aperçus primitifs, essentiellement défigurés, au contraire, par un vain et puéril étalage des formes scientifiques. En considérant, d’un regard impartial, les stériles contestations qui les divisent sur les notions les plus élémentaires de la valeur, de l’utilité, de la production, etc., ne croirait-on pas assister aux plus étranges débats des scolastiques du moyen âge sur les attributions fondamentales de leurs purs entités métaphysiques, dont les conceptions économiques prennent de plus en plus le caractère, à mesure qu’elles sont dogmatisées et subtilisées davantage. » (Ibid., p. 141.) Mais le reproche fondamental que fait Comte aux économistes est de vouloir créer une science autonome, « isolée relativement à l’ensemble de la philosophie sociale »... « Car, par la nature du sujet, dans les études sociales, comme dans toutes celles relatives aux corps vivants, les divers aspects généraux sont, de toute nécessité, mutuellement solidaires et rationnellement inseparables, au point de ne pouvoir être convenablement éclaircis les uns par les autres... Quand on quitte le monde des entités pour aborder les spéculations relatives, il devient donc évident que l’analyse économique ou industrielle de la société ne saurait être positivement accomplie, abstraction faite de son analyse intellectuelle, morale et politique, soit au passé, soit même au présent ; en sorte que, réciproquement, cette irrationnelle séparation fournit un symptôme irréfusable de la nature essentiellement métaphysique des doctrines qui la prennent pour base. » (Ibid., p. 142.)

7. Maurice Allais, professeur d’économie à l’École des mines, est no-


9. Comte écrit ainsi : « Après avoir expliqué les lois naturelles qui, dans le système moderne, doivent déterminer l'indispensable concentration des richesses parmi les chefs industriels, la philosophie positive fera sentir qu'il importe peu aux intérêts populaires en quelles mains se trouvent habituellement les capitaux, pourvu que leur emploi n'ait pas nécessairement atteint à la masse sociale. Or, cette condition essentielle dépend bien plus, par sa nature, des moyens moraux que des mesures politiques. Des vues étroites et des passions haineuses auraient beau instituer légalement, contre l'accumulation spontanée des capitaux, de laborieuses entraves, au risque de paralyser directement toute véritable activité sociale, il est clair que ces procédés tyranniques comporteraient beaucoup moins d'efficacité réelle que la réprobation universelle, appliquée par la morale positive à tout usage trop égoïste des richesses possédées; réprobation d'autant plus irresistible, que ceux-là mêmes qui devraient la subir n'en pourraient récuser le principe, inculqué à tous par la commune éducation fondamentale, comme l'a montré le catholicisme, au temps de sa monarchie (…) Mais, en signifiant au peuple la nature essentiellement morale de ses plus graves réclamations, la même philosophie fera nécessairement sentir aussi aux classes supérieures le poids d'une telle appréciation, en leur imposant avec énergie, au nom de principes qui ne sont plus ouvertement contestables, les grandes obligations morales inhérentes à leur position; en sorte que, par exemple, au sujet de la propriété, les riches se conserveront moralement comme les dépositaires nécessaires des capitaines publics, dont l'emploi effectif, sans pouvoir jamais entraîner aucune responsabilité politique, sauf quelques cas exceptionnels d'extrême aberration, n'en doit pas rester toujours assujetti à une scrupuleuse discussion morale, nécessairement accessible à tous sous les conditions convenables, et dont l'autorité spirituelle constituera ultérieurement l'organe normal. D'après une étude approfondie de l'évolution moderne, la philosophie positive montrera que, depuis l'abolition de la servitude personnelle, les masses prolétaires ne sont point encore, abstraction faite de toute déclamation anarchique, véritablement incorporées au système social; que la puissance du cauchemar national d'émancipation et ensuite d'indépendance, est maintenant devenue exorbitante dans les transactions journalières; quelque juste prépondérance qu'elle y doive nécessairement exercer, à raison d'une généralité et d'une responsabilité supérieures, suivant la saine théorie hiérarchique. En un mot, cette philosophie fera comprendre que les relations industrielles, au lieu de rester livrées à un dangereux empirisme ou à un antagonisme oppressif, doivent être systématisées suivant les lois morales de l'harmonie universelle.» (Cours de philosophie positive, t. VI, p. 357-358.)

10. Maurras a notamment écrit un essai sur Auguste Comte qui a été publié avec d'autres essais (Le Romantisme féminin, Mademoiselle Monk) à la suite de L'Avenir de l'Intelligence, Paris, Nouvelle Librairie Nationale, 1918. Maurras écrit de Comte : « S'il est vrai qu'il y ait des maîtres, s'il est faux que le ciel et la terre et le moyen de les interpréter ne soient venus au monde que le jour de notre naissance, je ne connais aucun nom d'homme qu'il faille renoncer avec un sentiment de reconnaissance plus vive. Son image ne peut être évoquée sans émotion… Quelques-uns d'entre nous étaient une anarchie vivante. Il leur
a rendu l'ordre ou ce qui équivaut, l'espérance de l'ordre. II a montré le beau visage de l'Unité, souriant dans un ciel qui ne paraît pas trop lointain.


La politique d'Alain est exposée dans les deux volumes : Éléments d'une doctrine radicale, Paris, Gallimard, 1925; Le Citoyen contre les pouvoirs, Paris, S. Kra, 1926.


13. Il y a plusieurs années, j'ai siégé dans le jury d'une thèse consacrée à Alain par un homme qui avait été converti au positivisme par l'enseignement d'Alain, et qui avait failli rejeter l'enseignement d'Alain et celui d'Auguste Comte quand avait éclaté la guerre de 1939. Faux prophète, celui qui annonçait la paix en un siècle de guerre.


Voici comment Comte juge le système colonial des xvime et xvmie siècles : « Sans revenir assurément aux dissertations déclamatoires du siècle dernier relativement à l'avantage ou au danger final de cette vaste opération pour l'ensemble de l'humanité, ce qui constitue une question aussi oiseuse qu'in soluble, il serait intéressant d'examiner s'il en est définitivement résulté une accélération ou un retard pour l'évolution totale, à la fois négative et positive, des sociétés modernes. Or, à cet égard, il semble d'abord que la nouvelle destination capitale ainsi ouverte à l'esprit guerrier, sur la terre et sur la mer, et l'importante reconstruction a priori imprimée à l'esprit religieux, comme mieux adapté à la civilisation de populations arriérées, ont tendu directement à prolonger la durée générale du régime militaire et théologique, et, par suite, à éloigner spécialement la réorganisation finale. Malgré, en premier lieu, l'entièreté de l'opposition, que les avis des experts et des humains n'ont jusqu'alors tendu à recevoir graduellement, a dû faire mieux comprendre la vraie nature philosophique d'une telle régénération, en la montrant comme finalement destinée à l'ensemble de l'humanité ; ce qui devait mettre en plus haute évidence l'insuffisance radicale d'une politique conduite alors, en tant d'occasions, à détruire systématiquement les races humaines, dans l'impunité de l'assimiler. En second lieu, par une influence plus directe et plus prochaine, l'active stimulation nouvelle que ce grand événement européen a dû partout imposer à l'industrie, a certainement augmenté beaucoup son importance sociale et même politique : en sorte que, tout compensé, l'évolution moderne n'en a, ce matin, éprouvé nécessairement une accélération réelle, dont toutefois on se forme communément une opinion très exagérée. » (Cours de philosophie positive, t. Vl, p. 68.)

Comte analyse les conquêtes coloniales du xixe siècle en ces termes : « Nous avons, il est vrai, [...] remarqué l'introduction spontanée d'un dangerieux sophisme, qu'on s'efforce aujourd'hui de consolider, et qui tendrait à conserver indéfiniment l'activité militaire, en assignant aux invasions successives la spéculative destination d'établir directement, dans l'intérêt final de la civilisation universelle, la prépondérance matérielle des populations les plus avancées sur celles qui le sont.

moins. Dans le déplorable état présent de la philosophie politique, qui permet l'ascendant éphémère de toute aberration quelconque, une telle tendance a certainement beaucoup de gravité, comme source de perturbation universelle; logiquement poursuivie, elle aboutirait, sans doute, après avoir motivé l'oppression mutuelle des nations, à précipiter les uns sur les autres les diverses cités, d'après leur inégale progression sociale; et, sans aller jusqu'à cette rigoureuse exten- sion, qui doit certes rétrécir les ressources que nous avons vue, en sens inverse, essentiellement destinée, sous des conditions sociales radicalement opposées à celles du milieu moderne, à comprimer partout, excepté chez un peuple unique, l'essor imminent de la vie militaire, que cette valeur paraît stimulerait, au contraire, simultanément chez des nations longtemps livrées à une activité éminemment pacifique. » (Cours de philosophie positive, t. VI, p. 237-238.)

15. Les formules abondent chez Auguste Comte pour affirmer l'anachronisme des guerres, souligner la contradiction entre la société moderne et le phénomène militaire et guerrier : « Tous les esprits vraisemblablement philosophiques doivent aisément reconnaître, après une parfaite satisfaction, à la fois intellectuelle et morale, que l'époque est enfin venue où la guerre sévèrese et durable doit totalement disparaitre chez l'élite de l'humanité. » (Cours de philosophie positive, t. VI, p. 239.)

Or encore : « Tous les divers moyens généraux d'exploration rationnelle, applicables aux recherches politiques, ont déjà spontanément concouru à constater, d'une manière également décisive, l'inévitable tendance primitive de l'humanité à une vie principalement militaire, et à sa destination finale, non moins irrésistible, à une existence essentiellement industrielle. Aussi aucune intelligence un peu avan- cée ne refuse-t-elle désormais de reconnaitre, plus ou moins explicitement, le décroissement continu de l'esprit militaire et l'ascendant graduel de l'esprit industriel, comme une double conséquence nécessaire de notre évo- lution progressive, qui a été, de nos jours, assez judicieusement appréciée, à cet égard, par la plupart de ceux qui s'occupent convenablement de philosophie politique. En un temps d'ailleurs où se manifeste continuellement, sous des formes de plus en plus variées, et avec une énergie toujours croissante, même au sein des armées, la répugnance caractéristique des sociétés modernes pour la vie guerrièbre; quand, par exemple, l'insuffisance totale des vocations militaires est partout devenue de plus en plus irrécevable d'après l'obligation de plus en plus indispensable du recrutement forcé, rarement suivi d'une persis- tance volontaire; l'expériences journalière disparaîtrait, sans doute, de toute démonstration directe, au sujet d'une notion aussi graduellement tombée dans le domaine public. Malgré l'im- mense développement exceptionnel de l'activité militaire, momentanément déterminé, au commencement de ce siècle, par l'inévitable entraînement qui a dû succéder à d'irrécevables cir- constances anormales, notre instinct industriel et pacifique n'a pas tardé à reprendre, d'une manière plus rapide, le cours régulier de son développement prépondérant, de façon à assurer réellement, sous ce rapport, le repos fon- damental du monde civilisé, quoique l'harmonie européenne doive fréquemment sembler compromise, en consé- quence du défaut provisoire de toute organisation systématique des rela- tions internationales; ce qui, sans pouvoir vraiment produire la guerre, suffit toutefois pour inspirer quelques-uns de dangereuses inquiétudes [...] Tan- dis que l'activité industrielle présente spontanément cette admirable pro- priété de pouvoir être simultanément stimulée chez tous les individus et chez


19. D'où Auguste Comte conclut que, puisqu'il n'y a pas de liberté de conscience en astronomie, il ne devrait pas y en avoir en politique.
Contrastive analysis of the dependent subject clause in Albanian and English

Aida Alla∗

Abstract:

During the process of foreign language learning, it often happens that students are influenced by native language rules while formulating their ideas in a foreign language, thus failing to pay due account of the fact that linguistic aspects are different in different languages. In light of this finding, this paper/presentation intends to make a contrastive analysis designed to demonstrate, both from a theoretical and practical perspective, similarities and differences between subject clauses in English and Albanian, from a syntactical point of view. The following presentation examines some of the linguistic means used to express a subject clause in both languages; their structural typology (based on the conjugation means); the grammatical agreements between the categories of number and person, both direct or otherwise, that this type of sentence establishes with the predicate of the main clause of a complex sentence; as well as its order in the complex sentence.

The similarities and differences we intend to unfold in this analysis are expected to be of value to two target-groups: it shall serve English language students as an example illustrating that failure to take account of these linguistic differences in the way a sentence is formed, would result in the use of grammatically erroneous structures and, consequently, create obstacles in interlingual communication. This presentation shall also serve English language university students who may use this modest and by no means exhausting presentation, and elaborate it to a greater extent and in greater detail in their scientific papers.

Key Words: subject clause, principal clause, predicate, agreement in person and number, subject-verb agreement, order.

∗ Aida Alla, PhD Cand. Lecturer at AAB University, aida.alla@aab-edu.net
Definition of subject clause

Before we define dependent subject clauses, we should have a general insight into what subject is, given that the function of a subject clause in a complex sentence is similar to that of a subject in a simple sentence.

Definition in Albanian language: The subject is the main nominal or pronominal part of a two-component clause that has predicative relations with the predicate.\(^1\) Another definition defines the subject as ‘nominal or pronominal part of a sentence that depends on the predicate, that is joined with it, and that defines the subject of the action by joining in predicative relation with the predicate.’\(^2\)

Definition in English language: The subject of a clause is a person or thing discussed in the sentence. The predicate often comments or refers to the subject.\(^3\) Another definition states: the Subject of a clause is a person, thing, place, idea, etc., which is or does something. One may identify the subject if he/she can identify the predicate/verb.\(^4\)

What these definitions have in common, both in Albanian and English, is their nominal or pronominal nature of the subject, which functions as the main part of a sentence and it represents the doer or the causer of an action or state, as well as the object or the phenomenon which the sentence refers to. Consequently, this noun, pronoun, enumerator or any other nominal part of speech is in the definite or indefinite nominative case.

Moreover, the aforementioned definitions have in common the inevitable connection between the subject and the predicate. What does predicative relation imply? What is the impact that predicate has upon subject? The predicate supports the subject to express syntactic modality, syntactic tense and syntactic person. Employing

\(^4\) http://grammar.ccc.commnet.edu/grammar/subjects.htm
Contrastive analysis of the dependent subject clause in Albanian and English

morphological forms of voice in Albanian and English, reflected on the verb-predicate, we express the reality or unreality of a process.\(^5\) The subject and the predicate are both the principal syntactic components of a clause consisted of two main components.\(^6\)

The aforementioned explanations pertaining to subject shall guide us toward a more complex syntactic phenomenon: to dependent subject clause. A complex sentence consisting of a dependent subject clause is the one which has a dependent clause functioning as a subject of the complex clause, the function of which is the same as a simple subject in a simple clause consisted of only two components\(^7\) (2002). 10 years later, Mehmet Çeliku is proposing another nomenclature for the subject clause. He presented the term quasi-sentence (sifjali) for the clauses functioning as components in a sentence.

He maintains that a sentence with subject clause is the one in which the dependent complementary clause functions as the subject of the verb-predicate to the main clause. Thus, the verb of the main clause needs to be complemented by a subject expressed with the components of the quasi-sentence.\(^8\) (2012).

The following definition is provided for the subject clause in English language: the dependent nominal clause, which functions as the subject in a complex sentence.\(^9\)

**Structural subtypes of subject clause**

In Albanian language, subject clauses are categorized into:
- Subject clauses expressed with defining conjunctions: se, e, që, with time conjunctions kur, and with conjunction si; with interrogative particles a, mos.

---

\(^7\) Akademia e Shkencave, Gjuha Shqipe 2, Tiranë, 2002, p. 503.
\(^8\) Mehmet Çeliku, Sintaksë e gjuhës shqipe (Përbërësit Sintaksorë), Shtëpia botuese ILAR, Tiranë, 2012. p. 356.
Example: Ishte e qartë që ata e kishin marrë vesh lajmin se anija ishte mbytur. I dukej sikur gjithë njërëzit i kishin sytë tek ai. I është thënë të vijë pa u vonuar. Dorës i ra në sy menjëherë se Marku ishte ligur mjaf. Po si ndodhi xhanëm që e humbët rrugën? Është fakt se populli shqiptar i kaloi të gjitha këto vështirësi. E keqja është se nuk kemi bërë aq sa duhet. Është e vërtëtë se kurrë ndonjëherë nuk është parë ndonjë aktivitet i tillë krijues i masave.

While analyzing “Është e vërtetë se...” in Albanian and “It is true that...” in English, it may be observed that in Albanian the personal pronoun is missing. This is possible because the grammatical category of person of the pronoun acting as the subject is transferred onto the verb through its conjugation. This is not possible in English. The personal pronoun in the function of the subject is always present in order to clarify the grammatical category of person of the verb. This occurs because of the analytical nature of English language as opposed to the synthetic nature of Albanian language.

- Pronominal subject clauses are expressed with pronouns, interrogative adverbs and indefinite conjunctive pronouns: kush, ç, çfarë, se (me se, nga se), sa, i sati, ku, nga, që kur, gjithë çka, gjithë sa.\(^\text{10}\)

Example: Kush nuk mëson në djalëri nuk gjen nder në pleqëri. Ç’fluturon, s’hahet. Gjithë sa tregova më lartë, ndodhi dy vite të shkuara.

- Dependent Wh-question subject clauses. This type of subject clause may also admit the pronoun “se” in front of the relative pronoun or adverb, and it pertains to verbs and verb phrases of discourse, perception and mental processes.\(^\text{11}\) These verbs and phrases can be found in interrogative clauses, demonstrative privative clauses or clauses consisted of lexical elements that show uncertainty and raising questions; it contains an interrogative structure, but it almost loses its interrogative intonation; it is joined with interrogative words such as the interrogative pronouns: kush, cili, cila, etc.

\(^{10}\) Akademia e shkencave, Gjuha shqipe 2, Tiranë, 2002, p. 506.

\(^{11}\) Ibid.
Example: Nuk më kujtohet mirë se me cilin karvan erdhëm në shtëpi.

In English language, the types of subject clauses are: relative (that) clauses, (Alb. fjali me përemra lidhorë). Example: That she is still alive is a consolation; dependent yes-no clauses, dependent wh-questions (Alb. fjali pyetëse e zhderjëtë me ose pa fjalë pyetëse). Example: How the book will sell depends on the author. Whether he will show up is not clear; finite relative clauses (Alb. fjali me forma të shtjtelluara të foljes): Whoever wants to come, may come; and non-finite clauses (infinite and gerundial) (Alb. forma të pashtjelluara të foljes dhe emër foljor) Example: For a bridge to collapse like this is unbelievable. Telling unimportant things by telephone is expensive.

∗1 While comparing the above mentioned examples in both languages, we observe the usage of the non-finite verb forms in the English clauses (infinitive and gerundial). In Albanian, these forms are expressed with other linguistic components, with the finite verbs in subjunctive mood and a verbal noun respectively. The non-finite form expressed with -ing suffix (gerund) in Albanian corresponds to the verbal noun. in rare cases it can be expressed with a finite verb in the indicative mood.

Example: Telling unimportant things by telephone is expensive. Të bërët/Bërja e bisedave të parëndësishme në telefon është e shtrenjtë.

The non-finite form (infinitive) in English corresponds to a finite verb form in Albanian, with a verb in subjunctive mood respectively.

Example: For a bridge to collapse like this is unbelievable. Që ura të shëmbet kështu është e pabesueshme.

Considering the finite character of the verb in the subjunctive mood in Albanian, we can assume that they are inflected to express the grammatical category of tense. There is a tense agreement between

---

*1 There are two grammatical meanings expressed with the same form “verb+ing”: Present Participle corresponds to the non-finite form of “percjellore” in Albanian; Gerund corresponds to the verbal noun in Albanian. The latter is the focus of this study.
the verb in the subjunctive mood of the main clause with the verb of the subject clause.

Example: Që ura të shëmbet kështuështë e pabueshme. (Simple Present tense) Që ura të shëmbej kështuështë e pabueshme. (Simple Past tense)

When the gerundial phrase is placed after the verb and is introduced by the anticipatory “it”, it is equivalent to a verb in the subjunctive mood or a verbal noun in Albanian.12

Example: It’s worth/no good/no use saving money. Ia vlen/Nuk ia vlen të kursesh para. (subjunctive mood - “lidhore”). Kursimi/Të kursyerit e parave ia vlen/nuk ia vlen. (verbal noun - emër foljor).

The tense of such finite verb in the subjunctive mood depends on the time reference of the verb of the main clause.13

Example: It was nice meeting you. Gëzohem/ Ishte kënaqësi që të takova.

In rare cases, when the gerundial phrase corresponds to a subject clause in Albanian, the gerund may be equivalent to a finite verb of the indicative mood in Albanian.14

Example: His obtaining that job didn’t surprise me. Nuk u çudita që ai ka zënë atë vend pune.

**Person and number agreement between the subject clause and the verb of the main clause**

As we have mentioned above, there is an unavoidable agreement between the subject and the predicate, which forms the structural and semantic core of a two-component clause.15 In Albanian language, this

---

13Ibid.
14Ibid., p. 60.
is a grammatical relation whereby the predicate and the subject agree in person and number and in some languages even in gender.\textsuperscript{16}

The same agreement is also found in English language; however, considering the analytical nature of English language, this structural agreement is found in the verbs in the present tense, in the third person singular and in auxiliary verbs “\textit{to be}” and “\textit{to have}”. On the other hand, Albanian language, as a synthetic language, expresses this agreement in all verb tenses and moods through suffixes admitted by the verb during conjugation. Albanian language, as an inflective language, possesses a wide range of morphological forms, whereby it possesses numerous possibilities to clearly express syntactic relations in a clause.\textsuperscript{17} Example: \textit{Ajo vajzëështë nga Durrësi. Ato vajzatjanë nga Durrësi.}

In English language, the agreement is the same and straightforward.\textsuperscript{18}: This pen \textit{is} mine. These pens \textit{are} mine. What was stated above, pertaining to the agreement in person, however, is referred to the subject and not to the dependent subject clause. As far as the latter is concerned, in Albanian language, the subject clause does not necessarily determine the grammatical category of person and number of the main clause, its verb-predicate respectively.

Example: \textit{Nuk është ende e qartë nëse do ta vizitojmë Shqipërinë. Nuk e kanë ende të qartë nese ai do ta vizitojë Shqipërinë.}

This occurs because frequently the main and the dependent clause do not refer to the same entity or does not imply that the actions referring to both clauses are rendered by the same person. In the given example, we have two configurations whereby it is demonstrated that both clauses of the sentence do not correspond in person and number since the actions expressed by the both respective clauses do not refer to the actions performed by the same persons. If the subject clause would be placed before the main clause the predicate of the main clause would be in the third person singular regardless of the number of the verb in the subject clause.

\textsuperscript{16}Ibid.
\textsuperscript{17}Akademia e shkencave, \textit{Gjuha shqipe 2}, Tiranë, 2002, p. 68.
Example: Nëse ai do ta vizitojë Shqipërinë nuk është ende e qartë. Nëse ata do ta vizitojnë Shqipërinë nuk është ende e qartë.

We may employ the same logic even on pronominal subject clause. Example: Kush duron, trashëgon. Sa ishin shqiptarë, ishin burra të vertetë. This grammatical agreement occurs because both clauses of the sentence refer to the same person or persons.

In English, we observe a tendency to utilize the verb in the function of predicate in the third person singular. It is worthwhile to mention that the verb “tobe” is more frequently used in comparison to other verbs. We shall observe examples mentioned below that will illustrate the utilization of verb “tobe” alongside other verbs in the third person singular. The usual application of the third person singular, like in Albanian, depends on the placement of the subject clause before the main clause. The agreement of the verb in the third person singular occurs also because the subject clause is considered as complete entity, as an abstract unit, as a representative of a fact, phenomenon, occurrence etc.

That he is clever is obvious./ That he is clever doesn’t mean much.
Whether he is writing another book is not known./ Whether he is writing another book won’t make any difference.
Who will come tonight is not known. / Who will come tonight hasn’t beentold yet.
To win the match was his greatest ambition. / To win the match didn’t help him in his career.

The order of subject clauses

In Albanian, the order of clauses in a complex sentence, as well as in a simple sentence, is relatively flexible and loose. The order of the dependent subject clause versus the main one depends on the grammatical or stylistic factors. It is determined by structural reasons when the main clause lacks a subject. It is determined by semantic and stylistic reasons when we want to emphasize the subject clause or the
main clause. In a complex sentence with a dependent subjunctive clause, the order may be both stringent (main clause – dependent clause) and free.

The order of clauses is strict when the subject clause depends on the verbs showing desire, volition, necessity, and when subject clause is a dependent wh question or dependent imperative clause. The dependent clause is not divided by a comma. The opposite order in these sentences is impossible.

Example: Kërkohet që të ngrihet përgjithësisht niveli kulturor i puntorit e i fshatarit.

The same applies to verbs such as: ndodh, ngjan, rastis. Example: Ju ka ndodhur ndonjëherë të daldisni nga zemërimi? Ndodh ndonjëherë të zemërohen edhe të urtët.

The order of clauses is flexible when the predicate is verbal and is expressed with verbs of discourse, perception and mental processes. “dependent clause – main clause” is the most common order. In this case, the main expressive charge lays on the dependent clause. The sentence is not divided with a comma. Example: Flitej nga qyteti se po i bënin fërtele tregtarët e mëdhenj.

The opposite order, (main clause - dependent clause) puts the expressive charge on the main clause. Example: Që Sulltan Murati e shkeli Shqipërinë në 1421 provohet edhe nga një tjetër burim.

Regarding the order of clauses in a complex sentence in English, in most cases it is as follows: Subject – Verb/Predicate - object. The strict order, as we have noted above, occurs because English language is an analytical language and as such, the functions and syntactic relations of the clause components are expressed through their order in a sentence and not through inflections. Example: John Loves Ann. Ann loves John. The same unchanged word may function as a subject (when it is in the beginning of the sentence) and may function as an object if it follows the verb-predicate. The same applies to subject clauses where we have the same strict order (subject clause – main clause).

---

20 Ibid., p. 510
Sometimes the position of the subject clause is removed from its usual position at the beginning of the sentence to the end of the main clause. This phenomenon is called “extraposition”. In this case, the usual position of the subject is filled by an “empty” (anticipatory, introductory, dummy) “it”.21

Example: To help poor and old people is very human. It is very human to help poor and old people.

In this case, the main verb is always the verb “to be” and the predicate is always nominal. It can be followed by (1) an adjective: It is advisable to check out the system to make sure there are no errors in the software. (2) a verbal adjective: It was embarrassing to forget her name even after meeting her for the fifth time. Është e sikletshme të harrosh emrin e saj edhe pasi e kam takuar pesë here. (3) gerund (emra foljor): It is pleasant being with you here. Është kënaqësi të jemi këtu me ju. (4) a finite verb: It’s a fact that she is now the best writer. Është fakt/Dihet që ajo tashmë është shkrimtarja më e mirë. Hence, it is worthwhile to mention, bearing in mind the translation of the abovementioned sentences, that the possessive pronoun “it”, which functions as an empty subject in English, can be omitted in Albanian since the grammatical category of person rests upon the verb through its inflections.

Conclusions:

In this paper, we observed the similarities and differences in complex sentences with a dependent subject clause in Albanian and English. From the undertaken analysis, we have concluded that, in both languages, the subject clause is a nominal or pronominal clause which functions as a subject of the predicate in the main clause. Moreover, the relation between the subject clause and the predicate of the main clause is a direct grammatical and structural relation. In both languages, it is the predicate which complements the subject in order to express the category of modality, tense and person.

As far as the tipology of subject clauses is concerned, in Albanian language we have three main streams: subject subjunctive clauses; pronominal clauses and dependent wh question clauses. Despite these linguistic devices, in English language we have noticed that the subject clause is also expressed by non-finite verb forms (infinitive and gerund). The latter is expressed in Albanian language with a finite verb forms and with gerund.

As for the order of the subject clause of a complex sentence in Albanian, it is relatively free since syntactic functions of the words are determined by its inflections. Such flexibility does not apply in English language, wherein the order is stricter and the subject clause is followed by the main clause. In particular cases, the subject clause may be positioned at the end of the complex sentence and its place may be occupied by an ‘empty’ subject which is realized by possessive pronoun ‘it.’ This linguistic phenomenon is not present in Albanian language. In Albanian language, we may omit the use of possessive pronoun in the function of the subject since the person of the verb indicates the meaning of the pronoun.

Additionally, it was important to take into consideration the relation between subject clause and the predicate of the main clause. As we have mentioned above, there is an agreement between the subject and the predicate. Nevertheless, in our analysis, we noted that in the case of a complex sentence with a subject clause, this is not always the case. In Albanian language, we observed two types of sentences: 1) the grammatical category of person of the verb-predicate in the main clause corresponds with subject clause and 2) the grammatical category of person of the verb-predicate in the main clause does not correspond with subject clause. In the first case, from the semantic point of view, we do not deal with a single doer of an action refering to both clauses of the sentence. In English language, we observed the usage of the verb in the third person singular. This occurs since the subject clause is always positioned before the main clause and is thus perceived as an entity, which would correspond to the third person singular.
Bibliography:


Çeliku, M, Sintaksë e gjuhës shqipe (përbërësit Sintaksorë), Shtëpia botuese ILAR, Tiranë: 2012.


Burime nga interneti:

http://grammar.ccc.commnet.edu/grammar/subjects.htm
**A brief overview of locative prepositions and their role of marker**

*Avni Islami*

**Abstract**

Prepositions are typically polysemious items: they have different, but related senses. According to cognitive semantics, the figurative senses of a preposition are extended from its spatial senses through conceptual metaphors. In a pedagogical context, it may be useful to draw learners' attention to those aspects of a preposition's spatial sense that are especially relevant for its metaphorization processes. This article examines possible ways in which cognitive semantic analyses of prepositions could be used to anticipate comprehension problems, and facilitate comprehension of the unfamiliar figurative senses.

**Key words:** sign of relation and functional signs, contiguous and detached relations, primary and secondary signs.

**Introduction**

Prepositions are a part of speech that is hard to define. For example, most of foreigners who learn English as a foreign language easily fail to distinguish phrases, like: *"In the street"* and *"On the street"*. It is difficult to explain why this happens.¹

There is an interesting thing, foreigners who speak English face difficulties in acquiring prepositions. Based on a conducted survey, it was concluded that 90% of foreigners who learn English, never manage to properly acquire prepositions. Only 10% of foreigners are

---


*Avni Islami, PhD Candidate, AAB-University, Prishtina. E-mail: Avni83up@hotmail.com*
successful in their acquisition, while ordinary English native speakers can make any kind of errors, whether syntactic, semantic or morphological, but in no way they will use prepositions incorrectly.\textsuperscript{2} It is also interesting to note that children whose mother tongue is English manage to acquire prepositional forms quite late and with difficulty. This learning is accomplished during their preschool age through various games and activities.

Prepositions are distinguished from one another through a mutual combination of Contrastive and semantic markers. Understanding of prepositions consists in semantic complexity of markers which consist of a relation marker and function marker operating on objects. The markers themselves are concepts relating to the perceptual space viewed and occupied by speakers of a language. As will be shown the function markers extract, as it were, a part of an object as semantically salient. In this regard, speakers of a language must adopt common perceptions of space. Speakers of a language agree about visual components of objects in space. A listener is prepared to choose the right words and prepositions in the immense linguistic areal to respond to interlocutors. Prepositions represent a cultural cognitive contingent with visual perceptions. We have no idea at all how we conceive this, but we can say, what we perceive is a cultural dependence

\textit{A brief overview of locative prepositions and their role of sign}

Difficulties encountered among foreign learners of English prepositions are divided into two groups:

\begin{itemize}
\item[a)] The first difficulty is the general structure of markers which differs from a language to a language, although the core of such common markers is found in all languages,
\item[b)] The second is a minimal combination of markers that differs prepositions among them in a given language.
\end{itemize}

Prepositions are sensitive linguistic elements that are culturally acceptable and very well known to all members of the same linguistic community.

In fact, due to features of prepositions, children of any linguistic community acquire them with delay.3

Children, first of all have to acquire semantic cognitive integrity in their own language, respectively, they have to learn marks of the system before they are able to use them. It is obvious that marks are complex; as such children’s role is twofold. They have to study content of each mark and then acquire the possibility of their combination. It is still unknown how these two elements are acquired.

This theory proposes a semantic group of markers through which English prepositions as a part of constitutive prepositional phrases encourage speakers to perceive relationships between objects.

However, the difficulty, foreigners face in using correctly English language prepositions compared to other parts of grammar, is more evident because foreigners who speak English, use different semantic signs, even though some of the prepositions in their mother tongues have the same features with the English ones. The greatest difficulty is in the field of semantics and by no ways in the syntax.

Foreigners who deal with English should learn some visual features of prepositions as well as some necessary combinations, some of which are very close to the prepositions of their native languages. However, this similarity often makes their learning more difficult.

For example, we Albanians, while learning English face difficulties in distinguishing

Prepositions ‘on’ and ‘over’ or ‘on’ and ‘Above’, e.g., The Albanian phrase "llampa mbi tavoline" in English will be used in two ways with different meanings, e.g. "The lamp on the table" and "The lamp above the table". In the phrase, the bottom surface of the lamp is contiguous with the surface of the table, while in the second, the lamp stands above the surface of the table without touching it, whereas the

---

Albanian preposition ‘mbi’ does not distinguish if the lamp’s bottom surface is contiguous with the surface of the table or it stands above it.

Albanians find it difficult to distinguish the prepositions 'in' and 'at' in English, since these two concepts in Albanian often result in the preposition ‘në’ (in).

A serious concern is that the psychology of perception envisages some features of contours which determine form of prepositions. (Gibson, 1950).4

A listener fits itself to presentation of objects in conformity of conceptualization expressed through prepositions. This adaptation varies among speakers and is reflected in the interpretation. As a result, some speakers find the meaning of any strange phrase based on the preposition they encounter.

**Description of the Markers**

The nature of semantic description of prepositions is based on semantic markers, which are a clear symbol referring to their concepts. A semantic marker is a formal symbol standing for a concept. A list of primitive semantic markers is given, together with a description indicating the intended interpretation of the primitives.

The definition of the word is given by specifying complex semantic marker that is a combination of the primary marker. Combining method also has a certain interpretation, so that the complex marker stands for a concept which is composed, in this way indicated from the primitive concept. For example, the marker “human” has as its intended interpretation the property of being human. The marker "young" has as its intended interpretation the property of being at the early part of limited temporal existence. Thus (human) (young) represents a complex concept corresponding to the word “child”.5

The examples given indicate concepts of fixed properties.

---

But a concept may also be of a relation with two or more arguments, and these arguments may themselves be concepts as well as other entities (e.g., physical objects or spatial configurations). Thus, the concept of L (location) is a relation of two objects: H (Head) and (RP) Referential Point, and can be symbolized by the semantic marker L (location), H (Head), RP) (Referential Point). 6RP is interpreted as a place of H; it may be a subject or object, even a physical or spatial configuration. RP is a location of H. The difference between location and point of reference is that the location encompasses (but not always) a larger referential point, but reference point is always within the space of location. The combinations of relation markers and functional markers have always different interpretations. For example, L, H and RP are in the permanent connection relationship. Prepositions of place, unlike nouns and adjectives specify relation concepts with two or more arguments.

In general, the meaning of prepositions should be given in terms of relation markers and function markers instead of the sort of marker which specifies a property concept. Locative prepositions specify spatial relationships between a small subset of the characteristics of the objects indicated by the expressions which are connected by the preposition. However, the meaning of prepositions can be analyzed, first, with the concepts of function which pick out relevant characteristics to be related, and the second, with the related concept describing the special relation between the values of the functions. The resulting complex relation marker will thus have the form (H) to head, (RP) to Referential Point, and (R) relationship, (L) location. All these signs connect objects and places.7


The Markers

1. L (location), H (head), RP (reference point). (RP is the location of H). L (general location) is the relation of the object and place that does not change when RP is the location of H. RP can be a location, volume, surface, or a line that defines the exact location of H. So, L is the concept of general location, see the following example; 8

“Mr. Jones’ home is located in Cambridge”.

Mr. John’s home is the H (head), in is preposition of location and Cambridge is the general location.

2a) (H, RP) - (H is contiguous with the surface of RP). Contiguosness establishes relationship between the surface of H (head) and RP (Referential Point). The relation of contiguosness between the head and the referential point does not change in any way the shape of these two forms. This concept is applicable when contact or proximity is a part of two forms, and not when contact or proximity is only one point.

2b) The split of H from RP means detachment of H from RP. The contrast between contiguosness and detachment serves to make a distinction between prepositions, such as: "on", "near", "on the top of", and "Above". Example, if we put a pencil horizontally on a table, normally it contacts its surface, it is contiguos with the surface of the table, then we would say, "The pencil on the table", or "The pencil on top of the table". But, if we stick a thread on ceiling and then we tie tightly the pen with the end of the thread, (in case it does not touch the table’s surface) then, we would say, “The pencil is over the table”.

Comparing the English language locative prepositions on and over with the Albanian language equivalents, the Albanian speakers use the proposition of place mbi for both on and over.

Conclusion

The role of semantic sign with locative prepositions is an essential element. Complex semantic sign combined with primary signs are not of less importance as well. Concept of L (location) as a relation of two objects: H (Head) and (RP) Referential Point, can be symbolized by the semantic signs L (location), H (Head), RP) (Referential Point). RP is interpreted as a place of H; it may be a subject or object, even a physical or spatial configuration. RP is a location of H. The difference between location and point of reference is that the location encompasses (but not always) a larger reference point, but reference point is always within the space of location. The combinations of relation signs and functional symbols have always different interpretations. For example, L, H and RP are on permanent connection relationships. Prepositions of place, unlike nouns and adjectives specify relation, and concepts among them with two or more arguments.

English and Albanian prepositions of place differ very much among them, since the Albanian language propositions are more polysemious.


Bibliography


Personal Identity and Mass Culture

Ibrahim Berisha*

Summary

Personal identities in Kosova, too, are created through the influence of the mass media contents. Ample and assorted technology-communications systems have facilitated the convergence of personal and collective relations in the social and cultural aspects. In addition, the personal identity has been tempted by the factors leading to the virtual shape. Fixed, retouched, and artificial identities created in a virtual environment through the mass media enhance the game of the cultural roles that are incompatible with the real life roles. The roles do not give but rather get from the public the un-systemized cultural energies and then pass on that power mainly to corporative representatives, which manage it by acquiring the public.

Keywords: Personal identity, mass media, mass culture, multiculturalism, virtual, role, public right.

Identity, Industry of Culture

Mass culture has inverted the conventional concept of the personal identity, the one viewed narrowly in the traditional context, by linking it mainly with the authentic, original, and local values and environments, either geographic or social. The consumption of global values and global space of communications has led to a change of the major influence producing agents in creating of the opinions as well as the personal and collective identity. The media have changed the conceptualization of life. Images of actors in the serials inundate local and national televisions, and this happens be the case in all continents. Protagonists of the television serials live the kind of a life

* Prof. Assoc. Dr. Ibrahim Berisha, “Hasan Prishtina” University, Prishtina, AAB University, Prishtinë. E-mail: iberisha5@hotmail.com
everyone years to have -- and they make no serious efforts to such an end.¹ Protagonists from the books no longer inspire even the children, but they are instead inspired by the mass media. Instead of reading, children find it more amusing consumption of media contents.² Communications have changed in form and content, and this is the case with all ages and in all of the continents.

The more the digital communications develop, the weaker will grow the emotional ties, not only with relatives, acquaintances, and friends but also with the nature, environment, and its products. Therefore, the scholars on tradition, as is for instance Raymond Aron, consider that one of the main reasons of the "origin of social differentiation is the disintegration of mechanical solidarity and segmental structures." All these add to the accelerating process of losing these ties.

Media have contributed to fading out of the authority, namely have led to subjugation toward the group led by a "chieftain, "headman" "family head", "teacher", "boss". The personal freedom is stimulated by the media, because they also lead to the change of the accountability patterns, from the moral to legal accountability, from collective to personal accountability.

Therefore, we are dealing with the situation of the departure of traditional authority by reconciling the responsibility with the obligation toward the public life. In this case, the mechanical solidarity, known as a unique and obdurate tyranny, which was very

² Over 30 per cent of children never read in their free time. Researches carried out by the National Foundation for Literacy in the United Kingdom involved over 21,000 children. When the research began in 2005, four out of 10 children confirmed that leisure reading was part of their daily routine, reports koha.net. The figure has now dropped to about three out of 10 children. The number of children who read comics and magazines has also dropped from 75 percent to 57 percent. Experts say that children do not read for entertainment as they increasingly see the reading as meeting school obligations. Researchers have also discovered that children prefer watching their favorite TV programs than read. (Over 30% of children do not read at their free time . Koha Ditore news portal, http://koha.net/ 2014-08-31 23:40:17)
strong in Kosova given that fact that the majority of the population lived in larger family communities in the rural areas, weaken little by little, dominated by organic solidarity, namely through the increase of public accountability, responsible individuals, and unhindered public communication, including the media. If an individual lived in a social environment with stronger mechanic solidarity, then the responsibility for all happens, including to the particular person, delegated to the group and the accountability ends in the hierarchy of the group. Put in other words, in this level of organic solidarity, which was extensively treated by Emilie Durkeheim, the authority is not delegated to the group, namely "chieftain," "family head", "teacher", "cleric", "boss", but is held and communicated as an individual responsibility. In this case, the media pluralism also played a role of creating plural identities.3

Personal identity is the one that is tempted by the factors shaping the virtual construction, which is more a project and mysticism than a form of concrete content. At the same time, provision of opportunity to move beyond the limited space made an impact on the judgment about this model of personality. People share even the most personal and intimate actions with a world, eager to see and hear the extraordinary and unthinkable, which is the unknown and the wishful. The people with more than one mini-personality are influenced by public communications, since by changing the multiple mini-roles, they can remain as players who attract the interest of others, while those who like the public space, manage this game accurately to remain in the realm common opinions or cultural and social. On this point, we can refer to Erving Goffman's4 anthropological approach on roles that people play. Namely, he considers that people perform different roles in social situations; with

---

4 Goffman, sociologist and anthropologist, among others created the term "total institution," being it one of the first sociological examination of the position of the mental patients in the psychiatric hospitals and understanding of the social aspects of mental patients (see: Weinstein R. (1982). "Goffman's Asylums and the Social Situation of Mental Patients". Orthomolecular psychiatry 11 (N 4): 267–274).
their behavior they provoke the curiosity of the others; they reveal their self-identity as an interactive and dynamic process, meaning that they move along the quest for themselves and the "others" as well as the attributes that they did not have and do not have. Many of such people seek to find those missing attributes, and the good part of the story is that they do not stop questing and insist on that by having the pleasure of tasting "the exclusionary self-delusion." They will find their self-esteem if the authority recognizes their efforts.

To support this opinion we can also refer to Sherry Turkle, who noted that in dealing with the context of the consumption of the media contents each player can create many characters and participate in many games, his self is not only decentralized, but "multiplied." So, it is the space without borders and the opportunities to play in this space with many characters, with many roles, with many dimensions, which are crucial to establishing interpersonal relationships in those communications group, and finally, in global media communications. It is important that these relations work to maintain the influence of the personal role in time and space, and during this dynamic process it is not so important if they are defined as concrete or virtual.

Social media are the most spread agents that have served to reshape the personal identity, because, by playing the roles in an informal and hazy filed, with the prospects of presenting themselves the way they wish to be and not the way they are, individuals begin changing emotionally and consider that they convey this change to their interlocutors, including those who they have never know nor will ever know. Commenting in a broader context on the social networks, Spanish sociologist Manuel Castellas refers to the primary definition of identity, as an identity that shapes out the identity of the other, and is self-sustaining across time and space.

Mass culture personalities closely link their potential which as recognized as a global cultural identity, with the level of acceptance

---

6 Mass culture defines the extent, totality, universalism, and limitlessness, all of them being ingredients of globalism. Media mass culture has been
by others, as an identity more virtual than real, that is, with fluid consistency in time and space. This is also associated with the mass culture, which also involves a lot of virtual spirit. After all, people have always lived in societies which across history were multicultural.7

However, if a more precise definition of multiculturalism is sought, it will be found in Canadian literature, from where it actually derived. This term came across for the first time in Canada, a country with many cultures, including linguistic, with English and French being the most widespread. "Multiculturalism," among other things, means coexistence within a common political society, a fairly large number of cultural groups, which, in principle, wish and are able to maintain their individual identity.8 The deceptions occurs when, for instance, an active user of Facebook or other social networks thinks that, as a result of symbolic communication, he already had become very popular and respected through a profile that paves the way for him to take real action. Making judgments on the basis of virtual relationship has to do with actions that are not consistent with the strength and profile of an Internet user.

A model of this kind of disputable communication involve are the feature stories which may not be written by that specific internet posting them on the social pages. One good example of this can be political candidates seeking post who employ other writers to work as their communicators, by using certain names for personal communication. Creating self-esteem based on such prejudices does not match the judgment of the communicating "friends." Losing real friends and finding virtual ones, wraps up the process of living in the physical loneliness, which also affects one's personal identity. The society of loneliness or associating with the loneliness can be defined as a notion of not being associated, influenced by the use of the

---

7 Joseph Raz, Multiculturalism, Ratio Juris, VOL. 11, nr.3 sep. 1998. f. 194
8 Ibid, p. 197
Internet, even if this has to do with interpersonal communication. There is no dilemma as to what the differences between the physical communication and technological communication are. Avoidance of physical and social interactivity increases loneliness, because despite the fact that technological communicative seems to be quite social, it is not all-embracing because it does not offer all psycho-social dynamic values that a physical, eye-to eye, face-to-face communication offers. This form communication only adds up to the time spent alone.9

The modified, retouched, and artificial identity created in a virtual space is important also because it make it possible for game of the roles in terms of not appearing who we are, but rather how we wish to be seen by the others. It is all about virtual construction of the wishes, namely, a project of being "as much accepted by others as possible." As sociologists and anthropologists have noted, pictures, messages, emails, and different postings "allow us to present ourselves the way we wish we were."10

A man may live in two parallel worlds if he has no identity in the real world, and most likely such people seek to compensate the absence of identity with the virtual world. Democratization of desires and emotions assumed infinite dimension on the internet. Art and popularized culture (not popular) are linked to modernity and post-modernity. "Bad girls" are at the core of many films presenting the "pornography of culture." Does this relate to the emancipation of women; namely, the more a female is emancipate the more they are of stripper cultures.11 Both geography and the content of the communications have created the technology notions and coherent social space, which were studied also by Gustavo S. Mesch. In fact, it is precisely the same and coherent interest that unifies to a great extent the communion subjects. The topics of communication and psycho-physical interests, as well as the social and cultural ones, make

---

10 Sherry Turkle, *Alone Together; Why We Expect More from Technology And Less from Each Other*, New York, 2011, p.160.
these connections belonging to "common" but with divergent goals. Animosities help conversion of personalities, as an experimental option between oneself and those who join the "friendly" community.

The virtual life is mainly created with the intention of being invisible and self-projected, that is, creating a picture for the others, for those who do not know your past, and, of course, your relationship, starting with the actual one, without having an obligation to built it on facts and concrete realities. Summarizing the effects of the information technology in this aspect, in the context of Internet in particular, Sherry Turkle raises concerns and dilemma if the men will be able to cope with this direction led by technology. Technology is leading us to places that we do not want to go. Mass culture is part of the journeying system, and often it is precisely this activity that confirms the dilemma and concern raised by her.

The bid of an artists who wants to become part of the massive cultural areal is not clear, and the journey that he follows will take him there where he did not aim or did not even dream ending up. Until to the middle of the 20th century, a local or national artist could hardly be seen by others in the way he wished to be seen. He had to make conventional steps, going, for instance, to Hollywood, to test himself if there was any chance to become part of the major film system. He was required to perform even physical activities that he hoped were sought there in order to be in contact with public art. This was also the case with the writers, painters, singers, composers. The communication technology, namely, media communication has broken that conventional lack of opportunity, and now the movements and key relations are realized through Internet networks, thus facilitating someone's start of the journey, which, of course, no one is never sure what it will be like.

The aspiration of the people to connect, to communicate, and to share thoughts and ideas, images and figures, wishes and dreams, which for centuries was done mainly through verbal way of

---

12 Ibid, p. 54.
13 Ibid.
communicating and the in writing, has assumed unlimited dimensions. Owing to the connections' opportunities, the people who do not know one another become acquainted and develop ideal relations. No matter how these relations can be, they have changed the human being himself, making it more fragile and more illegal than it has ever in its history. Secrecy is it being made public, yet it continues to remains such, because there is always something unspoken, often essential, while on the other hand, there is glorification and dramatization of the things and facts that are not such, perhaps sometimes non-existent in reality. This is a new personal identity, which is similar in all corners of the globe, having the same stimulus and suppliers: the media, the social networks in particular.

Communication technologies have built small or large spaces; they have equated the rich and the poor, and at the same time have enabled a communicating journey to everyone who had yearned for that. People want to be with each other, but also to be connected with others in different locations. And this is precisely the mass culture relationship created in virtual space by sending messages from a local area.

The fear from this rich technology offer can easily be put into a question by losing the reason in terms of which communicator is the first and which is the second in this world of communications – the one that gives or the one that takes, by changing the roles persistently. The emotional accommodation that technology offers can affect spiritual and psychological tensions, by making one depend on expectations and hopes, of what is not known where it is and if anything that is not completely clear comes up, what is that in fact. Such a communication, for many, is a synonym of Becket's drama "Waiting for Godot," waiting for a protagonist who may come but who may not be alive at all. This means that there is no such as a normal line of social or cultural reception for different categories that enter into communication without having a clear agenda or even when they have an agenda but are not fully aware of its contents, so they not know where it can take at the end. Even in this case, we are dealing with the loss of some personal identity values, and not having
them does not mean replacing them with the others perhaps better ones, but in most of the cases, such communicators remain in a lost and non-existent world and cannot figure out what is false and what is true. Those who understand and know how to guide themselves in these communications can prove that they have a standard and competitive preparation to become involved not only in public interpersonal relationships, but also through the media. But rational people maintain their personal identity; they avoid the possibility of uncontrolled spending of their time and their physical and mental energy. This becomes a norm, although some can keep the situation under control easier, while online communication provides an opportunity of ignoring other people's feelings.\textsuperscript{14}

The multiple forms of communications that technology provide for an increase of alternatives of the conflicts within a personality, especially the consumers who are not prepared to select their quantity and quality. This, of course, adds to the sources of a crisis not only of an individual but also a group or a community. The example of the Arab Spring (2012) when authoritarian regimes were toppled (Tunisia, Libya, Egypt), but also the case of Bosnia (2013) where the young people mobilized through social networks and communication technologies to protest and articulate social demands, show that a substantial indicator, and this is the Internet and with it the social networks cannot now way be ignored.

One of the problems that arise in this relation of public roles, the cultural as well, is related to the unification of a group of individuals without knowing clearly what are those values that distinguish a group and if a person shares has similar values with the other members of the group. Quite often, understanding of the truth may lead to the split between an individual and the group. Betty Friedan\textsuperscript{15}

\textsuperscript{14} Alone Together; \textit{Why We Expect More from Technology And Less from Each Other}, Sherry Turkle, Basic Books, New York, 2011 p. 177.

\textsuperscript{15} Betty Friedan, a leading figure in the women's movement in the United States in 1960s, founded and was elected the first president of the National Organization for Women, which aimed to bring women "into the mainstream of American society now in fully equal partnership with men".
recognizes the distinctiveness in the same affiliation, which allows the survival of the group even if some members do not possess the standard recognition, knowledge and behaviors, which makes them alike.

The media communication of culture may also add to the identity crisis, notwithstanding the fact they provide opportunities for easier and wider forms of expression. But, personal identity crisis can be transmitted and affect the community crisis. A community crisis stimulates more ideologies and options of conflicts in social and cultural relations. These relations are nurtured by "public right" to own the media authority over a subject, including social and physical ones. Culture theories have failed to provide an answer accepted by to this sudden change of the roles, which does not stop, but always involves a process of regrouping, even when society that has overcome the formal threshold, known commonly as a mosaic of peace and media-cultural iconographic. An explanation should be sought in the permanent changes that occur in the personal identity. Cultural patterns vary and cover one another.

No matter how homogenous the cultural publics may be and how they manifest this homogeneity through symbolism and signs, they are as agreeable as they are presented in relations to other groups. Always, one's identity, that is., a self, will be hidden there, carefully guarded, although the manifestations of this ego do not seem to be ever present in the individual identity in the sense of active collective identity.

In the case of the "public right " there is precisely the misunderstanding that is accommodated in the silent conciliation of the representatives, who are identified occasionally as if they were given by others, in good faith, a position to sacrifice the personal cultural values for the sake of the general cultural interests. Mass culturists benefit from this relationship. The inverted events, their appearance, statements, interviews and decorated imaged impose offer unlimited demands. Artificiality is imposed without respecting

Her ideas about partnership between men and women were published in the book "The Feminine Mystique" (1963)
the reality and the cultural rationale. Emotions get provoked through an image that is more a design than physiology.

**Conclusion**

The roles do not give, but rather receive from the public the unsystemized energy and then give that power mainly to the corporate representatives, who manage acquiring the public. Roles vary because cultural personal identities change as well. In this way, an individual preserves the components of personal values by demonstrating publicly the consistency and lack of homogeneity in the group, the community. Otherwise, if it were fully conciliation between the personal and collective identities, there would be no changes and no shifting of individuals from a collective group to another, in an effort to prove that the source of their movement is exactly the inability to manifest the value and potential of personal identity. The mismatch of desires, personal and collective opportunities, leads to public abstention after detaching from collective affiliation and consciousness, and this inevitably leads, if not to reactions, to shifting of the group's attention.
Bibliography

Anne Mari. *Krijimi i identiteteve kombëtare, Evropa e shek XVIII-XX*, Dukagjini Pejë, 2004


Television and Screening of Literary Work for the Television

Mimoza Doko *
Gazmend Abrashi**

Abstract

The television today has become one of the most powerful means of mass communication, it has become an everyday man's need of our century. It directly affects human's education, ethical and aesthetic formation. As a technical invention of the past century, television can be ranked among the most important communication means. Advantages of the television compared to the radio and newspaper are that it affects the audience more strongly due to the fact that it is a visual-auditory communication mean. Its advantages compared to film and theater are that, unlike those two, the television goes to the audience's homes, and as such, in today's terms and furthermore in perspective it has a larger audience than the cinema and theater considered together.

Not everything broadcasted on the television is related to the artistic work. News, scientific and political conversations, information, have nothing in common with television arts.

Keywords: cinema, screening, literary work, author, television arts.

What do we understand with television arts and do we have the right to use it?

It is known that every artwork is a mirror of the society in which they arise, its social currents, its passions, ideals and feelings, but the relation of art with the life of society is defined by the way of expressive means they use.

* Mimoza Doko, PHD Cand. AAB University, Prishtina, e-mail: mimoza.doko@aab-edu.net
** Gazmend Abrashi, PHD Cand., e-mail: gazmend.abrashi@aab-edu.net
The reality is presented in different ways from: literature, theater and film.

If we follow how the film reflects the reality, we will understand that the film uses all the other arts from which it derives, brings them together in itself and also stands alongside them as a separate art.

Some elements of literature, theater, fine arts, music, become constituent to the film. These components, often contradictory are not located next to each other, but are melted in an organic synthesis to create a new artistic quality, for the creation of the film.

This is the reason why the film is called synthetic art.

Many creators, starting from the producer, screenwriter, operator, composer, actors, etc, not forgetting technical and economic coworkers participate in the creation of a cinematographic work. Thus, unlike other arts, the film is a collective (group) art.

The television, too, contains in itself all those opportunities and eloquence that the film has.

Artistic television at its core, has common elements with the cinema and somewhat less with the theater.

The television is similar to cinematography, which in contrast to the first, is based on the principles of fixation and reproduction of reality through optical-chemical-kinetic systems. The television borrows from the cinematographic art more than any other kind of art, yet the television on its' way is experiencing a rapid development of its means of expression, is crystalizing its specific features, trying to build its own image, and gradually it is establishing its own aesthetic principles which should be recognized and adopted so that this new art and perspective is further developed.

Cinematography and television operate with the movable image on the screen combined with voice. There are two main differences between them: screen size and mode of perception or vision. Yet even these two features are sufficient to give television the right to have its own language.

Even by the structure of the artistic image, they orbit each other.

So, they are not far apart even from the view of the functions they perform, although "the small screen" becoming the guest of each household has an incomparable advantage with the one of the hall.
Television connects with many visible and invisible fibers of the radio as well, in terms of transmission, communication.

Then the question arises: What is television? Is it perhaps an amalgam of cinematography with the radio?

Even though it has absorbed the best qualities from them, specifically for this reason, it is larger then them together, thus, simultaneously is an art and journalism.

Television equips them with "the citizenship passport" to all kinds of artistic and journalistic creativity.

The word "television" which means looking from the distance, gives priority to the figure. His main speaker, the means by which operates is the appearance, figure and not the word, as is radio. Herein lies its great advantage in comparison with other types of art and journalism, then a picture is worth more than tens of thousands of words.

The technique of the television, in its every step has had a contemporary support from science and technology, introducing and implementing the updates they brought into continuous production and perfection up to the use of color television.

Color television brings not only new technical quality, but also artistic quality too.

The television has its own language, the more and profound known by the executor, as well as from the audience, the greater its effect will be.¹

What we call and what we include in screening is an aesthetic problem, the right choice of which depends on the basic definition of the relationship between literature and cinema, as separate and independent arts.

“The screening of a literary work is a cinematographic form of art, in which the author, by not standing outside the framework of the literary work, recreates it with the language of film, with its expressive means, aiming to provide on the screen the pathos of the

original, its artistic core as profound and poetic”. ² Within this definition, the screening is rightfully called a cinematographic form of art and outlines its means of expression. It also requires the literary source and spirit.

Indeed, the screening too, as a form of independent art has the language of this art, it is the form of cinematography and literature, and consequently, the film-screening cannot be called even a visual version of a literary work.

Why do we do screening?

Why does the art of cinema addresses to literature? Why is there a need for it?

Firstly, because cinema and literature are arts, and as such, both are subject to the general law of interaction and mutual influence. In the way of formation and its development, in particular the cinema would take from centuries' experience of the arts, especially from the art of the word.

Secondly, screening brings back to the spectator the wealth of literature and it multiplies this powerful, social and cultural factor.

In the case of screening, literary work becomes a mean to nourish and enrich the cinematography with ideas, artistic concepts, life problems, subjects, conflicts and characters. Today screening is necessary, because novels help to enrich the content of films in order to develop spectators' preferences. Screening brings certain social interests in certain historical moments, because in literary work's ideas, thoughts and feelings that find the echo are explored. The relevance of ideas determines the choice of the literary work by the filmmaker.

Screening of the literary work for the television, from the beginning until final realization, contains in itself many stages and work processes, proper implementation of which is determinant for successful implementation of the act.

Screening of a literary work or its adoption is not an internal problem of the screenplay or drama; it touches all elements of film and television creativity.

Screening, borrowing or adapting material represents almost half of the world’s production of film and television.

In criticizing the choice of literary work, for its adaptation for television, specific features of television should be taken into account, i.e. real possibility of its adaptation for television, creation of a new artistic quality with its audio-visual possibilities.

The scriptwriter or the producer in the work on writing literary screenplay should consider to adhere the ideas and main thoughts that cross literary work by eliminating those insignificant moments that do not affect the entirety of the work. Initiated by this basic idea, we should not move to the other extreme in order to screen print an artwork by standing to its points, simply turning into illustrators of the artwork. Dramaturgy and the producer must stay at work and act it.

Thus, turning of a literary work is not merely a mechanical process, even if the techniques and specificity of this adaptation are recognized, however, beyond all, it requires deep knowledge of the era in which events, historical and categorical reports are developing.

Knowledge and proper comprehension of these factors is a main prerequisite for writing the successful literary screenplay.3

Today, screenings of literary works are among the most popular genres in the world, but they have started relatively late on transmitting first artworks.

First broadcasting of television plays has been produced in England in 1936. The first drama played was "The Man with the Flower in His Mouth" by Pirandello".

The actors were forced to play in front of the cameras in a very serious light and with a makeup that today would be ridiculous for anyone. The actors of television studios at the time were forced under very difficult conditions of scenes and filming, subjected to numerous not suitable tests in the studio. Noses and lips of the actors were

painted with blue colour, and cheeks with green colour. This was done in order to strengthen the contrast of the image.

Later, the television by technical improvement of broadcasting brought in a significant improvement of programs. In addition to films and spectacles, different sequences filmed directly from stages started to be broadcasted. These can be called infant stages and initial steps towards the path of the original screenings.

Only after World War II, drama started to be processed for the small screen, and then from the mid 50's started the television screening of the great genres such as novels.

The success of these screenings is that the adaptation of a television series is much closer to the artwork compared to the cinematic version. It shows the manifold aspects of human life, it manages to preserve the style of authors and to hook millions of spectators in front of the small TV screen through divided series just like the divided chapters of the novel.4

The television artistic movie has its similarities and peculiarities in comparison to the cinematographic one. It often happens for a literary work to be screened, therefore, a screenplay is constructed on the grounds of a literary work.

The structural construction between the two scenarios of the television movie and cinematographic one has no difference. While the differences between these two types of films are those derived from their specifications:

- The television film prefers cutting plans and massive scenes.
- Prefers working with relatively close plans.
- Prefers working particularly with portrait.
- Construction of interiors in relatively close plans, summarized.5

This happens due to the television movie focusing its greatest attention to the dialogue that takes much advantage, knowing that psychological situations are characteristic for the television movie.

4 Same, p. 11.
Television movie prefers the narrative work, while the cinematographic one does not, as it gives more priority to the action.

To screenprint, primarily means to obtain artistic content, and then to find the film equivalent of the literary work, to transplant the vital subject of one art to another but with other artistic means.

The creation of the imagination that basically fits with that of the literary work, is essential for the screenings. Here we are dealing with two characteristics:

First, when the film is produced on a motif, line or such of the novel, story etc., by generally standing loyal to their performance, and

Second, when the film is produced from scratch, so to say, so, when it is reconstructed by getting the original form.

Both these types of screenings are effective, if only they are embedded clearly and well.

There are three remaining ways of screening of a literary work:

The easiest way is the transmission of the work, while staying loyal to it at all events, episodes, characters and expressive ways. This never brings birth of a cinematographic work with new and deeper emotions. The television film can do this better due to the unlimited time available, therefore it doesn't miss anything from the literary work.

The second path is that of the cinematographic transplant of the literary work, even though they may lose some new film values, due to its condensation of events and actions, its realistic incarnation and its better complete dramaturgical combinations, events become more dramatic, the characters become more reliable and emotions felt are deeper. This way is more frequent in our cinematography and has been successful.

Third path is the complete transformation of the literary work, seeing it with new eyes of the cinematic author.6

Literature can nourish the film in a dual way, in one side with its artistic experience, and with the concrete stuff of literary works in the other, that can serve as a direct source for the creation of

---

cinematographic works. To take advantage of this food, filmmakers should know deeply the literature and its authors, their style and individuality. Only then, they may know what they have to study and learn to one writer and what to the other.

At Dritëro Agolli, we will learn truthfully the description of original events, through which flows a colourful life, the spirit of our people, creation of vivid characters with strong characters, witty satire, etc.

The work of D.Agolli is given to screening more easily; it is quite visual, filled with concrete actions, dramatic situations, susceptible and individualized characters.

At Ismail Kadare, filmmaker can learn from the dynamics of the events, from the originality of topic capture, and the way of the entire artistic conception.

Ismail Kadare is a difficult writer for the large screen, as it handles more the literary figures than concrete actions and suits well the requirements of the small screen.

In order to screenprint Kadare’s work, it is needed to turn back to the basis of detailed material and should reorganize it so that important ideas are broken down into concrete images, and for powerful literary figures to find the cinematic element.7

On the other hand more than the scene, television can take over the screening of the drama of modern and classical, national and world repertoire for tens and thousands of spectators. The dramas go greatly to the small screen.

Television is giving to the theatre scene a new auditorium, thousands of times greater than the biggest room can take, and thus the positive attempts are done in terms of transmitting the emotions and complete values of work on the screen.

A path followed for the transmission of drama in television is their screening, just like the spectator sees it in the hall, even without

7 Same, p. 15.
putting hands on them. While in some cases we have their genuine screening turning drama in a real scenario for the TV film. Even here we have the same route and principles to be followed for other literary genres as well. Both genres are very close to each other, since both are auditory visual genres; but what's the difference between them? To this, we must distinguish features and peculiarities of each gender. Just like the film, drama has its dramatic development, its defining scene, its peak, and conclusion. Changes that distinguish it from the film are that the entire conflict in a drama takes place in a limited time, so there is no extension in time and space, the development of the drama is limited to the brooding and scenes, which cannot help for the specifics of theatre, to create breathing.

With regard to interpretation, the actor is obliged to perform in such a way that, to be followed by all the spectators as those who are at the top of the hall, and those to the bottom of it. Theatre lacks the ability to give different psychological situations of the characters in that possibility that cinematography gives, which uses simple tools, but that perform their function with great effect.

TV series have some greater expressive opportunities than cinematographic film. It provides a way to give life in its entire Epictetus. There are variations of environments, characters, events and situations. At this point of view, the serial approaches many-faceted novel.

This large extension of the serial film in space and time opens some problems, both for literary screenplay writing, and for its realization. Preservation of the unity of artistic work remains a key. It is necessary to maintain with consistency the dramatic curvature of the work and each character's progress. Each series of the film should stand as a separate work, but also merged in its entirety. They should be on the upswing and preserve the emotional load.

Screenings can be done with the cognitive and promotional effect of our literary works, especially from the small screen, presenting them to the full range of the multidimensional lines of action and events.

Therefore, we have what screen, starting from the novels, popular poems, series of selected works, stories that are very comfortable for
the large screen, etc. The wealth of our literature is great, where our film has found in the past, finds and will find an inexhaustible fount of motives, ideas, subjects and aesthetic values.

Our television audience through the small screen have watched a lot of television films, productions of different broadcasters from around the world. Television series quickly became the preferred types of film, however, speculation began over it. Today for a film title, series go into hundreds and there is another case that may seem surprising when their number reaches four digits. Actors of these series are introduced as young, and with the continuation of the film for years, they grow old along with the character. The impact of literature on screen is an organic part of the natural process of historical development of art. It was 'lectured' especially with the affirmation of scenario as a separate literary genre.

Both drama and comedy in theatre are written to be staged and scenario is written to be realized on the screen.

Albanian literature has an endless and inexhaustible wealth of themes and subjects that could serve for accomplished screenings and at a good level. It is a good basis for this, a source with great 'flow' letting to affirm, that at present it is not used much and as needed by our filmmakers, and much more by Albanian TV film makers and implementers. Our literary works of all genders are and remain one of the most efficient ways for the thematic and the problematic enrichment of our film.

The accomplished artistic level of literary leads to accomplished levels in other areas of art, including here the cinematography and television in particular.

High quality is achieved by creators having multilateral interests, and great passion. In every work it seems to be clearly stated the philosophical thought and message. Without this, the works become ordinary, without this, any form, of any style cannot escape.

With courage, creative fantasy and professional competence, filmmakers should address to literary sources, but this cannot be achieved without knowing those very well, without being immersed in the depths of our best traditions, in the creativity of our great masters of pen: N.Frashëri, Çajupi, Migjeni, Noli, Kadare, Agolli etc.
In its width and with the real sizes of life also provided in the literary work, the TV series can and should operate.

Screening of the novel is one of the best bases, where creators need to pay more attention to this literary genre, which does not have the right place on our screens yet. Implementers of the TV series may struggle for more varied forms and foundations, which often arise from these literary works.

The great thematic wealth of our literature, allows besides the film with the original scenario to further development of screenings, an area with more interest in television.

Our television viewers being at the same time consumer readers of literary works will thus find, in the small screen of their houses characters they loved and encountered in the pages of books, those major events in the history of the nation, which the pen of our writers has brought vivid in literature. Thus, those vivid and other values of our literary would be brought by the warm interpretation to a camera that has already gained a kind of 'TV' communication experience with the audience.

This indicates that television has unlimited possibilities to perfect, even more its expressive means and capabilities in the future.

It should not be ignored the fact that television artwork is viewed at home by a limited circle of people, who do not have the spiritual preparation that the cinema or theatre viewer has, to watch the artistic work. This should be imposed to it only if we serve a work with a high artistic level and interpretation that responds to the specifics of the screen.

Considering that the size of the TV screen is smaller than that of the cinema, it would be appropriate the more frequent use of the torso and detail plans, but in this case in no way should we forget the legality of editing and moving on to the extreme by using only detail plans because the logic of the storytelling would be lost.

Television, here, is born and being developed vigorously. The achievements so far are optimistic, but there is still more to do.

At the conclusion, we may say that generally the artistic and television film in particular, has made progress in terms of visual solutions thanks to greater creative freedom than ever before, as well
as collaboration with foreign producers with technical abilities and better developed technology. The main thing is that the Albanian film did not end. Albanian cinema continues to have its own creators, to create its own complete system that the constituent elements necessary to be a "system" not to remain on paper, but become reality in the number of films, in a variety of genres and styles, and primarily, in national values and traits, to be full estimable, both domestically and in the integration of European and world culture.

**Bibliography**

The audience measurement in Albania – Efforts to institutionalize the process

Ervin Goci*  

Abstract  

The media market is overloaded; the new operators sign their name as competitors for advertising space, and the need to improve the quality for the media communication campaign is growing; but, paradoxically the media operators have left the audience measurement - the only criteria who can regulate this market - out of attention. Only well-educated persons, with an affinity for technology, which are very keen to the development of this specific market, are trying to make sense and just not to leave it as a niche reality. In this article we will try to explain why the media operators are not embracing this new reality, boosting informality in the sector, with bad consequences for the quality of the media programming schedule offer. What are the real reasons, and the balances broken out from the implementing of the new rules in the market? The problems seem to be systemic, and in this way they should be sorted out.

Keywords: media planning, electronic measurement, advertising agencies, measurement agencies, tv programming, ratings.

The monolithic overview of the Albanian media up to the '90s would not permit us to display any arguments that are related with to decentralized space of the media today. While the property was centralized, the market's rules were meaningless in a planned economy that was centred in the hand of the state. The audience could not be envisioned in accordance to an economic dimension, because it was not a determining factor in the economic thrift of the media. Actually, the concept itself was to be questioned since the media was

* Ervin Goci, PhD Cand., Lecturer at University of Tirana, email: ervingoci.ut@gmail.com

Thesis, no.2, 2014  75
only a transmitting "tube" of the state's bureaucracy. It was more seen as a transmitter of cultural substances culturally and ideologically correct.

The discussion is too complex to be assessed as a whole. Nonetheless, it is important to state that neither the media, nor the audience were fully integrated in the market's logistics. As a consequence of this, the media did not depend on the audience and vice versa.

With the decentralization of the property and the integration of the media in the market's logistics, everything was over-thrown since the media had now multiple actors, which were becoming competitors. The profitability of the media as a business, became the colony of its well-functioning; from an autonomous closed system, the media actors started depending on external factors. Economically, they needed outer financial resources, which in turn are translated in advertising spaces for businesses which want to be known to the public's eye. Advertisement is the media core in any given situation, in any time, it is the sole and the only one that guarantees continuity, which means, in turn, that the media must attract the interested subject and offer a very favorable schedule to the potential customers.

**The Paradox**

The growing number of TV stations and broadcasting platforms in the market is in need of more sophisticated schedules for the advertisement planning. On the other hand, the growing complexity of the procedures and the cost calculation of television time in the ads broadcasting is in need of a higher level of responsibility and professionalism of the actors of this market. Of course, these dynamics lead to the unification of measuring procedures and to the meticulous depiction of the latter. The purpose for this is to increase the variety of the offers and to attract the advertisers.

Never before, the credible and easily readable data on TV audience have been more important than today. In the market of the Albanian advertisement industry, it regulates:

- the basic unit of ads scheduling;
the drafting of the structure of TV's programming; and
the selling of TV time to the advertisers.

Even though, as we will see later on, the measurements have not been continuous, thus, they have not given us a clear picture of the media market, it is surprising that we have a growing number of channels, which are dismembering the market that is already shrunk as a result of the lowered expenditures after the 2011 crises. In short, the media itself that is supposed to revive the market, is threatening itself and the market in general by demanding an advertisement space for the same actors that have already spent money for the ads. We can safely say that the channels' number is in disproportion, and in the absence of an economic logistics, new channels continue to be created.

A. Two words on the measuring system of TV audience.

The measuring system of TV Audience or TAM (Television Audience Measurement) is a specialized branch in the field of the media market's study. Its purpose is to evaluate the quantity (quantification) and quality of the detailed data regarding the viewing of TV programs and the commercial interruptions during the airing of the TV programs.

The TAM service is a key tool in the organizing and managing of every field covered by the advertising industry overall, and the TV broadcasting in particular. For this reason the QUALITY of this data is the most important parameter for the audience evaluation and measurement.

The data for the TV viewership (audience) are used mainly by TV operators to:

---

1 Look at the table below which indicates the decreased expenditures in ads for the 2011 in comparison with 2010.
2 The domination of the mobile industry in the Albanian media advertising space, is detailed in this article: Goci, E (2010) The Dynamics in scheduling the programming of visual media, FHPH.UT edition, pp 199-206 - Conference of the Journalism and Communication Department, "The Albanian Media in Transition".

---
evaluate the success of the program they produce or buy;
help them in the decision-making regarding future program investments
help them in planning a more efficient schedule and the adequate commercial time.

In the case of commercial televisions, whose business model is based on profiting from the commercials, the high quality data regarding the audience is vital in order to determine the price (cost) and the selling of their commercial time while broadcasting. TV channels need the TAM data to draw the programming and plan their broadcasting strategies and marketing to sell their commercial time to the companies and businesses interested to advertise on TV.

The below data indicate the absolute dominion of television in comparison with other media regarding the advertising. Printing has experienced an increase up to 2008, and then a significant decrease because of known dynamics, internet also is registered for the first time as a factor in 2007. For this is sufficient to see that the money spent on advertising have at least doubled since 2006, meanwhile the television weight is still dominant. In 2012-2013, we can see (tab 3) that ad market only expand, the TV continues to dominate, but radio and especially the print media show sharp difficulties to maintain the trend of other media, losing terrain in the advertising battle. We can also see that “Telecommunications” (tab.3-tab.4) are the main players - (payers), with “Vodafone”, and Eagle”, that continue the struggle to dominate the ad-market, trying to play a leadership role, but as i marked in an observation done in 2010-2011, AdEx, means nothing when we confront them with the figures of market share (SoM).3

---

The audience measurement in Albania – Efforts to institutionalize the process

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Authors’ Estimates*</th>
<th>2006</th>
<th>2007</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010 Projection</th>
<th>2011 Projection</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Media</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Television</td>
<td>78.20%</td>
<td>63.60%</td>
<td>63.80%</td>
<td>68.70%</td>
<td>65.40%</td>
<td>66.80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio</td>
<td>1.20%</td>
<td>1.40%</td>
<td>1.40%</td>
<td>1.30%</td>
<td>1.40%</td>
<td>1.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Print</td>
<td>5.80%</td>
<td>20.10%</td>
<td>17.80%</td>
<td>8.50%</td>
<td>10.70%</td>
<td>8.50%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outdoor</td>
<td>14.30%</td>
<td>15.60%</td>
<td>17.40%</td>
<td>21.80%</td>
<td>20.80%</td>
<td>22.42%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cinema</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>Na</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internet</td>
<td>na</td>
<td>0.50%</td>
<td>0.80%</td>
<td>1.10%</td>
<td>0.90%</td>
<td>0.90%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Ad Market</strong></td>
<td>29,095,235</td>
<td>51,955,777</td>
<td>48,000,000</td>
<td>64,124,830</td>
<td>69,210,740</td>
<td>66,540,440</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab 1.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Total Media Ad Spend during 2013 vs 2012</th>
<th>2012</th>
<th>2013</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Mil - Lek</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TV</td>
<td>101,821,711</td>
<td>136,933,236</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio</td>
<td>1,367,288</td>
<td>1,322,913</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Print</td>
<td>7,236,715</td>
<td>6,640,760</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OOH</td>
<td>8,001,408</td>
<td>9,105,785</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Web</td>
<td>716,085</td>
<td>974,952</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Tab 2. Resource: Abacus Research

Likewise, even the advertisers or the companies that have ordered the commercials in the TV channels, also their advertising agencies, are in dire need of the TAM data in order to evaluate and maximise the effectiveness of their marketing investment in buying the commercial space on TV and the distribution of commercial budgets in different media.

The data on audience viewership are used by companies/institutions that spend on the commercial to plan and charge their respective advertisement campaigns and buy the commercial time of the broadcasting of these campaigns on TV.

The advertisement expenditures are topped by the telecommunications companies that cover more than 70% of the expenditures.
### Tab 3. of 2010-2011

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Company</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eagle Mobile</td>
<td>780,930,784</td>
<td>754,441,020</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vodafone</td>
<td>681,055,555</td>
<td>700,154,363</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMC</td>
<td>647,520,345</td>
<td>559,685,742</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plus</td>
<td>144,781</td>
<td>376,373,336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TOTAL</td>
<td>2,109,651,465</td>
<td>2,390,654,461</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Company</th>
<th>2010</th>
<th>2011</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Eagle Mobile</td>
<td>37.02%</td>
<td>31.56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vodafone</td>
<td>32.28%</td>
<td>29.29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMC</td>
<td>30.69%</td>
<td>23.41%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Plus</td>
<td>0.01%</td>
<td>15.74%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

SoV (share of voice) lek

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Exp. (lek)</th>
<th>Exp. (lek)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

**Resource: Abacus Research**

### Tab 4. of 2012-2013

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Q4 2012</th>
<th>Advertiser</th>
<th>Total</th>
<th>Q4 2013</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Vodafone</td>
<td>469,579,791</td>
<td>Vodafone</td>
<td>721,164,647</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>AMC</td>
<td>260,164,387</td>
<td>Amc</td>
<td>552,361,017</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Albtelecom</td>
<td>179,352,199</td>
<td>Alb Telecom</td>
<td>159,650,700</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Eagle</td>
<td>148,025,466</td>
<td>Eagle</td>
<td>567,304,841</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>lek</td>
<td>Plus</td>
<td>144,419,993</td>
<td>lek</td>
<td>115,627,910</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Resource: Abacus Research**

The expenses that reach a value of over tens of millions Euro, exchange hands based on the information about the audience. Exactly for this reason, it is demanded a high-quality service in the measurement and evaluation of the audience. The evaluation of

---

4 These data are accessible in this article: Goci, Ervin., *The promotion and curation of the image of mobile phone companies in Albania, during 2010-2011*, pp 103-112 (Ed) AA.VV “Integrated Communication - Concepts, Practices, and Strategies”, 2011/4, Department of Journalism and Communication, PHPH Edition, University of Tirana

---
viewership is what guides this kind of business. In other words, the broadcasters need a reliable information about the viewership, in order to take their programming decisions, and at the same time, either the companies/institutions the invest money in commercials, or the broadcasters and advertising companies that negotiate between the aforementioned parties, need a "common currency" in trading the broadcasting time to be more efficient.

Therefore, for the millions spent every year in the programmes and commercials on TV, it is needed an exact information about the audience of the TV, in order to evaluate and maximize the efficiency of this investment.

**B. The Ratings - The common currency of the transactions of commercial time on the television**

In the markets, where you can obtain the data of television viewership, the value, or the level of viewership is defined by the rating data of the audience. In this way, the "rating" becomes the "common currency", through which, the players on the market have the possibility to charge and negotiate the buying and selling of the commercial time on television.

Only if the rating data are reliable and correct, then they can be transformed into the common currency to trade commercial time in television. Therefore, the media-planners and the specialized buyers of time in the media (media-buyers), as well as the marketing specialists in the relevant companies, can evaluate the alternative offers of televisual programmes for the fulfilment of their marketing objectives, whereas, programming and advertising managers in the television channels can evaluate their programmes or station’s popularity. Hence, they can determine how much should they charge for the commercial time during a programme on a certain television.

In order to assure the adoption and the usage of TAM data by all the concerned parties, the system of television audience measurement should be:
a. **reliable**, where, every element of the process of collection, analysis and publication of such data, could be verified through ordained computer systems, or other methods;

b. **independent**, when the provider of this service operates from a position completely neutral, or totally unbiased, and is widely-accepted from all the players on the market;

c. **transparent**, where every element of the system is easily understandable and open, or reachable, by the qualified auditing of all the players interested in these kind of data in the market.

**C. The Structure of the Business**

The everyday practice in the advertising industry and the studies conducted by the experts, reveal that the electronic media constitute the most important sector of the Albanian media market. Even though the continuous professional development, the electronic media has not adopted yet an efficient self-regulating system, because the lack of reliable studies, monitoring, scanning and other continuous methods to collect data about the viewership of electronic media, are still an obstacle for an accurate analysis of Albanian electronic media market.

The number of television channels continues to increase and it can also be said that even the quality is increasing. But without systematic and reliable studies of the viewership, the actual percentage of the market for every channel is still unknown.

The Institute of Survey and Opinions, which has previously tried to measure the TVs viewership (2001-2002-2003 sponsored by IREX-USAID), made a new attempt to study the media audience during 2006-2009, in collaboration with the Croatian company Plus-Strategic Marketing Research. They made use of the following survey method; they kept a one-week diary of 1000 families in all Albania.

---

6 A diary with a two-phased measurement, one in spring and one in autumn, and another one in spring 2010.
Nonetheless, it is still too early to have clear results, since the TV itself and the other actors of the advertising industry, at least the majority of them, have not adopted this technique in measuring the audience as a result of various hiccups that stem from the methodology and measuring instruments of this system.

In addition to the 6 national operators, (4 operators that broadcast with the frequency band UHF and 2 operators broadcast through the satellite platforms. For further details, look the KKRT list of the licensed broadcasters in Albania that is to be found in the Appendix of this document), momentarily there are 68 local TV stations, of which 20 operate in Tirana. The majority of ad expenditures is to be found in Tirana's TV stations, and also in the West Lowland region. These have a better economic performance and programming than the local stations, which find it difficult to survive and produce quality programs. Whereas the media centered in the West Lowland have a greater opportunity to profit from a larger advertisement market, which cannot be said for the media situated in deeper areas.

Also, because of economical difficulties, local TV stations find it difficult to adapt with the technological advancement. Whereas, the majority of the TV stations situated in Tirana have state-of-the-art equipments, local stations continue to make use of outdated equipments, which affect their product.

D. The market's actors interested in the TAM Ratings data:

The typical consumer of the products/services of the viewership ratings data are:

(a) advertisement agencies and media planning, scheduling and/or buying services agencies,

(b) the TV networks and channels, and also

(c) business companies/ organizations, public institutions, local and/or international, that buy TV commercials.

All these actors feel the necessity of having a system for the acquiring and the analysing of the rating data and the measurement of the TV audience. This service will enable these actors to better the marketing performance of their businesses, and, consequently, to
profit as a result of the increase of the sales or the brand recognition by the consumer as a result of the appropriate marketing investments.

Also, this service is addressed even to other governmental institutions, independent ones, researching and academical ones, which have a special interest in comprehending and studying the media market. The information on the audience data obtained by the TAM service can be utilised by the users of these data in order to buy and sell television time, as well as to make better decisions regarding TV programming. Thus, it is converted in a "shared currency" for the transactions between the buyers and sellers of the TV commercial time.7

Without the existence of an independent measuring system as a third party, which adopts higher standards of accuracy and integrity, the television market could not function effectively. For a more accurate managing and to provide maximal transparency, which helps with the acquiring of credibility in the service of measuring the TV audience, the company should also take into consideration the implementation of the recommended "best practices" regarding the activity of measuring the TV audience in other countries which have made use of this service for a long time and refer to the GGTAM instructions edited in 1999 (GGTAM: Global Guidelines for Television Audience Measurement).

E. The attempt to ensure the TAM data for the media Albanian market and the financing of this service

The market study is relatively a new phenomenon in the Albanian media. The autonomous evaluations of the so-called "ratings" were not common practice in the past and all other attempts were demanded by special TVs, and as such, have often been suspicious for

7 For a better understanding of this idea, read the article: Goga, T. (2010). The absent consensus of the measuring of the media’s audience in Albania. The Conference of the Journalism and Communication Department, the Faculty of History and Philology, The University of Tirana, "Albanian Media in Transition".
The audience measurement in Albania – Efforts to institutionalize the process

the credible and fair mechanisms of the evaluation of the press run and audience levels.

CEI - Contemporary Evaluation Institute
In 2001, CEI (Contemporary Evaluation Institute) drafted a project for the measurement of the TV Audience, with its own financing, using the methodology of random surveying through telephone calls, but that was not followed by other efforts, thus not securing contracts with the client media and the market's player.

AMI - Albanian Media Institute
AMI publishes the annual report "Monitoring the Albanian Panorama", published for the first time on April 2001. These editions contain information regarding the media panorama of the country. The whole information published in these editions is based on the data by the owners, publishers and editorial boards of these media outlets, and aims to maintain a database for variable media panorama in Albania. These studies are conducted by the researchers of the Albanian Media Institute, under the supervision of the Journalist’s Dutch School and are supported by the Dutch Agency for the International Development, and also by other international partners.

ISO - The Institution of Surveys and Opinions
IREX ProMedia - an agency in the heart of the USA that supports the media development in Albania - collaborated with the Institution of Surveys and Statistics (ISO - a local statistical organization) to draft an independent survey sponsored by USAID. In it, they used the method of a 28-day diary for 14 inhabited centers of the country. In 2001, ISO adopted Nielsen's diary method for the measurement of the Albanian media audience. Its intention was to offer the so-called "Audience ratings" [the media audience ratings].

---

8 ISO (the Institution of Surveys and Opinions), *The Readability and Viewership of Media-A Statistical Study*, Tirana 2001
He used the 28-day viewership diary to measure the audience behaviour of more than 3000 individuals. Much of the survey dealt with the preferences of the sample viewers in the districts regarding the radio and television stations, national and local.

According to ISO, the sample size was sufficient to gather representative information that would reflect the listeners and viewers' behaviour. Also, the survey contained information on readership of daily newspapers and weekly magazines based on the samples of readers in the districts. The same institution repeated the "rating" survey in 2002 and 2003.

**Pulse/Strategic Marketing Research**

In collaboration with the Croat Company Puls/Strategic Marketing Research, ISO has conducted 5 surveys on measuring the electronic and written media audience starting from October 2006 until June 2008. Also, this company conducted three other studies in May and November 2009 and also in June 2010. The method used was that of interviewing the population (a sample of 1000 individuals that represented the Albanian population) by using a 1-week diary, for obvious reasons, it seems that the Albanian commercial market has not adopted the system of audience data measurements.

**Abacus Research**

In June 2011, the media research company, “Abacus Research”, started the implementation of the project of a continuous electronic measurement of TV viewership. It made use of the measuring technology devices, such as the "people-meter" (STBs – Set-Top-Boxes) installed in some building samples that represent the Albanian population. Initially, the STB mounting project concentrated in the Tirana Municipality. In the first week of November 2012, 265 STBs were installed, by thus totalling a sample of 1007 individuals that

---

9 To open the discussion of implementing the electronic measurement procedure in Albania:
Lela, Alfred., TV audience, “Each its own dues?”, “Mapo” newspaper, 10th July 2013, page 9-19
represented the population 14 and above (14+) of the Tirana Municipality. They were chosen in accordance to the pre-set demographic characteristics of the results and findings of "the establishment survey" of 32,000 households conducted since 2010. Meanwhile, about 250 other STBs are to be mounted in the remaining part of the Albanian territories by covering the West Lowland, Sutary included in the North, and Saranda in the South; eastern and southeastern; as well as the north-east, to achieve a sample of 1,000 individuals (i.e., 2,000 in total, with 1000 in Tirana + 1000 in the remainder part of the territory).

Telemetrix
The “Telemetrix” company, serving for “IDRA Research&Consulting and IdraMedia”\(^{10}\), operates in the Albanian market of audience measuring, electronically measured (TiViMat), since September 2012. Telemetrix runs its activity based on an audience panel composed of 350 families scattered in the six biggest cities in Albania, Tirana, Durres, Elbasan, Shkodra, Fier, Berat. Their intention is to expand with 250 additional families\(^{11}\). As Mr. Ermal Cela (Operational Director of Telemetrix) confirms: the reason why these cities were selected has little to do with the characteristics of Albanian audience behaviour\(^{12}\), which in relation with the media it shows no difference between the country and city. This justifies also the uniformity of the panel, mainly in the urban centres. Furthermore, 80% of the consuming force is concentrated in these cities. Telemetrix offers data

---

\(^{10}\) IDRA Research and Consulting and IdraMedia, operates in albanian market since more than ten years, with a lot of services, including: market studies, media research, monitoring advertising (AdEx – Advertising Expenditures), and media audience measuring, “Telemetrix”. IDRA is member of the European Association of Opinion and Marketing Research Professionals (ESOMAR).


\(^{12}\) Data, regarding to the characteristics of albaniand audience, were provided from “Establishment Survey”, provided by IDRA, with a sample of 3000 peoples, spanned in the Albanian territory.
processed by computer programs and updated three times per minute for 45 UHF/VHF analogue, digital cable and satellite channels.

A peculiarity of this little specified market is that the media is not the one who once embraced it, but quite the opposite; it was the business, mainly the advertisement agencies, which acted as a moderator in the building relation between business and media. Mr. Ermal Cela notified me that not long ago, after two years of negotiations, the first contract is signed with a media, namely Channel “News 24”, which shows an innovation in this market.

It became a costume that the media “Anchorman” acquired the data for their interest, but up to date, no media have shown interest in having continues data for the entirety of the programs they offer. The clients of “Telemetrix” are the following:

Vodafone Albania, Mccann Erickson Tirana, LeSpot Group, AGNA Group, ProMedia, Ogilvy & Mathers, NewMoment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AMI</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institute for conteporary Research</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Isolffrex usaid</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Puls.SMMRI</td>
<td></td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abacus</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Telemetrix</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>✓</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

F. The Advertisement Industry

The main reason for the CEO and marketing specialists to acquire these data regarding the performance and TV audience ratings in the market is to enhance and remunerate their business practices in marketing and advertisement planning, thus, making successful decisions in designing cost-efficient media-plans, and as a result, that will increase their companies' profits.

In general, market viewership data (TAM Ratings) is composed of three large groups of actors, who base their activity, the buying and selling of TV commercial time, on the viewership data:
1. Television and Media Groups
   a. Determining the Financial Value of TV Commercial Time. Through the TAM ratings Data (or viewership), TVs and media companies have the opportunity to determine the monetary value of the time at their disposal to air the advertisement. (The same concept and media measuring methodology is adopted also for the selling of the advertisement space/surface in the print media, although this is not the object of this document). This is also their main obligation in the marketing department and TV selling, as well as in their financial departments.
   b. Program’s Quality and the Predominance on the Competition, TV programming departments are extremely interested in the viewership data of their programs. The clear objective of this is to build a successful programming structure that would help them win the audience battle against other competitor televisions in the market.

2. Advertising agencies and specialised agencies in buying TV Commercial Time (Media Agencies)
   TAM ratings data are the fundamental information, where media services departments within the advertising agencies and specialized ones, base all their activity when buying commercial time to:
   a. draft media-plans for the expenditures and distribution of their clients' budget for various commercial campaigns on television.
   b. process the reports on the media market and marketing study.
   c. make Pre- and post-Buy analyses (which evaluate the possibility of success or failure of the proposed and executed commercial campaigns by the advertising agencies for their business clients) and a number of other activities these business operators have to offer.
3. **Big and/or medium business companies**

a. The latest developments in the advertisement market, especially in the telecommunication market, where except the two first mobile operators, AMC and Vodafone, two other operators were added, Eagle Mobile and Plus Communication, and in the financial/banking market, where it is noted a significant increase in commercial spending of the banks operating in the Albanian market, also, the strengthening of the retail market with the introduction of important actors, as well as the automobile selling companies, the adaptation of the audience measuring data of the advertising industry is now a necessity.

b. Aside from the significant increase in the advertisement budget, now it is demanded that the media performance of the invested ads ought to be able to afford sophisticated rival marketing techniques.

Investors and/or entrepreneurial organizations in strategic sectors, local and international public institutions greatly interested in the media researching field, study periodically the measuring of opinion, thought, taste, preference, won’t and behaviour of the public or consumer. These studies are very important in studying the market, though they are not real time audience measuring or other forms of it. The financial weight of this study is dominant when in comparison with the audience measuring.

**Issues for debate**

The market study is in its first steps, but there is a significant increase in institutionalising this evaluating instrument with ongoing studies. An integral part of these projects is also the evaluation of preferences, behaviour and won’t of the media, though there lacks a continuous measuring of the latter. What could be the possible reasons?

Firstly, the financial hiccups - how to understand this?

In general, the market expert report that in the stabilised markets, about 2-4% of the volume in the advertisement market, normally goes
for market research in all its plenitude, including the service of the audience measuring. The question is: Has our market developed enough volume so that the sum derived from its growth can suffice to guarantee the progress of the service in the continuing of the audience measuring? So, what we are trying to say is: are there enough money in the communication and advertisement market in order to front the financing of such a service?

Secondly, it requires a common will of the actors directly involved in this market, initially to agree on the importance of continuous measurement, and to create the measuring metrix, as a unifying language, and also to agree on the sharing of the cost, managed by a self-regulated institution of this market. (media, advertising agencies + advertisers) + regulators.

**Resources, human and professional capacities**

A third reason, apparently unimportant, but which has a great significance, deals with human and professional resources to implement this new reality, which is not only technological, but, first of all, educational, it demands professional knowledge, scientific mentality and ought to be expanded into all media, not only measuring agencies.

A common communication register between interested actors, so that everything can be scientifically explained, in all fairness.

**Psycho-social environment**

Fourthly, we must not forget that in this universe, as everywhere else, we deal with a psychological relationship between people. There are instances of fear, uncertainties, dynamics that affect this universe. In many cases, human relationships are based on giving verdicts and on psychological customs acquired by experience.
In a study of the media research centre "Forrester" 13, with the media marketing departments, agencies and businesses, it was noticed that one of the biggest obstacles in reforming the marketing modality where the customs established in the working environment.

In conclusion, we can safely say that all the above-mentioned actors are important indicators that require a scientific research, as quantitative as well as qualitative, so that we can base a discourse on the possible future scenarios in the market development of the audience measuring in particular and the media space as a whole.

**Bibliography/Webliography**

1. Abacus Research., Media Know How, Methodology Guideline, Tirana 2012
   www.abacus.al
   The Conference of the Journalism Department, the Faculty of History and Philology, The University of Tirana, "Albanian Media in Transition".
5. Goci, Ervin., The promotion and curation of the image of mobile phone companies in Albania, during 2010-2011, - (Ed) - In “Integrated Communication - Concepts, Practices, and Strategies”, 2011/4, pp 103-

13 International research centre on marketing and on the technology effect on the public
112 , The Conference of the Journalism and Communication Department - University of Tirana “Integrated Communication” – FHP, UT Edition


8. ISO (Institution of Survey and Opinions), Readership and Media Viewership-Statistical Study, Tirana, October 2001


Abstract

The main purpose of this study was to study the consumer behavior on the loan interest rates in Kosovo. This study is based on the data collected through direct interviews with consumers who have loans from commercial banks in Kosovo. The results obtained show that 98.1% of respondents think that bank in Kosovo offer loans with high interest rates. Results obtained from respondents indicate that 96.1% of them think that it is reasonable that banks reduce/lower interest rates and offer loans with lower interest rates, while another interesting result shows that it is an opinion that banks have agreements among themselves in order to keep this high rate of interest, 49.1% of respondents are of the same opinion. Commercial banks operating in Kosovo have justified these high rates with the high risk of loan return, but 51.7% of respondents do not share the same opinion as banks that the risk of return is the reason for high rates of interest, since commercial banks that operate in Kosovo, stand much better that other Balkan countries in bad loan ranking.

Keywords: Consumer behavior, interest rate, commercial banks

Introduction

Kosovo’s recent history is characterized by transition processes from centralized planning, to market-oriented open economy. Lately, in order to provide more complete information to different industries, consumer market analysis in Kosovo has been a subject of several
research studies.\textsuperscript{1} The economies of many countries of the world do not attribute due importance to the consumer market analysis, although practically this issue deserves special attention\textsuperscript{2}, the consumer is considered as the last but the most important component in the food chain. This is one of the areas that will positively affect the overall balance of the market in Kosovo and in alignment/approximation with the EU market standards and policies. Regarding, consumer market analysis towards different products, numerous authors in their studies\textsuperscript{3} show that there are significant differences of consumer market analysis in different countries. Analysis of consumer markets is defined as a community of action, attitude and decision concerning its use in order to provide income for purchasing goods and services. The mail function of the production – marketing line, represents a serious constrain/limitation for sustainable development of sectors of the economy\textsuperscript{4}.

**Material and method**

The research (sampling) was conducted in Prishtina. This research was conducted in the period of time April – May 2013, and is based on 155 interviews, conducted through direct interviews with bank consumers that have loans from commercial banks in Kosovo. The average duration of an interview was approximately 15 minutes. The market research preceded the drafting and discussion of the questionnaire which contained these key attributes: Interviewee’s residence, interviewee’s gender and age, and also other questions that can be found in research results. The basis of the research was the

\textsuperscript{1} Njazi Bytyqi, “Analysis of consumer Behavior in Regard to the Beef Meat in Kosovo”, ne: Agriculturae Conspectus Scientificus, 2009, f. xy.

\textsuperscript{2} Njazi Bytyqi, “Analysis of consumer Behavior in Regard to the Beef Meat in Kosovo”, ne: Agriculturae Conspectus Scientificus, 2009, f. xy.


collection of data through direct interviews with consumers who have loans from commercial banks in Kosovo. Mainly, the interview is conducted where respondents answered the questions asked by the author. The data were collected by the interviewer and were recorded on the questionnaire. After completion of the interviews, the data were recorded in a data base statistical program SPSS. Also, the whole statistical base will be based on this program (SPSS). Within the work methodology for completing this paper, we have used the method of analysis and comparison.

Results and their discussion

In the following we have presented the data diagram and we have also made comments for each diagram. The results related to consumer opinion regarding the interest rates of commercial banks in Kosovo.

It is thought that for some consumers the time of loan approval is more important than the other factors, since these consumers have an obligation to complete that the time would not wait, but based on the responses of responders we have as following:

![Figure 1: Loan approval time is more important than interest](image)

6.50% of respondents strongly agree, 18.70% of respondents agree, 12.30% of respondents never thought about it when they have taken the loan and do not know the importance of the loan approval time, 47.10% of respondents disagree, and 15.50% of respondents do not fully agree. Based on their answers we can say that the time of approval it is not the key important factor that has an impact on the time factor.
Regarding the information that are important for taking the loan, before deciding to take the loan are introduced in Figure 2, from which we can distinguish the consumers high level of perception with 77.4% as contributing factors upon getting information when deciding to take a loan, then consumers impacted by period of loan payment/return 9.7%, while about application procedures (4.5%), collateral (2.6%) also did not produce any important result, proceeded by taking mortgage (1.9%) from the bank when they decide to take a loan with a small affect/impact of the perception importance, while in 3.2% consist of other impact factors.

![Figure 2: Consumers' perception regarding the interest of obtaining loan information before deciding to take the loan/credit.](image)

From these data, extracted from the Figure, it can be said that it does not mean the financial part should be of interest only to an Economist, when it is known that the interest rate it has a direct impact in the incomes of the customer that takes a loan, therefore over 77% of respondent's concern on interest rates (interest) than other procedures.

Considering that in Kosovo, the need to take a loan is too big, and this is proved by CBK where the overall value of loans issued/granted by the banking system in Kosovo, in June 2012, reached to 1.77 billion Euro.
Many of Kosovo citizens the only way to improve their living standard is to take a loan, while seeing this high interest of citizens, banks that operate in Kosovo did not lower interest rates, but they continued and still continuing to offer loans with high interest rates, 83.30% of respondents strongly agree on this, 14.84% only agree, while only 1.93% disagree. 96.13% of respondents agree that banks should lower their interest rates, because high interest rates are not allowing economic entities to expand their activities, and thus to open new jobs, and consequently diminish the level of unemployment and poverty, and this is one of the reasons to lower interest rates.
On this, 76.10% of respondents strongly agree, 20% agree, 1.30% disagree and 2.60% strongly disagree.

Secret agreements that banks do among themselves are differently called as cards. It is very important to know that these kind of agreements, which are in favor of banks by increasing bank benefits, and on the other side harm the consumers. If these agreements are confirmed, such agreements are punishable by law.

Perhaps many consumers are not aware that such agreements do exist, and some of them do not know what is achieved with these agreements, this is best introduced in the results/outcome of the research where 38.70% are not aware of such agreements, while 23.90% of respondents strongly agree, 25.20% agree, 8.40% disagree and 3.90% partially agree.

Despite the global economic crises, the banking system in Kosovo remains stable and sustainable, as well as the loan return is at the satisfactory level. The number of bad loans in Kosovo is the smallest compared with other regional countries. Non-performing loans, which consists of loans classified as doubtful and lost, in June 2012 increased the participation to 6.5 % of overall loans (5.9 % in June
2011\(^5\), while in the region, these were significantly higher, and in the following table we have presented the level of bad loans in the region.

![Graph showing levels of bad loans in various regions.](image)

From the report of KCB

With this we cannot justify the interest, since it is seen that Kosovo has better situation of bad loans compared with countries in the region.

![Bar chart showing interest rates in Kosovo.](image)

**Figura.6: Interest rates in Kosovo are reasonable, risk of return is high.**

From respondents’ answers to the question that the interest rates are higher because the risk of return is higher, 39.4% of responders disagree and 12.3% partially disagree with this. While analyzing the table of bad loans in the region and also knowing the status of bad loans in Kosovo, it can be concluded that consumers are fully right that they think the return risk cannot be one of the key factors that banks can use it as a justification that the risk of return is affecting in lowering the interest rates, we can say this as Kosovo has a better status of bad loans compared to the countries in the region.

Conclusion

As the research is done and as we have the results of the research, we can draw the conclusions about this topic that is elaborated. Based on research that was done for consumers who have or have had loans/credits, we can state that the first thing that the consumers are interested for is the interest rate, since for them that is more important than the time period of loan approval. Above we mentioned some customer categories who have taken a loan and which factors are the key factors that consumers analyze before they take the loan.

Because in our country the demand for personal or family need in order to improve living standards, such as: Construction needs, renovation, education, for car, and so on, such demands are numerous, and to meet these demands/requirements or needs, the only solution for many citizens is by a loan. It is known that in Kosovo banks offer loans with high interest rates, so with this conclusion agreed 98% of our respondents, high interest rates could possibly be justified with risk of return, but responders disagree on this, and they are completely right, because Kosovo has the lowest percentage of bad loans in the region. Interest is one of the factors that directly affects the customer’s budget, and the first thing that they care is the interest rate.

It happens that banks make secret agreements about interest rates, and this action is in the favor of the banks, while for the citizen it is not beneficent, since he is obliged to pay high interest rates, so, all the responders have agreed on this.

In conclusion, we can say that the Kosovo banking institutions play a very important role in the economic life of the citizens of Kosovo.

Recommendation

We recommend that banks operating in Kosovo should lower interest rates, because they are not allowing economic entities to expand their activities, to open new jobs, and consequently diminish the level of
unemployment and poverty, this is only one of the reasons why banks should lower their interest rates.

We recommend that banks operating in Kosovo should offer/provide more favorable products with reasonable interest rates for the agriculture sector, when it is well known that this sector is very important in Kosovo. Commercial banks in Kosovo consistently have shown a conservative approach towards agriculture sector, which is indicated by high interest rates applicable to loans issued/provided for this sector.

Through these recommendations stated above, we think that it would be reasonable that consumers feel comfortable with banks operating in Kosovo.

**Literature**


www.bqk-kos.org

Analysis Paper on Treatment of Trade in Services under the Kosovo-Turkey Free Trade Agreement of Services

Malva Govori*

Abstract

The Government of Kosovo has recently signed an agreement with Turkey on a bilateral Free Trade Agreement in Goods. However, the negotiations in signing a free trade agreement in services are still ongoing. This is the first time since Kosovo became independent in 2008 that the Government of Kosovo has been engaged in trade negotiations, as its so-far single trade agreement, the CEFTA 2006, was negotiated by UNMIK. The absence of experience in trade negotiations in itself creates challenges for the government when negotiating with Turkey on such a complex issue, as service trade liberalization. An additional challenge is created by parallel negotiations with CEFTA partners and the European Union. The purpose of this paper is to provide background information on services trade negotiators with Turkey, in order to formulate an appropriate position for the proposed negotiations. The paper focuses on the regulatory (legal) aspects of possible liberalization measures/commitments by Kosovo and Turkey.

Key words: Trade in Services, Trade Agreement with Turkey, economic impact, liberalization of trade in services, restrictions of trade in services.

Services, trade in services and their role in Kosovo's economy

Services represent the fastest growing sector of the global economy and account for two thirds of global output, one third of global employment and nearly 20 percent of global trade\(^1\).

* Malva Govori, MSc in Economics, Finance and Management, Lecturer at AAB University, Email: malvaaa@gmail.com
In Kosovo, services account for a high share of GDP, owing in large part to donor presence in the country. Services contributed 68 percent to GDP in 2010\(^2\) representing an almost 4 percentage point increase from 2004 when the GDP contribution was 64.3 percent\(^3\). Nathan Associates Inc. (2008) found that the 2004 figure had been already very high compared to values for upper middle-income countries and well above the LMI-EE&CA median of 54.4 percent, Albania’s 55.7 percent, and Macedonia’s 57.7 percent. “This breakdown, however, is a bit misleading given that, on average, 17 percent of GDP between 2002 and 2004 was attributable to UNMIK, inflating services’ contribution to GDP”\(^4\).

Services are predominantly concentrated in retail and wholesale trade, contributing to 9.4 percent to GDP in 2007, while real estate and business services reported together by the Kosovo Agency of Statistics, representing 12.4 percent.\(^5\) Services are the key component of Kosovo’s private sector. Approximately 80 percent of business falls within the tertiary (service) sector, whereas only 2 percent of are registered in the primary sector (agriculture/extraction) and 16 percent in the secondary sector (manufacturing).\(^6\) Service enterprises tend to be very small and mostly family-run. There is vigorous business creation, but most companies do not achieve significant growth.\(^7\)

---

4
6 Id.
7 European Commission, Staff Working Document accompanying the document Commission Communication on a Feasibility Study for a Stabilisation and
The banking sector is estimated to be among the sectors with the best performance in Kosovo’s economy. It is generally stable, deposits and credits to the private sector have been growing, despite the global financial crisis. The value of the banking sector assets and liabilities in Kosovo in September 2011 was EUR 2.63 billion, or around 48% of the country’s GDP. The sector is characterized by a large presence of foreign capital (89.2% of total assets, i.e. six out of eight banks have complete or majority foreign capital). The presence of foreign financial institutions in Kosovo has contributed towards the modernization of the financial system by bringing more advanced practices in finance to managing banking operations. The lending activity of Kosovo’s commercial banks represents one of the main sources of financing for consumption and investments in the country.

The service sector’s estimated share of the labour force increased from 53.5 percent in 2004 to 58.3 percent in 2006, much higher than all comparator benchmarks. The structure of employment by sector in 2007 indicates that the service sector is the largest provider of employment in Kosovo, accounting for 71.3 percent of total employment.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Main Economic Sectors</th>
<th>2005</th>
<th>2007</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Agriculture</td>
<td>18.8</td>
<td>14.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Industry</td>
<td>14.4</td>
<td>14.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Services</td>
<td>66.8</td>
<td>71.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Malva Govori

Within the service sector, wholesale and retail trade as well as education represents the largest sub-sectors in terms of employed labour (respectively 17.4 percent and 13.4 percent).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Economic Activity</th>
<th>Employment %</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Electricity</td>
<td>4.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Construction</td>
<td>7.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Trade</td>
<td>17.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hotels</td>
<td>4.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport</td>
<td>5.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Banking and insurance</td>
<td>2.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business</td>
<td>2.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>13.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>7.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


A comparison of output and employment structures implies that labour productivity is much higher in services than agriculture, but slightly less that in the industry. On this basis, industry and services are the most productive sectors in the economy of Kosovo.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Services</th>
<th>Industry</th>
<th>Agriculture</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Output (% of GDP)</td>
<td>64.3</td>
<td>27.1</td>
<td>8.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour force (% of total labour)</td>
<td>58.3</td>
<td>20.05</td>
<td>21.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output / unit labour</td>
<td>1.102916</td>
<td>1.351621</td>
<td>0.4018692</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In international comparison, services labour productivity in Kosovo is lower than in the lower-middle-income countries in the Eastern Europe and Central Asia, but slightly higher than in the lower-middle-income countries. This is shown in the following table.
Services labour productivity in international comparison

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Kosovo</th>
<th>LMI-EE&amp;CA</th>
<th>LMI</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Output (% of GDP)</td>
<td>64.3</td>
<td>54.4</td>
<td>52.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Labour force (% of total labour)</td>
<td>58.3</td>
<td>42.5</td>
<td>48.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output / unit labour</td>
<td>1.102916</td>
<td>1.28</td>
<td>1.0840164</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

LMI-EE&CA = Lower-middle-income countries in the Eastern Europe and Central Asia
LMI = Lower-middle-income countries

These cross-sectorial and international comparisons of labour productivities have important implications for economic policies, as they are indicators of the sectors that need structural transformations, and in the case of trade policy, they signal the desired directions of trade and investment. The above aggregated figures are nevertheless not sufficient to formulate evidence-based trade policy. For that more detailed – sub-sector level – data would be needed.

Regarding trade in services, overall, Kosovo is a net exporter of services. This is the only sector, where Kosovo has a positive trade balance; however, according to Nathan Associates Inc. (2008), the low contribution of trade in services to GDP is among the weaknesses of Kosovo’s economy. The export of services represents approximately 10 percent of GDP, while imports account for approximately 7.5 percent of GDP. The positive balance mainly reflects increased revenues from the communication and travel services. Service exports have an important potential for faster economic growth. During the next three years, exports of services are expected to grow by 6.5 percent in real terms. The main contributors to this growth are travel services, which mainly depend on visits of diaspora in Kosovo.\(^\text{10}\)

Trade relations between Kosovo and Turkey in the context of services

The purpose of this section would be to provide information to services trade negotiators on the present importance of bilateral trade in services with Turkey. Appropriate information would include data for each sector and sub-sectors mentioned in the WTO classification of services (WTO document MTN.GNS/W/120) per the four GATS Mode (cross-border; consumption abroad; commercial presence; and movement of natural persons). Unfortunately, such data do not exist in Kosovo, not only per trading partners, but at aggregate level either. However, a Trade in Services Database is currently being developed by the EU Trade Policy Project that will bridge this informational gap.

In the absence of appropriate statistics from the Kosovo side, we have investigated Turkish statistics whether data are available for bilateral trade in services with Kosovo. However, it appears that the Turkish Statistical Institute either does not collect statistical data on trade in services per trading partners or they do not publish them. This seems to be confirmed by the fact that neither the WTO Secretariat’s Trade Policy Review Report on Turkey nor any of the volumes of the “OECD Statistics on International Trade in Services - Tables by Partner Country” contains data for Turkey (except for Turkish export data on travel services).

In sum, there exist no data for bilateral trade flows in the area of services. Anecdotal information indicates that most services traded between the two countries are originating in Turkey and provided to Kosovar services consumers mainly through mode 3 (Commercial Presence). By the end of 2011 Turkish foreign direct investment (FDI) stock in Kosovo has reached $1 billion of which a large part is presumed to be in services sectors, led by insurance and banking services and services related to mining.12 Other most notable Turkish

11 Ministry of Economy Turkey, 2012
services are road and airport construction, operation of airport services, and energy distribution. In the area of contracting and consultancy services, Turkish firms held and are holding 4 projects in Kosovo with a total value of 502 million dollars up until now.

In the absence of appropriate statistics on bilateral trade, some general information on Turkey’s service economy as well as aggregate-level data on Turkey’s services trade with the world by service sectors may provide useful information for Kosovo’s FTA negotiators on the partner country’s strengths in the service sector, and in trade in services in particular.

Although agriculture and manufacturing remain important, Turkey has become an economy dominated by services. In terms of the number of people employed, and excluding governmental services, the main sectors are wholesale and retail trade; transport, storage, and communication; real estate, renting, and business activities; construction; architecture; engineering; and hotels and restaurants. The highest value added (per employee) is in electricity, gas, and water supply.

Turkey’s share in global exports of services was 0.92 percent in 2011.

The Balance-of-Payments statistics for services of Turkey is shown in the following table:

---

14 Ministry of Finance Kosovo (2012)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Million $</th>
<th>2008</th>
<th>2009</th>
<th>2010</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>BALANCE ON SERVICES</td>
<td>17.748</td>
<td>17.316</td>
<td>15.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Services Exports</td>
<td>35.564</td>
<td>33.922</td>
<td>34.7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Services Imports</td>
<td>-17.816</td>
<td>-16.606</td>
<td>-19.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Transportation</td>
<td>208</td>
<td>1.840</td>
<td>1.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credit</td>
<td>8.246</td>
<td>8.262</td>
<td>9.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debit</td>
<td>-8.038</td>
<td>-6.422</td>
<td>-8.1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Travel</td>
<td>18.445</td>
<td>17.103</td>
<td>15.9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Credit</td>
<td>21.951</td>
<td>21.250</td>
<td>20.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Debit</td>
<td>-3.506</td>
<td>-4.147</td>
<td>-4.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Construction Services</td>
<td>974</td>
<td>1.090</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Insurance Services</td>
<td>-684</td>
<td>-527</td>
<td>-4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Financial Services</td>
<td>-133</td>
<td>-355</td>
<td>-2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6. Other Business Services</td>
<td>-1.040</td>
<td>-1.286</td>
<td>-1.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7. Government Services</td>
<td>-778</td>
<td>-846</td>
<td>-8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8. Other Services</td>
<td>756</td>
<td>297</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>


Although there has been a dramatic surplus in service trade of Turkey, since 1980s, Turkey has managed to catch up the rest of the world in terms of the service trade growth. Apart from the fact that the service export rates of Turkey in comparison with the world and EU in 1980’s were below 0.5 percent, these figures have substantially increased until the year of 2000 and the increase has become stable after that year.

**Comparative advantages and possible winners and losers of services liberalisation**

As of writing, there exist no statistics that would permit to measure the comparative advantages of Kosovo’s services sector in general or for particular service sub-sectors. The Trade in Services Database referred to above, once available, will provide basic statistics and appropriate proxies that will help determine the sectors and sub-sectors where Kosovo enjoys comparative advantages or suffers comparative disadvantages, and how these comparative...
(dis)advantages might be altered by a Kosovo/Turkey FTA covering trade in services.

Regarding Turkey, its main strengths in the area of trade in services appear to be the following\textsuperscript{16} \textsuperscript{17}:

- **Tourism**: Turkey ranks as the 6\textsuperscript{th} in the world and the 4\textsuperscript{th} in Europe among the most favourite tourism destinations; It is targeting revenue of US$60 billion from 60 million tourist arrivals annually by 2023;

- **Construction services**: Turkey has an estimated 200,000 contractors in the construction sector; Turkey ranks 2\textsuperscript{nd} in the world (following China) in terms of the number of top contracting companies; 31 out of the world’s top 225 contracting companies are Turkish; The sector spans from a large number of small, mostly family-owned businesses to some 150 large contractors working internationally. The construction industry accounts for more than 5 percent of Turkey's GDP directly, but its indirect effects on the economy are thought to be significantly larger; Outside of Turkey, Turkish contractors have undertaken about 6,500 projects for a total value of US$205 billion over the last 40 years. The annual project volume has risen from US$2.4 billion in 2001 and 2002 to exceed US$22 billion every year since 2006. The internationally oriented segment of the Turkish construction industry has become increasingly diversified in terms of markets, products, and business models. In 2010, Turkish contractors undertook 577 projects in 50 countries, ranging from infrastructure projects (roads, bridges, tunnels), residential housing, sports facilities, energy projects, tourism establishments, etc. Geographically, the

\textsuperscript{16} Ministry of Economy of Turkey, “Economic Outlook”, December 2012

\textsuperscript{17} Loc. Cit. World Trade Organization.
Russian Federation, Libya, Turkmenistan, Kazakhstan, and Iraq have been the leading markets, representing around 50% of the business volume;

- **Transportation services:** Turkey has Europe’s biggest truck fleet (45 thousand trucks and 1,420 companies); Turkey’s air transport services (almost 1 million flights in 2011, 2.3 million tonnes freight and 117 million passengers); Turkey’s fleet is the 25th biggest in the world;

**Barriers to trade in services in Kosovo and Turkey**

A FTA with Turkey would need to provide for the Parties’ commitments to eliminate barriers to trade in services, i.e. limitations to Market Access and National Treatment as defined in GATS Articles XVI and XVII. Though Kosovo is not a member of the WTO, Turkey is, so a future bilateral FTA covering services (in the WTO parlance “Economic Integration Agreement”) would need to comply with the minimum requirements of GATS Article V with respect of such agreements.

GATS Article V permits agreements liberalising trade in services between or among the parties to such an agreement, “*provided that such an agreement*¹⁸:

(a) Has substantial sectorial coverage, and

(b) Provides for the absence or elimination of substantially all discrimination, in the sense of Article XVII, between or among the parties, in the sectors covered under subparagraph (a), through:

(i) Elimination of existing discriminatory measures, and/or

(ii) Prohibition of new or more discriminatory measures,

either at the entry into force of that agreement or on the basis of a reasonable time-frame, except for measures permitted under Articles XI, XII, XIV and XIV bis.”

According to a footnote to the text, the condition that the agreement has “substantial sectoral coverage” is “understood in terms of number of sectors, volume of trade affected and modes of supply.

¹⁸ Ibid., pg.
In order to meet this condition, agreements should not provide for the *a priori* exclusion of any mode of supply”. It is clear therefore that a future Kosovo/Turkey Economic Integration Agreement should not necessarily cover all sectors, but should cover a substantive number of them for which discriminatory measures should be abolished in practically all modes of supply.

Beyond agreeing with Turkey on the minimum sectorial scope of the future agreement to comply with this legal requirement of the GATS, Kosovo’s negotiators have to ensure that the negotiations will have fair results, i.e. that the concessions given to Turkey are truly reciprocal and that no restriction remains, discriminatory or not, to Kosovo’s services and service providers on the Turkish market in the sectors to be liberalised. Obviously this will also be the objective of the Turkish side19.

This means that all existing measures (laws, regulations, or any other administrative acts, written or not) limiting Market Access and National Treatment should be identified prior to the start of the negotiations. The identification of such barriers to trade has two main objectives: (1) making a pre-negotiation assessment of the overall situation of both sides’ trade restrictiveness, in general and sector-by-sector, which is important to judge whether it is useful to start the negotiations (if there is a huge imbalance in the starting conditions between the Parties they might not have the same level of interest to negotiate a services FTA. “Which Party will have to make greater sacrifices (bigger concessions) for the sake of the free trade agreement?”); (2) allowing Kosovo’s negotiators to have a clear view of what they might ask, or what is worth to ask, from Turkey.

*Current trading conditions for Turkish services in Kosovo’s market*

Kosovo’s has a very liberal trade regime for services. The legal framework for trade in services allows for a relatively open economy

---

to foreign service providers. In terms of market access, for most services, there are no legal restrictions on foreign firms establishing a commercial presence in Kosovo. Once they are established, foreign-owned firms are subject to the same rules as domestic ones. Foreign-owned local firms are free to determine their ownership structure (allowing up to 100% foreign ownership) and whether they will enter into a joint venture with local or other foreign-owned firms. Within the overall privatisation policy, specific service providers are in the process of being privatised, such as the Post and Telecommunications of Kosovo (PTK).

Some of the most notable restrictions and limitations to trade in services in Kosovo for sector specific are the following:

- **Air transport services**: citizenship requirement for freight transport services;
- **Accounting services in Mode 1**: a foreign provider supplying services from abroad (i.e. in Mode 1) is not allowed to perform tax advice, tax representation or legal advice and representation;
- **Accounting/auditing in Mode 3**: practitioners cannot exercise their profession in limited liability partnership; Mode 3: stand-alone foreign branches are not permitted; unrestricted integration between local and foreign accounting firms is not permitted;
- **Accounting/auditing in Mode 4**: entry is subject to discretionary authorization, even if requirements are met; minimum wage requirements; Labor Market Test applies: a proof from Job Center that no local employee is interested for the job concerned is required; quantitative limitations: the Government of Kosovo sets out the yearly number of foreign workers authorized to work.
- **Architectural services in Mode 3**: stand-alone foreign branches are not permitted; unrestricted integration

\[\text{\textsuperscript{20}}\text{Ibid., pg.}\]
between local and foreign architectural firms is not permitted;

- **Engineering services in Mode 3**: stand-alone foreign branches are not permitted; unrestricted integration between local and foreign engineering firms is not permitted;

- **Legal services in Mode 1**: a domestic resident firm/individual cannot obtain professional services directly from a foreign legal services firm or office located outside Kosovo for the following: legal counsel/advice on matters predominantly regulated by domestic host State law (criminal law); legal counsel/advice on matters predominantly regulated by domestic host State law (civil law); rights of audience or representation of clients before courts in the host country; conveyancing, transferring of title to real estate; probate, wills and regulation of family matter; representation before administrative agencies, including on tax matters; advice and representation on patent law; permanent residency requirement in order to be enlisted in Bar Register. For notaries—Permanent residency and numerical quota; reciprocity requirement (denial of MFN treatment) for mediators;

- **Legal services in Mode 3**: stand-alone foreign branches are not permitted; unrestricted integration between local and foreign law firms is not permitted;

- **Medical and dental services in Mode 1**: Not allowed;

- **Medical and dental services in Mode 3**: Licence for foreign doctors and dentists limited to six (6) months.

- **Medical and dental service in Mode 4**: Licence for foreign doctors and dentists limited to 1 month.

- **Veterinary services in Mode 1**: Not allowed;

- **Veterinary services in Modes 3 and 4**: Licence for foreign veterinary doctors limited to 1 month;
Current trading conditions for Kosovo’s services in the Turkish market

Turkey has made extensive commitments under the WTO General Agreement on Trade in Services (GATS); its schedule covers 72 activities out of a total of 161 in nine sectors. It also became a party to the Interim Agreement on Financial Services in 1995, the 1997 Agreement on Telecommunication Services, and the 1997 Agreement on Financial Services.

In the past decade, Turkey has progressively relaxed restrictions to trade in services in some sectors, notably as far as right of establishment (Mode 3) is concerned. Companies with 100 percent foreign ownership may operate in nearly all sectors of the Turkish economy. All companies established according to the Turkish Commercial Code are regarded as Turkish companies, with equal rights and responsibilities as stated in the Constitution and in other laws. The rights include national treatment, guarantee against expropriation without compensation, transfer of proceeds, the right to expatriate personnel, and access to international arbitration or any other means of dispute settlement. However, today a few services remain closed to FDI, and FDI restrictions still exist in media, transportation, and business services and the acquisition of real estate also bares restrictions\(^21\).

Remaining restrictions on foreign ownership are laid down in legislation regulating specific activities. Under recent liberalization in the area of broadcasting, the limitation on foreign equity participation in a media service provider was raised from 25 to 50 percent in March 2011. However, other restrictions, such as the requirement that foreign equity participation may not exceed 49 percent in aviation and in maritime services provided under concession agreements, and that foreigners may not obtain a fishing licence in Turkey. Special permission under specific laws is required to provide accounting, auditing, and bookkeeping services; for the establishment of private

\(^21\) Loc. Cit. Hiziroğlu, A. et al.
employment offices; and for investments in the financial sector, petroleum, mining, electricity, and education services. Acquisition of real estate by foreigners remains restricted, or subject to reciprocity provisions. In accordance with the Land Registry Law No. 2644, foreigners purchasing land plots between 2.5 and 30 hectares need permission from the Council of Ministers. Foreigners may not purchase land exceeding 30 hectares.22

Conclusion:

Concluding arguments behind the rationale for concluding an economic integration agreement (Free Trade Agreement) on services with Turkey

In the recent literature on international political economy, non-anti-WTO or non-anti-globalisation writers have amply stressed the positive role that trade agreements play in the context of services. In general a services trade agreement might have multiple advantages, including the following:

First, such an agreements bind current level of liberalization of trade regime in services in both contracting parties (this would bind adopted reforms). The advantage of this would be that the agreement collaborates in the liberalization process if vested national interests oppose liberalization and block initiatives to open access or prevent the establishment of an appropriate regulatory framework.

Second, trade agreements create a more stable framework for trade because they are international contracts that may not be changed unilaterally. Therefore, they may also create a path for introducing reforms in a gradual manner and provide rules that cannot be arbitrarily modified. A services trade agreement may create new market access opportunities; service providers can access foreign markets more easily and with lower costs. In cases where the other party’s trade regime is already liberal, the advantage of the agreement

is that it guarantees that the liberal trade regime will be maintained in the future.

The agreement may enhance transparency, predictability of trade policy regime in both contracting parties. The agreement may stimulate domestic service suppliers to increase competitiveness in order to be better competitive in comparison with service suppliers from the other contracting party (cost reduction, modernization of facilities, improvement of services, bigger choice of services, cheaper, more competitive services).

By stimulating import competition, the agreement may contribute to: increasing the number of service providers, increasing the choices for customers; lowering the prices of services in the market; increasing the quality of services provided (citizens and companies can profit from this).

When combined with effective national competition policy and law, the agreement may contribute to reducing the power of national monopolies, oligopolies when misusing their dominant position on the market (leads to lower prices, introduction of new services - e.g. in telecom, banking, transport).

The agreement may provide articles on mutual recognition of professional qualifications (architects, engineers, doctors, etc.) thereby easing market access for professionals.

Finally, trade agreements provide political support for the liberalization of the trade in services because they ensure reciprocal market liberalization.

When it comes to the particular agreement with Turkey, there are a number of arguments that might create a rationale for it:

- First, the shared history and the traditional cultural ties between the two countries, as well as the some 20 thousand Kosovo citizens of Turkish origin, can all be seen as facilitators of future enhanced services trade.
- By providing contractual guarantees to Turkey that trading conditions in Kosovo will not only remain as liberal as they are but all remaining restrictions will be removed, Kosovo might attract more advanced services and service providers from Turkey which, in certain
sectors, could contribute to the development of more efficient Kosovar service industry. However, such effect cannot be expected in infrastructural services, consumer services or services provided through Mode 1 in general, to list of few exceptions. In order for such impact to happen, Turkish providers should have a long-term commitment in the Kosovo market, i.e. established through FDI, should use advanced technologies and production methods, must employ and train local professionals.

- Third, in principle Turkey might be a good choice for Kosovo’s service providers seeking access to a big and geographically close export market. Whether or not this is a realistic choice at present depends on the particular comparative advantage of the potential exporter. Whilst one cannot exclude that in some particular service sub-sectors Kosovo might enjoy a comparative export advantage over their Turkey, the potential scope is so limited that this does not warrant for concluding an FTA.

- Finally, irrespective of considerations based on comparative advantages, one might consider that getting Turkey remove its remaining restrictions to trade in services under a bilateral FTA might be a good idea because that would guarantee unlimited market access for Kosovo service providers and investors which they could use once they feel strong enough to venture in the Turkish market.
References


http://www.refworld.org/docid/43956b6d4.html


Bullying Among the 5th Grade Students in Primary School and Preventive Measures

Armen Mustafa *
Gazmend Tahiraj**

Abstract

The purpose of this study was to study the prevalence phenomenon of bullying among the 5th grade students of primary school, and the use of measures for its prevention.

Research was conducted in two stages. The aim of the first stage was to understand the extent of bullying in these classes, identifying bully students and students, victims of bullying. For data collecting in this phase, were used teachers’ interviews and students’ questionnaires. The aim of second phase was the application of preventive measures, based on the Olweus program for the prevention of bullying in schools. Implementation of preventive measures was conducted at individual and class level.

The Results of the first phase showed that bullying is widespread among students in these classes. Teachers and students were able to identify bullying students, respectively, students who are potential victims of bullying. The Results of the preventive measures showed teachers and students greater awareness, more frequent reports of bullying cases, activation of considered "neutral" students and the most frequent responses of students who were considered victims of bullying.

Keywords: Bullying, bullies, student victims of bullying, Olweus program.

* Armen Mustafa, PhD Cand, AAB University, Prishtinë, Email: armenmustafa@gmail.com;
** Gazmend Tahiraj, MA in Inclusive Education, Executive Director in KAPIE, Email: gazmendtahiraj@yahoo.com
Introduction

Bullying means when a student (or students) consistently and repeatedly is subjected to negative actions by one or more students who are physically more powerful. These negative actions intend to cause injuries, in physical and psychological aspect\(^1\) too. It can be said that bullying as a problem has co-existed with the school and the students, but the interests and scientific researches on this phenomenon have begun in the 70\(^{th}\) by Dan Olweus, to be intensified in the 80’s and especially in the 90’s, the years when shots and multiple murders would occur through various American schools, but also others that would be caused by students or even persons, who through various stages of their education, have been victims of bullying by their peers, their brothers or sisters, or even the victim of any form of domestic violence.

In one of the first studies carried out on bullying at school, and conducted by a questionnaire in 1980, with 150,000 Scandinavian students, turned out that approximately 15 % of students aged 8-16 are involved in the bullying problem in school.\(^2\) In another similar study, conducted in 2001 with 5,171 students from 37 schools, carried out by the same author and with the same questionnaire, significant changes were observed. Number of students who had trouble with bullying was increased, and approximately 30 % of students were involved in the problems of bullying, either as bullies or as a victim of bullying or both bully-victim\(^3\) roles. The two studies showed that boys are more frequently molesters compared with girls. However, bullying is present within girls, especially in verbal (call names, distribution of rumours, etc.) and social form (exclusion from the group), in contrast to boys who dominate the physical forms of

\(^1\) Dan Olweus, *Bullying at school: What we know, and what we can do*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 1993, p 16


\(^3\) Ibid
bullying. A better understanding of this phenomenon by researchers will affect them to develop more programs for prevention and intervention against bullying in schools.

Despite the interest and attention paid to bullying in the world, this cannot be said for Kosovo, where until recent years the phenomenon was almost entirely ignored.

The lack of phenomenon research in Kosovo does not mean that the phenomenon does not appear in our schools. However, there is an opinion that the bullying phenomenon is widespread in our schools and educational institution, too. This comes based on reports that show rising violence in schools.4

Based on the fact, the main purpose of the study was to study the phenomenon of the bullying prevalence with the fifth grade students of Primary school (Primary school "Hilmi Rakovica" - Pristina), and intervention through effective strategies for preventing and reducing this phenomenon.

Methodology

The study is based on the use of mixed methodology, qualitative and quantitative. The sample selection for this purpose was made by the target technique, in accordance with the aim of the study. The sample consisted of three 5th grade classes and their teachers, from an elementary 9 - year-school from Prishtina. The environment in which the school was located was a mixed environment with new arrivals from various parts of Kosovo, which was known as a problematic environment, including problems based on violence.5

The study was conducted in two phases. The first phase purpose was to answer the question of whether bullying is widespread among students in these classes? Then, who were the students who were known for frequent behaviour characteristic for bullying? And who

4 UNICEF. Hulumtim mbi Dhunën ndaj Fëmijëve në Shkollat e Kosovës. Prishtinë: 2005, p. 45
were those students who were the most frequent victims against whom bullying was posed? Interviews with teachers and student questionnaires were used for collecting data at this stage. This made it possible to compare the data, in connection with prevalence, but also to identify bully students as well as victims of bullying.

For this, teachers were initially interviewed, where through the interviews, basic information was taken about the situation in terms of bullying that exists in these classes, or what they think about bullying, is the bullying present and what is prevalence of it in their classes? Also, it was required for each class to identify three students who these classes think are the most frequent bullies, moreover, to identify the three students in each class who were known as the most frequent victims of bullying. Through the questionnaires specially prepared for this purpose, the information was also collected from the students on what they really think about this phenomenon, about the prevalence of bullying in their classes, and who are three students they identify as the most bullies, and three students who were the most frequent victims of bullying.

Whereas, the second phase was based on the results of the first phase, where, according to results and based on the Olweus program is build an intervention program to prevent and reduce bullying, the purpose of the implementation program of these classes was prevention and reduction of bullying.6 The intervention program was modified and adapted by certain measures provided in two levels, class level and at the individual level. Classroom measures level included:

- Establish classroom rules for bullying
- Regular class meetings
- Role plays on bullying topic

Whereas, in the individual measures included

- Individual meetings (conversations) with bully students
- Individual meetings (conversations) with students who are bullying victims.

---

After completing the intervention roundtable discussions were conducted with students and teachers, in order to see the results of the intervention and impact that has had on students and teachers.

**Results of the first phase – Baseline**

Conducted interviews with teachers, noted that there is bullying among students in their classes. Obviously they were able to identify the bully students, identifying each of them three bullies being more active in the phenomenon. Also, each of the teachers identified three students who they think that they are most often victims of bullying and assaults of other students. One important fact that might be seen from interviews with teachers is the fact that they identify as victims of bullying the students who are known as the students who have learning difficulties, then student suffering from any disease, with difficulties in speaking, etc., which is a characteristic for bullying.

Agim is a child who has difficulties in pronunciation of some words. He is frail and does not do well in school. Often he becomes the object of ridicule of other students, especially of a group who behave as they are the most important in the classroom. (Teacher, class V2)

The fact shows that teachers have understood students who can be the victims of bullying among students, or who are at risk of being bullied, but also teachers realised those who bully others. If we look in gender terms, the data collected from teachers indicate that the prevalence is more present in boys than in girls (at least it is more visible).

Approximately the similar information gave us the students through 98 completed questionnaires. The characteristic is that the majority of students (over 80), on the question of whether there is bullying in their class, the answer was yes. Also, students were able to identify students with bullying behavior towards others and the most frequent victims of bullying. In addition, data from the questionnaire evidenced a phenomenon, which often happens that bully students also often can be as a victim of bullying. The group of students was in
the middle of the nomination for bulling behaviours, and bullying victims as well.

However, what was significant, is the fact that the results obtained by students through questionnaires, were harmonized with those obtained from the teachers for both, bullying prevalence and identifying students as a bully and victims of bullying, including their gender.

**Phase Two: Intervention**

After analysing the results of the first phase and designing the intervention program, the first step of the intervention was to establish classroom rules against bullying. According to the program, the rules have to be created and put together by students, through debates and discussions that will take place in the classroom. This is important because rules created by students will be clearer and in an understandable language for children, in particular, it will make students feel they have made the rules themselves and that they have a responsibility to stick to those. In addition, students should discuss the sanctions that will be used on someone who breaks rules. Sanctions should not affect the dignity of the student or the regular curriculum. It should be more like something that deprives the student of any privilege that he has in the classroom.

Before starting the discussion about rules, students were initially informed about the situation of the prevalence of bullying in their classrooms based on the results of questionnaires and what might be done to improve the situation. This was also a warning and awareness about bullies that bullying will not be tolerated, but also as an encouragement for students who were bullying targets that someone cares about them.

As a starting point for drafting the rules against bullying, three main rules have been taken against bullying from Olweus program\(^7\)

1. **Should not bully others**

---

\(^7\) Dan Olweus, *Bullying at school: What we know, and what we can do*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 1993, p. 82
2. Should help students who are bullied
3. Should try to include them in the group, students who are excluded from the group

Through them it is intended to include both forms of bullying, direct and indirect, like being forms of isolation and exclusion from the group. The drafts of the rules are created through discussions with students, and then from the cluster of rules, are chosen the best rules. The rules were more direct, better in the sense of simplicity and might be easily identified, so students may easier identify each bullying act that goes against the rules. Some of the rules that were created in one of the three classes were:

- Should not bully each other;
- Should not insult each other;
- Should not humiliate each other;
- Should not mock each other;
- Should not make friend as the toy;
- Should not be beaten at school or on the way home;
- Need to help students who are bullied;
- Every case of violence between students should be reported;
- A student who breaks these rules will be punished...

The rules did not differ much from class to class. They were written by students in a large sheet and put in a place visible to all students. The aim was the students have something written at any moment that will remind them to stop acting like that, whenever they are in such a situation.

However, with the creation and deployment of rules does not end the work. They constantly monitored and discussed how the students were obeying them. This was done through regular class meetings and through program implementation. During the discussions, are given proposals for sanctions to those students who have broken the rules, and on the other hand, praise for students who have contributed to the prevention of bullying.

The next step, according to the program was the role play by students through a skit. For this measure, teachers together with some students prepared a skit containing a bullying situation in the classroom. And these sketches were played to the scene of the class in
the front the other students. The purpose of these sketches has been to encourage feelings and open discussions of students how they feel in situations like those where students are in the role of bullies, the victim, or even like passive observers of that situation.

After the role play there was a discussion with students about what they have seen. First, from the students who have played sketches requested to show how they felt in their roles and second commenting and discussing with other students, how they would have felt if they had been in such situations of real bullying and what can be done to prevent that situation. This discussion has served to increase students’ awareness that violence between them is a bad thing and intolerable.

The individual intervention with students who are identified as violent is concentrated within individual conversations. The purpose of the conversations was to understand the causes which affect their behaviour and also to impact into behaviour changes. Also, such conversations are conducted at the individual level with students who are the victims, respectively, to those who are the target of attacks by other students. The purpose of these meetings was to support and strengthen them in case they encounter bullies, or at least to report cases if they are bullied and attacked by other students.

Role-playing and discussion about it was the end of intervention that was based on the program developed by Olweus. However, compliance monitoring of the rules and discussing about them as well as conversations with students who are identified as users and victims of bullying should be done consistently.

**Results of Intervention**

When we talk about the intervention results we can also talk about two kinds of results. Talking about the impact of the intervention in reducing the level of bullying among students and how teachers who have been implementing the intervention program have benefited.

If we talk about the intervention results in reducing bullying level among students, we cannot talk in figures, because there has been no direct measurement with any questionnaire or something else.
However, during the discussions and conversations with students and teachers, are extracted some interesting information, showing the impact that intervention has had.

During the discussion done in class, when teachers have established classroom rules, a student (class V1) said:

We have no rules in the classroom. When someone bullies one of our friends, I do not know how to help him.

Whereas, another student (class V3) says:

Well now, let anyone dare to bully Agim, I will immediately inform the teacher and will punish the person who bullies Agim.

Similar discussions, but clearer, which expressing students’ willingness to take any action to prevent bullying, are seen especially in the debates after the role-play. So, there was a sketch in one of the classrooms about mediation by a "neutral" student in the bullying situation, a student (class V3) has pointed out as follows:

One day, after we finished school, two friends from our classroom Xeni and Petrit have gotten in Besi’s way. One of them had grabbed his bag and the other one had grabbed his hands and didn’t let him go. They shouted and swore at Besi, who kept his head down and did not speak at all. I was scared and just passed quickly, running away home not telling anyone about this. If I see them again, I will go back to school and tell the teacher either at once or tomorrow, when I come to school.

Teachers confirmed that reports of bullying cases were increased. Two of the three teachers, think that after intervening positively in class the situation has changed, whereas one of the teachers is more sceptical. She sees the situation improved more in terms of awareness, but not in reducing the bullying and she is based on the fact that students now report cases more often than before. This is proven by two other teachers, but the fact they link with greater awareness of students about bullying and awareness of respecting the rules in the classroom. According to them, students now speak more openly about such problems, being able to know who is breaking the rules and when they are broken. Furthermore, they speak about situations when "neutral" students protect students who are physically weaker, and
who are attacked by other students. As regards this, one of the teachers says:

Two students from my class one day have grabbed the pen of another student and didn’t let him complete the tasks that he hadn’t finished yet. Seeing this situation another student together with his mate, gave the student his pencil. Then one of them sits on the bank with bully victim and another goes to the table, not letting them to clear the table.

Besides the impact that intervention has had to the students, it has also contributed to the teachers as well. In connection with this, three teachers accepted, they have benefited new knowledge regarding the phenomenon of bullying, moreover, they neither heard about the phenomenon before, nor have been trained for it.

In the beginning, when we started to talk about bullying, I had no idea about bullying term, but from discussions here and especially from searching in internet I realized what we have to do, and the consequences it has for the students. I often recall such situations when I was a student, but also situations when my students behave in that way (Teacher of class V1).

Also, teachers emphasized they are now equipped with the skills and tools for the future to deal with bullying. They further point out that this was a new and very good experience for them that will help a lot in their work in the future.

When the students have complained that another student is bullying them, or similar things what I’ve done reprimands the student on the spot, but nothing more. Now I understand that the problem is very deep and for this matter more should be done every day. I think that I will proceed further with such an intervention (teacher, class V3).

Discussion with conclusions

The results of this study show the phenomenon of bullying is present among the students of three classes of fifth grade. Teachers and students have proven this. In addition, they are also able to identify
students who are characterized with bullying behaviour toward other students, as well as students who were the most frequent target of attacks by other students called the victims of bullying. The significant fact is that teachers and students had identified almost the same students who behave as a bully were also bullied victims, who shows that both sides were aware about the phenomenon present among them, but till then nobody cared about it.

Another conclusion that came out of this study was the impact that intervention program had on both sides. The first noticeable impact might be seen on the awareness of both sides, on the consequences and the need to prevent such phenomenon. There were more frequent reporting cases by students, activation of neutral students in such situations, either through reporting or through direct responses, and teachers’ consistency to deal with the phenomenon.

Besides positive results, as any other study, the study had its limitations. The first limitation is the scope of the study in only three classes. So, the results are not representative and have lack of comparison with an inclusive school program, in which will be engaged everyone.

Another limitation was the short intervention period. The intervening period of study lasted 3 months and somehow has limited result of the intervention. The results would be much more reliable and more valid when the intervention would last at least one school year and will include the whole school. However, the study and its results can serve as awareness for teachers and other professionals in the field, there is an immediate need to begin to think and deal with a phenomenon such as bullying, because failure to address it, would have a lot of consequences, not only for students but also for the whole society.
Recommendations

When we are talking about bullying, much more can be done with relatively simple tools, just a greater commitment is needed.\textsuperscript{8} The problem exists and preventive measures must be taken. According to this, is recommended;

- Teachers and stakeholders training for the purpose of awareness of bullying, its consequences and implementation of preventive measures in order to reduce bullying in schools;

- Provide funds and investing in various interventions’ program, which should be adapted to our culture, life conditions and circumstances, in order to prevent bullying in schools. These programs should have whole school approaches;

- Creating a multi-professional teams in schools, including psychologists, social workers, teachers and other professionals. These teams would help all stakeholders in schools, including students, teachers, parents and others.

Bibliography


\textsuperscript{8} Dan Olweus, \textit{Bullying at school: What we know, and what we can do}. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 1993, p. 86
http://reclaimingjournal.com/sites/default/files/journal-article-pdfs/05_1_Olweus.pdf


Architecture as Political Expression/ the Expression of national identity in embassy buildings; Berlin experience

Teuta Jashari-Kajtazi*

Abstract
We should never leave behind the fact that after the “Wall” went down in Berlin, it became a location with various judgments and possibilities in the sphere of design and architecture, especially in the architecture of diplomacy which had and still has a chance to clearly symbolize the particular nation. What could be noticed in this particular work is the fact of a group of nations being able to adapt to openness and contemporary concepts, concretely, what the world/earth needs for the moment and the way others try to show their power by building fortresses (this might not even be considered power, but the way to be protected from others). It seems to be unfortunate that architecture will always be in the dilemma of what can be done and what should be done.

As a result, the analysis of the study object shows the representation of a State, Country or Region in an architectural context, however, it can be noticed that they all go in different directions or better say, try to express different understanding of how should they be represented in this particular environment and what is for them (the Nation) of a greater importance.

Keywords: contemporary fortifications, openness to the public, unconventional building, deconstructive architecture, representation of the region, identity crisis, collective identity, care for the environment.

* Teuta Jashari-Kajtazi, PhD Cand., AAB University, e-mail: teuta.jashari-kajtazi@aab-edu.net
Introduction

The Architecture of Embassy buildings is or should definitely be the architecture that pronounces a nation’s identity to the world and should not in any way be misunderstood. On the other side this raises the issue if embassies are to be fortresses, cultural landmarks or simply offices.

In this context, it should be very important to have in mind the fact that these structures should be significant in both cases, considered as symbols on one side and functional for people who work in them, on the other one.

A part of the design is to understand the background showing the respect for the culture representing the particular nation never leaving behind the local building tradition, cooperation with local culture and architecture. At their best, Embassies should set the tone for smooth engagement of two cultures.

Architecture like every other art serves to express and keep world’s development in motion, taking care of the identity of the structure to be built.

Identity as an issue has various approaches, but it is very important to try and find it in architecture and its structures as well. Identity in general could be defined as: individuality and something that distinguishes a person, a building or an object, having a “detail” as a fragment. When all these details are put together, compositions are created thus easily identifying somebody or something.

Identified structures within this particular analysis have their own characteristics; they represent the identity of each nation in this contemporary world, each of them every day leads more towards globalization¹. There are great possibilities that very soon diplomatic buildings might remain the only possibility were nations will have to represent themselves though architecture and design.

Even though identity as a notion fits into different spheres, from my point of view within this type of architecture (diplomacy) and with this analysis in particular the following “identities” will be in focus: national identity, collective identity and a kind of regional identity, if it can be called so, will be present as well.

In order to find a balance of what Embassy buildings should represent, the following words stated by Jonathan Glancey\textsuperscript{2} a known author/ columnist in the field of architecture and design, taken from an article by the Guardian on architectural diplomacy, he says:

“An embassy building is an ambassador for the country it represents. Ideally, it should be gracious, well mannered and welcoming. It should offer something of the culture of its home country while nodding appreciatively to that of its host. It does not need either to be old-fashioned, nor should it attempt to be "cool". Passing fads are just that".\textsuperscript{3}

Berlin (Fig. 1), known as a divided city during a certain period of time and the capital of a re-united country since 1990, went through an “additional layer” of design and construction. Playing the role of the “capital city”, it has strongly shaped the city’s recent development, the new government and the embassy district with the federal government buildings, new and refurbished embassy buildings, and the representative buildings of the federal states, institutions and organizations. It can easily be said that this is the city of social and architectural experimentation, especially after the “Wall” came down.

\textsuperscript{2} Jonathan Glancey is architecture and design editor of the Guardian. He is the Author of few books, such as: New British Architecture (1988) and New Moderns (1994) and he as well appears regularly on national television and radio.

A vast number of new embassy buildings and other representative buildings have been added to Berlin's urban contest in recent years, a kind of competition within contemporary architecture with its many different personal styles and identities. New Embassy buildings display a various range of styles, in particular regional elements of style and building materials play a strong role in their architecture.

**Analysis/Study objects**

Through this study or analysis, there are four formulated issues/questions to deal with, related to the diversity in some approaches (different from one another) for the same task, which is the design and construction of the Embassy in Berlin, involving a certain kind of identity:
- The identity crisis through the United States Embassy Building,
- Collective identity through the Dutch Embassy building,
- The identity representing a region (so called regional identity) through complex Nordic Embassies, and
- Caring for the environment (both natural and human) through the Canadian Embassy building.
United States Embassy

After going through the so-called identity crisis of overseas American Embassies, in which the security case shaped almost every aspect of their architecture, the US Embassy building in Berlin continued with the same tradition, trying to show “Washington’s power”\(^4\) (Fig. 2) on the site of a former Berlin Wall. After the scaffolding was removed from the façade, there were elements presented for a strong architectural debate. One of the reasons was, getting back in time according to the prolonged and upsetting negotiations Berliners had over the shield or safeguard zone and traffic circulation (Fig. 3).

The building, designed by the Californian firm, Moore Ruble Yudell (won in 1996) got complicated, especially after a number of attacks on overseas US Embassies and by the decision of the

\(^4\) Power; in the sense of exercising global economic, political and military influence.
government to strengthen the security rules\textsuperscript{5}. In order to meet all aspects: the architectural site, security and program requirements (Fig. 4), architects had to work closely not only with the State Department but with the Spatial Planning authorities of Berlin, as well. The new building closes the last frontage on the historic Pariser Platz\textsuperscript{6}, with its exterior stone walls, regular window’s grid and larger sculptural forms on each side of it. The entrance itself looks light and glassy (Fig. 5) Compared to the rest of the building, trying to welcome visitors. While inside the pavilion, the courtyard looks like a formal garden (Fig. 6) and further on a vestibule with works of art by the American artist Sol Lewitt\textsuperscript{7} (Fig. 7), could be evident.


\textsuperscript{7} Sol LeWitt was an American artist, both conceptualist and minimalist, who became famous in 1960s with his wall drawings and sculptures (he used to call them structures). His work of art in this case can be considered as monumental outdoor piece (without a title); http://www.sollewittprints.org/biography
After all, the intention of the winning architectural firm was to complement the architecture of the square, as well as to incorporate architectural and artistic elements that can transform it into “uniquely” American. There is a quotation from the Constitution inscribed on the stone walls of the entrance rotunda. The so called dome (in some cases it has been identified as the Lantern) on the top floor (Fig. 8) Which is not as expressive as the Reichstag Dome, but anyway, it is meant to be a symbol of the US Government's presence on foreign land.

---

8 America as a nation: future – oriented, proud of its artistic and technological achievements, as well identified with the openness of democracy. Before 1960s security was not even considered as a design constraint: glass – walled diplomacy buildings, sidewalk access to libraries and exhibition areas (in Rome, Prague, Paris).
Even though the design and the completion process went through different debates and arguments, the US Ambassador Coats tried to finalize the entire process with the welcoming words;

“An embassy is a symbol of a nation's foreign presence, identity, and diplomatic intentions. It is more than a collection of government offices. We want our embassies to send a message of openness and optimism, projecting the values of democracy and freedom that guide our diplomacy. We felt strongly that building on a more remote site would send the wrong message. We plan to construct a beautiful building here on Pariser Platz, which will be fitting with the architecture of this very historic place, but will also reflect America. I believe that the architects have been successful in giving the building expression to the ideals of "diversity," "openness," and "equality," while at the same time meeting all security concerns”. 9 (Fig. 9) (Fig. 10).

After all, like all other works of art and architecture do, this one as well gives a possibility for further comments, expressions, and analytical thoughts, especially having in mind that this structure is located in the area of the city which had a long history and because of that it will continue to be visited frequently.

From all the elements mentioned above, it is clear enough that the United States are definitely going through an identity crisis (meaning about their diplomatic representation in this particular case), as a result of a number of attacks on their embassy buildings around the world, representing themselves as contemporary fortifications in comparison to what they used to represent before (the openness of democracy). When stated before, it means the time before the 1960s, when these buildings were gathering places and civic centers.

Finally, it could be concluded that the US Embassy in Berlin is a building that struggled a lot until it reached its final shape, which managed to find a sort of balance or compromise between architecture and reinforced security measures, at the same time taking care of the
exiting environment close to the monument where Berlin is known about.

**The Dutch/Netherlands Embassy**

Differing from what the US Embassy achieved to look like or better say leave the impression behind, the Embassy building of the Netherlands shows openness, transparency and can easily be considered as noticeable. Since, the Netherlands had already sold its former Embassy building; the new location had to be found in the most suitable place along the river Spree\(^{10}\). The first impression that the site could give was the characteristic Dutch canal-side, ready to put a building along it (**Fig. 11**) (**Fig. 12**).  

\(^{10}\) In 1994 the new location was found, even though it was still unclear whether the Ownership does not have any disputes from the 2nd World War or even from the former DDR. However, at the end it resulted in using the site without problems.
It was designed by one of the most famous architects Rem Koolhaas (Office for Metropolitan Architecture/ OMA)\(^\text{11}\), who won the Berlin Architecture prize for this structure in 2003. It would be very interesting to mention that Koolhaas was exactly the one who disagreed with Berlin’s redevelopment plans, considering them very traditional, but on the other side awarded a project, having the chance to finally leave his mark in this city after almost ten years.

In this case the only element that shows in a certain way the Dutch identity is the location chosen for the building (already mentioned above), but on the other hand it shows more the identity of the architect himself, simply by the fact he finally showed to Berlin the real meaning of not being “traditional” what in fact he meant ten years before.

Being a fragment of deconstructive architecture, his design represents the free standing steel (Fig. 13) and glass cube with equal sides, reception courtyard with a distance on all sides from neighboring buildings, the distance that allows a panoramic view on the river. The building itself is a combination of cool exterior and warm interior details/ accents. The only problem this building issued (if it can be considered a problem) or argument related to it, comparing with the US Embassy building, was the “headache” for German construction companies hired for the project, since being so unconventional (Fig. 14). First, it was designed without interior doors, but being an embassy building and having its specifics, the doors had to be added, with a special design by Koolhaas. There were four hundred in total.

One very interesting detail that shows a tendency towards “deconstruction” during the design is the concept of a trajectory projected from the back of the Tower (through the cube) to the river, the main intention of which was the building to be as transparent as possible.

After its completion, being designed by one of the most famous architects, the building became so popular that the foyer of which became permanently open to visitors having at their disposal special tour guides explaining the most interesting architectural details (Fig. 15) and when put together, it clearly represented the identity of an architect/designing team (in this particular case Rem Koolhaas and OMA). This can be seen as a collective identity through which the architect/designer completes a part of his personal identity\(^\text{12}\). It is clear that the Netherlands wanted an autonomous, singular, and clearly understandable building with the possibility to become an event.\(^\text{13}\)


From this prospective, they managed to design a structure that shows transparency; not only in the sense of shape and its geometrical description, but also in the sense of manifesting modernity and openness which is supposed to characterize the Netherlands\textsuperscript{14}. This came out of the fact that until the end of the 20\textsuperscript{th} Century, the Netherlands did not really have a remarkable tradition in the design and construction of buildings abroad. Meanwhile, this represents the start of a totally new chapter on the recognition in the international scene and the contribution of Rem Koolhaas (OMA) to express this concernment as much as possible, pointing out in this way his personal architectural identity.

\textit{The complex of Nordic Countries Embassies}

Nordic Countries (Sweden, Denmark, Finland, Norway and Iceland) have decided to build their Embassies within one complex (Fig. 16).

\textsuperscript{14} Ibid., page.131.
They all have their own buildings except the common reception area and the information centre known as “Felleshuset” or “House for All” (Fig. 17). The design comes from the Austrian – Finish partnership of Alfred Berger and Tiina Parkkinen; and looking at the geometry of the complex from above, it looks like buildings have been carved from a single block. Another detail which gives a Scandinavian/ Nordic impression and water connection between these countries, is low pools touching on all five embassies (Fig. 18), while the unifying element of the entire complex is the characteristic wall as a copper strip made of louvers (Fig. 19).

It is important to mention that all materials used for construction, are typical of the Nordic region, also having in mind that the ideal bind for natural stone, wood and glass are stainless steel which is mainly used for joints, mounting and framing on different facades. This combination gives a very calm and friendly atmosphere in the entire complex.
From what is said above, it is clear that the main scope of the design is to express the Nordic spirit through both exterior and interior shapes as well as construction materials used. The so called “Bright and Light, Scandinavian style” (Fig. 20) is characterized by clear compositions, blue-green glass effect, exposed gray concrete, warm wood tones, shimmering stainless steel and interior plain and simple furniture and fittings. What in fact they try to show within this complex (expressed through architecture), are the environment and nature conservation as very important characteristics of the Nordic Countries.15

In this context the new Canadian Embassy (Fig. 21) designed by various architectural teams from Toronto, Quebec City and Winnipeg managed to show a growing interest in sustainable developments (the design that has a minor negative impact on the environment, ideally with no impact at all. It is strongly against the environmental degradation)\(^{16}\). Based on Berlin’s Planning regulations which intend to minimize energy costs and air pollution, designers came up with the idea of having a “green” roof. This area designed by one of the best Canadian landscape architects, Cornelia Oberlander, covers around 60% of the entire roof area decreasing in this way the urban

heat and absorbing the rainwater, and allowing it to condense slowly into the atmosphere.

In addition to the roof other energy saving features is integrated within the building, such as: interior design which maximizes the access to natural light and minimum use of artificial light, natural ventilation through the windows that open manually, light sensors that automatically switch artificial lights when a required natural light level is reached, etc. All these sustainable features are incorporated within the existing environment (Fig. 22).

What really shows Canada’s identity and its geography is the usage of a range of materials from different Canadian regions: Tyndall limestone from Manitoba used for the front façade while black granite and maple from Quebec as well as Eramosa marble from Ontario when they are put together create an impressive internal space. All materials and mechanical systems were chosen upon the criteria of life expectancy. The use of materials, particularly brought from the native country should be part of the identity representation in one hand and
the incorporation into the existing environment on the other, which is very much obvious in the case of Canada.

Another very important fact related to the new Canadian Embassy is the “Northwest passage” (Fig. 23) for pedestrians within the building, which allows not only clients, but other people as well to daily cross from the old east to the west part of Berlin and the opposite. This passage at the same time offers a “window” into Canada through the integrated works of art (based on themes of Canadian landscape and created from natural Canadian – built products) (Fig. 24).  

17 “The River as thread, the Canoe as needle”, the work of art designed by John McEwen, one of the leading Canadian artists. The Canoe has a map of major Canadian waterways engraved. http://www.canadainternational.gc.ca/germany-allemand/offices-bureaux/embassy_art_ambassade.aspx?lang=eng
The following welcoming words from the Canadian Ambassador Paul Dubois try to definitely give the maximum openness to the public:

“Our new office building houses a whole range of Government of Canada services for clients abroad, including consular and visa services. The new Embassy offers public areas with multimedia facilities presenting Canadians’ achievements in building a diverse society where business, science and technology and the arts can all thrive (Fig. 25) (Fig. 26). Kanada Haus is your house in the capital of the biggest country in the European Union. I invite you to click your way through its many features and themes of the Canada-Germany relationship and to visit us when you are next in Berlin”.

It is clear that Canadians more than every other nation, being part of this work, try to fit into the existing environment and culture as much as possible, by allowing primarily residents to get to know nation’s most important elements of identity, even during their daily functions while using the passage. Main details (works of art within the building) when compiled together clearly represent the nation oriented towards a sustainable environment and a friendly architecture also without neglecting the maximum respect for the local building tradition or better to say the design regulations.

---

Conclusion

As elaborated above, all these structures without any doubt represent a State, Country or Region in an architectural context, but it can clearly be noticed that they all go into various directions or better say they try to express different understanding of how should they be represented in this particular environment and what is for them (the Nation) of a greater importance. Four formulated issues / questions above resulted as the following:

- Identity crisis; which resulted in the use of elements of maximum security and the idea to create a kind of contemporary or present - day fortification or fortress
- Collective identity; almost a transparent structure that serves not only as the Embassy but also as a museum/ building to be guided through, just for the sake of this structure it has been designed by a famous architect/ team
The identity of a Region; complexes when looked from above, they try to symbolize the region on the map without leaving behind the most important materials and style used “back home”

Carefulness for the Environment; the most important element of our era is the so called sustainable design and ecological architecture, the design for maximum energy saving always takes care of the existing environment (natural and humans)

Bibliography:


Internet Sources:

http://germany.usembassy.gov/germany/sp20040506.html (visited on 03/05/2009)
http://www.sollewittprints.org/biography (visited on 10/05/2009)

Figures/Photos Courtesy:

(Fig. 1) – Axel Mauruszat
(Fig. 2-3-4-5-6-7-8-9-10) – Moore Ruble Yudell Architects with Gruen Associates (Fig. 11-12-13-14-15) - //en.wikiarquitectura.com
(Fig. 16-17-18-20) - Berger + Parkkinen architekten: //arcspace.com
(Fig. 19) - Christian Richters: //arcspace.com
(Fig. 21-22-23-24) – fotodesignberlin: //international.gc.ca
(Fig. 25-26) - Viscusi, Stones & Projects Ltd., Berlin: //international.gc.ca
Technical Instructions for authors

1. **THESIS** is a Kosovarian journal with international characteristics which is edited by the AAB University in Prishtina. It is a periodic scientific and explorative journal where you can find most of all topics out of society and human science.

2. Its editorial office which consist of national and international experts, will accept materials in Albanian and English version. The editorial board serves its right to revise the materials and to correct them if necessary.

3. The articles can consist of 12-15 pages, written just on one page. There should be a margin of 3-4 cm on the left page. Original photos, drawings and tables are welcome as well as CD’s containing the content of the text together with the references of the used program.

4. Each work must contain the title eventually the subtitle, the name of the author, the academic title, the name of the institution where he or she is working, the personal address and the email address. The editorial office classifies the works and articles in its certain categories as follows:

   - **Original science studies**: contain results which are still unknown. The editorial office reserves the right to evaluate them. The authors pledge not to publish their materials in another journal or magazine.
   
   - **Educational articles**: are treated as original works out of different fields of research. Also called reviews and criticism of texts which belong to special disciplines.
   
   - **Compositions and materials**: these are also considered as original workings.
   
   - **Professional works**: are results of research and of work on special issues. They will be also evaluated by competent readers and cannot be published elsewhere.
     
   - **Compositions**: contain short scientific results of researches or essential information out of meetings or scientific publications. Contributions like which are not allowed to exceed the length of 5 pages.
   
   - Research educative works: are treated as special works.
   
   - **Comments**: actual topics of special disciplines. They cannot exceed the length of 2 pages.
5. **The articles should contain at the beginning an abstract and at the end a synthesis or conclusion.**

The abstract at the beginning introduces the basis idea of the contribution. The author writes it in the third-person by not using impersonal verbs just in special cases. The words should not be too long. It is necessary to use exact scientific terms and avoid unknown abbreviations. One should keep to the basis information and should avoid conclusions which do not exist in the text. The authors are obliged to explain and specify the key words (at the end of the abstract) otherwise the editorial office cares about it.

The synthesis should be short and should not contain explaining comments unlike the introduction. In the synthesis are explained the methods and results of the researches as well as the detected reasons. The sources of the publications are just mentioned if it is of high importance for the publication. The working techniques are mentioned in short form only if they differ from those already known. If in the article is not described the experimental or practical work then it is necessary to mention the source of information. The results and conclusions can be repeated. Just the conclusions or reached inventions must be reported as information in summary form.

6. **The text should be structured in the following chapters:**

1. The abstract.
2. The key words.
3. The introduction.
4. The review of the published works from the respective fields.
5. The materials and methodology.
6. The conclusions.
7. The comments or discussions of the results.
8. Conclusions.
9. Gratitude (if necessary).
10. Annex (if necessary).
11. The bibliography and sources.
The Style of University of Chicago

Whereas Thesis Kosova has the authorial right to place its sources and document the articles it publishes, the editorial office has decided to adopt a general method of its publications. It has chosen the method of documentation according to the so called; the university style of Chicago, where the notes are placed at the end of the page just because of the practical way to read them. Although this style of documentation is well known, the editorial office took the right to name some of the rules as follows:

The notes are followed by numbers throughout the chapter. A note number should be placed at the end of a sentence or at the end of a clause. The number follows any punctuation mark except for the dash, which it precedes. It follows a closing parenthesis. These notes are separated from the text by a long dash from the left side of the page and are as long as the alignment of the respective page. But the notes are separated from the text by a double space. Where only a handful of footnotes appear in the entire article or, perhaps, just one in an article, symbols may be used instead of numbers. Usually an asterisk is enough. In case when a text is cited for the first time, the author has to indicate all needed information in order to locate easily the cited text. The notes must contain the following information:

- The name of the author, initials of the second name (if existing), last name followed by a comma;
- The title of the book, underlined or in italic letters;
- The place and date of the publication, separated by commas and closed in brackets and followed by a comma;
- The number of the tome (written in Roman numbers) followed by a comma;
- The numbers of the pages, followed by a full stop.

The notes written at the end of the page, the titles of the published articles must be in italic letters, whereas those which are within the text must be in inverted commas. The titles of the manuscripts and the normative acts are not written in italic letters or in inverted commas. At the end of each note is posted a full stop. The information concerning the publication, stated at the end of the page, must contain the place and date of the publication but unlike the bibliography, it is not necessary to name the publishing house. In case of reviewed
publication, its date should be indicated. In case of translated books, the name of the translator must be stated after the title. The number of the pages, the author refers to must be indicated. If the place of the publication is unknown then just the country can be stated. If there is more than one author then both names must be written (like in the book). If there are more than two authors then just the name of the first author must be indicated. The secondary citations of the sources are stated by writing all facts of the first source and by indicating that they are secondary if you cannot refer to the first source. All these notes are written at the end when the source is mentioned for the first time.

This information must be listed as follows:

- The name of the author, initials of the second name (if existing), last name followed by a comma;
- The place and date of the publication, separated by commas and closed in brackets and followed by a comma;
- The number of the tome (written in Roman numbers) followed by a comma;
- The numbers of the pages, followed by a full stop.

According to the university style of Chicago, for all references which are already mentioned within the chapter, the following abbreviations are used:

**The abbreviation ibid.** (from ibidem, “in the same place”) refers to a single work cited in the note immediately preceding. It must never be used if the preceding note contains more than one citation. If the entire reference including page numbers or other particulars, are identical the word ibid.is used alone.

**The abbreviation Op. cit.** (opere citato, “in the work cited”) is the term used if a single work is cited in the whole form. This term must contain the last name of the author and if there are two authors with the same last name then also the first name is need.

**The abbreviation loc. cit.** (loco citato, “in the place cited”), is also used instead of op.cit. when reference is made to a work previously cited and to the same page in that work. As such, loc. cit. is never followed by volume or page numbers.

All these abbreviations are written in big letters. All notes end with a full stop. They should be written precisely and proper. If the work is separated in chapters the notes begin with number one and are placed at the end of the page.
Bibliography

In a printed work, a bibliography is normally placed at the end, preceding the index. The bibliography can contain just the work considered as essential for author’s subject matter but also other relevant information. So its length is variable. A short bibliography lists all information in one chapter. A long bibliography includes texts, periodicals, public interviews, speeches, reports, sources out of internet etc.

The titles of the bibliography are listed alphabetically according to the name of the author

If there is no author mentioned, the bibliography is listed according to the first letter of the title. Titles in foreign languages beginning with “a”, “an”, “le”, “les”, “un”, are listed at the end and the first letter of the next word is using for the alphabetical register. A work without an author cannot be listed under the category “anonym”.

Titles of the bibliography must contain the following information:
- The last name of the author, name and initials of the second name(if existing), followed by a comma;
- The title of the work, followed by a full stop. Titles of many works are written in italic letters or are underlined whereas titles of works which are part of an analogy or collection are put in inverted commas.
- The number of publication, followed by a full stop.
- The name of the translator, compiler or editor, followed by a full stop.
- The place of publication, followed by a colon. If the city is unknown the country is stated. If more than one place is mentioned just one of them is stated.
- The name of the editor, followed by a comma.
- The year of publication, followed by a full stop. If the date of the publication is not stated at the page of the title but elsewhere, then it must be written in brackets; if there is no date at all then there must be stated an approximate date with the abbreviation c.(circa).
- The page containing the respective information can also be stated, followed by a full stop.

The sources out of the internet must be listed under another category: Internet sources e.g.
1. http://www.bbc.co.uk/albania/region
   (visited for last time 26.09.2008)

The time of the last visit of the cited page must be also indicated after the web address.